

Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 9<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

Physical meeting, 18 November 2019

EFSA, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 18/11/2019)<sup>1</sup>

#### Participants

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Hans-Hermann Thulke (HT, chair of the WG), Alan MacLeod (AML), Hugh Evans (HE)
- **EFSA:** Alice Delbianco (AD)

#### 1. Welcome

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Adoption of the minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting

The minutes were adopted without changes

#### 4. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA

---

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **5. Discussion on *Saperda tridentata* pest categorization**

The WG finalized the draft of the pest categorization after Panel's comments

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

# Minutes of the 8<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 07 November 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 18/11/2019)<sup>4</sup>**

### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Hans-Hermann Thulke (HT, chair of the WG), Alan MacLeod (AML), Hugh Evans (HE)
- **EFSA:** Andrea Maiorano (AM)

### **6. Welcome**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### **7. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### **8. Adoption of the minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting**

The minutes were adopted without changes

### **9. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>5</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>6</sup>, EFSA

---

<sup>4</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>5</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **10. Discussion on *Saperda tridentata* pest categorization**

The WG finalized the draft of the pest categorization for evaluation by the Panel Members.

The WG will meet again by web on 18 November 2019 in Parma to discuss the Panel's comments.

Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 10-23 October 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 07/11/2019)<sup>7</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Hans-Hermann Thulke (HT, chair of the WG), Alan MacLeod (AML), Hugh Evans (HE)
- **EFSA:** Andrea Maiorano (AM)

#### **11. Welcome**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **12. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **13. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>8</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>9</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

---

<sup>7</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>8</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>9</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

#### **14. Discussion on *Saperda tridentata* pest categorization**

The following points were discussed:

- The WG reviewed and discussed the Ulmus logs import data received from the Member States. Information were received from almost all the contacted countries, allowing an estimate of the imports since 2016.
- The WG reviewed and discussed the data about Ulmus sp distribution in the EU territory. Data availability is scarce. Considering that the only interceptions of *S. tridentata* were recorded in the port of Livorno (Italy), as a case study to be included in an annex of the pest categorization the WG is focused on Ulmus sp distribution in Northern Italy.
- The WG reviewed and discussed about the finalization of the pest categorization.

The WG will meet again by web on 7 November 2019.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

Physical meeting, 23-24 September 2019

EFSA, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 08/10/2019)<sup>10</sup>

#### Participants

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Hans-Hermann Thulke (HT, chair of the WG), Alan MacLeod (AML), Hugh Evans (HE)
- **EFSA:** Andrea Maiorano (AM)
- **EC (DG SANTE):** Panagiota Mylona (PM - by web)

#### 15. Welcome

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### 16. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 17. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>11</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>12</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified

---

<sup>10</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>11</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>12</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **18. Discussion on *Saperda tridentata* pest categorization**

The WG met in Parma, before the Panel Plenary meeting. The following points were addressed:

- The WG discussed and implemented Panel comments after first round of review
- The WG discussed and prepared the presentation to the Panel for the Plenary meeting. The presentation included an overview of the works done since the last Panel meeting and the final remarks of the WG on the pest categorization.
- The WG discussed by web with PM about the pest categorization in order to show the issues related to the lack of data and information and the final conclusion proposed by the WG to the Panel

The WG will meet again by web in October.



## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

web meeting, 12-13 September 2019

EFSA, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 23/09/2019)<sup>13</sup>

#### Participants

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Hans-Hermann Thulke (HT, chair of the WG), Alan MacLeod (AML), Hugh Evans (HE)
- **EFSA:** Andrea Maiorano (AM)

#### 1. Welcome

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>14</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>15</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

---

<sup>13</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>14</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>15</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

#### **4. Discussion on *Saperda tridentata* pest categorization**

The WG discussed about the pest categorization of *Saperda tridentata* (St). The points of the discussion included:

- Outcome of the literature review about the host range of *S. tridentata*.
- Outcome of the analysis on the *Saperda* genus host plasticity
- Discussion on the conclusions of the pest categorization
- Finalization of the pest categorization for the Panel feedback

The WG will meet again at EFSA in Parma, Italy, on 23-24 September.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

**web meeting, 8 July 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 26/07/2019)<sup>16</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Hans-Hermann Thulke (HT, chair of the WG), Alan MacLeod (AML), Hugh Evans (HE)
- **EFSA:** Andrea Maiorano (AM)

#### **1. Welcome**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>17</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>18</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

---

<sup>16</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>17</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>18</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

#### **4. Discussion on *Saperda tridentata* pest categorization**

The WG discussed about the pest categorization of *Saperda tridentata* (St). The points of the discussion included:

- information on pest biology and preferred hosts is confirmed to be very limited. The new North American experts contacted so far confirmed that this pest is not studied as it is not considered important or of relevant impact.
- A literature search is ongoing on databases including very old documents (scientific and policy documents) from the end of 1800. Some interesting info was found and is under evaluation
- Regarding the possibility of developing a PRA after the pest categorization, the WG agreed that the only option will be to adopt the Tier 1 described in the EFSA Guidance on quantitative pest risk assessment, as Tier 2 (i.e. complex modelling) will be not possible considering the very little information available
- The WG is analysing the plasticity of the genus *Saperda* in relation to the host range. This analysis will be useful to make assumptions and to assess the expected host range of *S .tridentata* and potential host shift if preferred hosts are not available

The WG will meet again in a web meeting on 12 September 2019.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

Physical meeting, 25 and 26 June 2019

EFSA, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 28/06/2019)<sup>19</sup>

#### Participants

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Hans-Hermann Thulke (HT, chair of the WG), Alan MacLeod (AML), Hugh Evans (HE)
- **Hearing experts (on 26 June 2019, from h9.30 to h10.30):** Bob Douma (BD), Christelle Robinet (CR)
- **EFSA:** Andrea Maiorano (AM)

#### 5. Welcome

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### 6. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 7. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>20</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>21</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified

---

<sup>19</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>20</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>21</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **8. Discussion on *Saperda tridentata* pest categorization**

The WG discussed about the pest categorization of *Saperda tridentata* (St). The points of the discussion included:

- information on pest biology and preferred hosts is very limited. The literature search, the North American experts contacted so far, the other considered risk assessment (from Norway and Sweden) have not allowed to find clear evidences or useful information to determine if the EU elm species are in the host range of this pest
- In general most of the information comes from very old literature mainly based on observations rather than experiments
- Some studies indicate that the EU elm species are not susceptible. However all of them are old observational and not experimental studies
- The pest is not considered of primary importance in US so it's not studied anymore
- All the above elements make the uncertainty regarding several biological parameters and regarding the evaluation on the impact on EU elm species very high
- Drafting of the pest categorization is ongoing
- Considering the lack of information and the very high uncertainty on many aspects related to this pest, the wg decided to keep contacting and consulting other North American experts, and to continue to search for useful literature/data/information regarding the pest
- The WG discussed with BD and CR about the potential application of a quantitative pathway model for the *S. tridentata* PRA.

The WG will meet again in a web meeting on 8 July 2019.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 3 and 14 June 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 24/06/2019)<sup>22</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Hans-Hermann Thulke (HT, chair of the WG), Alan MacLeod (AML), Hugh Evans (HE)
- **EFSA:** Andrea Maiorano (AM)

#### **1. Welcome**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>23</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>24</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

---

<sup>22</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>23</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>24</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

#### 4. Discussion on *Saperda tridentata* pest categorization

The WG discussed about the pest categorization of *Saperda tridentata* (St). The points of the discussion included:

- information on pest biology and preferred hosts is very limited. The WG agreed to look for and contact a Cerambycid expert in North America where St is a common elm-infesting Cerambycid
- other sources of information, including (e.g.) St or other Cerambycids pest risk assessment prepared by other institutions or organizations will be searched
- the use of a model for quantitative pathway analysis will be considered if enough data and information (or proxy for the specific case of St) will be available. The WG agreed to discuss in a dedicated meeting with the model developers about the characteristics of the model and data requirements
- a critical point for the evaluation of potential establishment is the availability of sensitive hosts in EU. Some observations from US seems to suggest that EU *Ulmus* sp. planted in US are not susceptible. However this information needs to be checked, re-discussed, and evaluated in the EU context. Also the presence of US species in the EU needs to be discussed.
- information on wood movements and exports from US to EU are generally related to classes of wood products and quantitative info on wood species is available on species different from *Ulmus* sp. WG agreed to look for expert in wood movement and exports from US.
- drafting of the pest categorization is ongoing and specific tasks for the WG members were discussed and a first draft will be finalized during the next WG meeting.

The WG will meet again in a physical meeting on 25 June 2019.



Scientific Panel on Plant Health

## Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 12 April 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 03/06/2019)**

### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Hans-Hermann Thulke (HHT, Chair)

- **EFSA**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM)

- **EC, DG-SANTE:**

Panagiota Mylona (PM)

### **5. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### **6. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### **7. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>25</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>26</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

---

<sup>25</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>26</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **8. Discussion on the Mandate on the Scientific Opinion on *Saperda tridentata***

The meeting was aimed at discussing and clarifying the terms of reference of the Mandate on *Saperda tridentata*.

The following points were discussed:

- This is a full risk assessment including: (i) pest categorization, (ii) entry, (iii) spread, (iv) establishment, risk reduction options (v)
- As far as Entry, the mandate asks explicitly to pay particular attention to wood of *Ulmus*. Anyway, PM stressed that the PRA should not be limited to wood of *Ulmus* but should consider all entry pathways.
- The focus should be on the pest (*S. tridentata*), not on particular pest/host combinations.

## **9. Next steps**

- Define calendar of meetings
- Contact potential wg experts