

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on CBS manuscript assessment

Held on 17 October 2017 (web meeting)

(Agreed on 17 October 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Michael Jeger (Chair)

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Giuseppe Stancanelli

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion: Request to provide a scientific opinion on the evaluation of a scientific paper reporting CBS fungi in Europe(EFSA-Q-2017-00540), comparison of locations reported in the paper with previous simulations model results (EFSA-Q-2017-00541)

The Working Group Chair reviewed the final version of the draft opinion on the evaluation of the scientific paper by Guarnaccia et al. (2017) (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00540), as well as on the report and discussion on how the findings by Guarnaccia et al. (2017) fit the predictions of the model simulations on the establishment of *P. citricarpa* in the EU (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00541).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

Not Applicable.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on CBS manuscript assessment

Held on 3 and 5 October 2017, web-meeting

(Agreed on 5 October 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
Trond Rafoss, Richard Baker
- **Hearing Experts:**
Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
ALPHA Unit: Giuseppe Stancanelli
- **Others:**
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion: Request to provide a scientific opinion on the evaluation of a scientific paper reporting CBS fungi in Europe (EFSA-Q-2017-00541)

The Working Group finalised the sections of the draft opinion on the second question of the mandate, reviewing how the geographical coordinates of the findings by Guarnaccia et al. (2017) would fit the predictions of the previous model simulations on the establishment of *P. citricarpa* in the EU (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00541).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting (web-meeting) will take place on 17 October 2017.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on CBS manuscript assessment

Held on 22 September 2017 (web meeting)

(Agreed on 22 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Michael Jeger (Chair)

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Giuseppe Stancanelli

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion: Request to provide a scientific opinion on the evaluation of a scientific paper reporting CBS fungi in Europe(EFSA-Q-2017-00540), comparison of locations reported in the paper with previous simulations model results (EFSA-Q-2017-00541)

The Working Group Chair reviewed the draft opinion on the evaluation of the scientific paper by Guarnaccia et al. (2017) (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00540), as well as the report and discussion on how the findings by Guarnaccia et al. (2017) fit the predictions of the model simulations on the establishment of *P. citricarpa* in the EU (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00541).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

The next meetings (web-meeting) will take place on 3-5 October 2017 and on 17 October 2017.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on CBS manuscript assessment

Held on 15 September 2017 (web meeting)

(Agreed on 15 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Michael Jeger (Chair), Richard Baker, Bart Fraaije, Trond Rafoss, Antonio Vincent, Jon West

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Giuseppe Stancanelli

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion: Request to provide a scientific opinion on the evaluation of a scientific paper reporting CBS fungi in Europe(EFSA-Q-2017-00540), comparison of locations reported in the paper with previous simulations model results (EFSA-Q-2017-00541)

The Working Group reviewed and discussed the draft opinion on the scientific paper by Guarnaccia et al. (2017), particularly the sections on methodology, results and discussion (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00540). In addition, the Working Group progressed on the report and discussion on how the findings by Guarnaccia et al. (2017) fit the predictions of the model simulations on the establishment of *P. citricarpa* in the EU (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00541).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting (web-meeting) will take place on 22 September 2017.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on CBS manuscript assessment

Held on 11 and 13 September 2017, web-meeting

(Agreed on 13 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
Trond Rafoss, Richard Baker
- **Hearing Experts:**
Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
ALPHA Unit: Giuseppe Stancanelli
- **Others:**
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion: Request to provide a scientific opinion on the evaluation of a scientific paper reporting CBS fungi in Europe (EFSA-Q-2017-00541)

The Working Group worked on the second question of the mandate, reviewing how the geographical coordinates of the findings by Guarnaccia et al. (2017) fit the predictions of the previous model simulations on the establishment of *P. citricarpa* in the EU (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00541). The model predictions considered in this comparison were those conducted by EFSA (EFSA 2008; EFSA PLH Panel, 2014 and 2016) and by Magarey et al., 2015. The geographical coordinates of the findings by Guarnaccia et al. (2017) were also compared with results by Paul et al. (2005).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting (web-meeting) will take place on 15 September 2017.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on CBS manuscript assessment

Held on 8 September 2017, web-meeting

(Agreed on 8 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Michael Jeger (Chair), Bart Fraaijes, Antonio Vicent, Jon West.

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Giuseppe Stancanelli

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Richard Baker and Trond Rafoss.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion: Request to provide a scientific opinion on the evaluation of a scientific paper reporting CBS fungi in Europe (EFSA-Q-2017-00540)

The Working Group reviewed the draft opinion regarding the evaluation of the scientific paper by Guarnaccia et al. (2017), particularly the sections on methodology, results and discussion (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00540).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting (web-meeting) will take place on 11 and 13 September 2017 and focus on the review of previous model simulations on the establishment of *P. citricarpa* in the EU (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00541).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on CBS manuscript assessment

Held on 9-11 August 2017, Rothamsted (UK)

(Agreed on 11 August 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Michael Jeger (Chair), Richard Baker, Trond Rafoss (by web), Antonio Vicent, Jon West

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Giuseppe Stancanelli

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion: Request to provide a scientific opinion on the evaluation of a scientific paper reporting CBS fungi in Europe(EFSA-Q-2017-00540), comparison of locations reported in the paper with previous simulations model results (EFSA-Q-2017-00541)

The Working Group discussed the terms of reference of this mandate. A scientific paper has recently been published on line (<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0166061617300234>) in the journal "Studies of Mycology" entitled "First report of *Phyllosticta citricarpa* and description of two new species, *P. paracapitalensis* and *P. paracitricarpa*, from citrus in Europe". This scientific paper described the finding of *Phyllosticta citricarpa* in leaf litter of backyard gardens in four locations in Italy, Malta and Portugal. EFSA has been requested, pursuant to Article 29 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002, to prepare an urgent evaluation of this scientific paper, i.e. before the end of September 2017. In particular, EFSA has been asked, in view of current scientific knowledge, to review the methodologies used in this paper, as well as the analysis of the results and the related discussion (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00540). In addition, EFSA has been requested to report and discuss how these findings fit the predictions of the model simulations on the establishment of *P. citricarpa* in the EU (EFSA Question EFSA-Q-2017-00541). The Working Group reviewed and discussed the scientific paper by Guarnaccia et al. (2017), particularly the sections on methodology, results and discussion.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting (web-meeting) will take place on 8 September 2017.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>