

Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the Preparatory meeting of the Working Group on *Spodoptera frugiperda*

**Held on 30-01-2018, Parma, IT  
(Agreed on 14-02-2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Alan MacLeod (chair)

Wopke van der Werf (member)

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:

Ciro Gardi

AMU Unit:

Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertsselection.pdf>.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Discussion on the pest risk assessment of *Spodoptera frugiperda* (EFSA-Q-2018-00068) for the EU territory.

The ToR was discussed and interpreted: key issues were identified.

The WG discussed the possible criteria for external experts to be included.

The available resources were listed:

- Pest categorization
- UK/CABI study on *Spodoptera frugiperda*
- Europhyt interceptions
- NL interceptions

The following aspects were discussed and agreed:

1. Time horizon: 5 years
2. Pathways:
  - a. Americas: (e.g. host vegetables)
  - b. Africa: (e.g. host vegetables)
  - c. Natural spread (from Africa)
3. Conceptual model was discussed

## 5. Next meeting(s)

Monthly meetings were planned from February to June 2018.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the First meeting of the Working Group on *Spodoptera frugiperda*

**Held on 14-16/02/2018, Parma, IT  
(Agreed on 20-02-2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Alan MacLeod (chair)

Wopke van der Werf (member)

- 

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Not Applicable

- 

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:

Ciro Gardi

AMU Unit:

Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertsselection.pdf>.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

**Discussion on the pest risk assessment of *Spodoptera frugiperda* (EFSA-Q-2018-00068) for the EU territory.**

The WG discussed and agreed on the following component of the PRA:

- Pathways
- Scenarios
- Overall conceptual model and the sub-models
- Parameters to be estimated/elicited

A list of tasks and sub-tasks was defined.

## 5. Next meeting(s)

Next meeting will be on 22 and 23rd March 2018.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the Second meeting of the Working Group on *Spodoptera frugiperda*

**Held on 22-23/03/2018, Parma, IT  
(Agreed on 23-03-2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Alan MacLeod (chair)

Wopke van der Werf (member)

- 

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Not Applicable

- 

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:

Ciro Gardi

AMU Unit:

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

**Discussion on the pest risk assessment of *Spodoptera frugiperda* (EFSA-Q-2018-00068) for the EU territory.**

The WG meeting started with the connection via web, with Regan Early. The following aspects were discussed:

- Methodology used for the climate suitability evaluation
- Results of the climate suitability assessment (map)
- Possibility and approaches to be used for aggregating data at NUTS2 level
- Combination with data on host crop densities

On the second day the WG discussed and agreed on:

- Pathways
- Scenarios
- Conceptual model and approaches for modeling the:
  - Entry via trade
  - Entry via natural spread
  - Establishment

The WG works at the Evidence dossier, as preparation of the expert elicitation to be carried out in the next meeting.

A list of tasks and sub-tasks were defined.

## 5. Next meeting(s)

Next meeting will be on 16, 17 and 18 April 2018.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the Third meeting of the Working Group on *Spodoptera frugiperda*

**Held on 16-18/04/2018, Parma, IT  
(Agreed on 18-04-2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Alan MacLeod (chair)  
Wopke van der Werf (member)  
Regan Early (member)  
Allan Hruska (member)

- 

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Not Applicable

- 

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:  
Ciro Gardi  
AMU Unit:  
Olaf Mosbach-Schultz

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

**Discussion on the pest risk assessment of *Spodoptera frugiperda* (EFSA-Q-2018-00068) for the EU territory.**

The WG meeting started with the discussion on the evidence dossiers prepared:

- Natural spread
- Sweet corn
- Sweet pepper
- Asparagus

In the afternoon of the first day Regan Early (physically) and Rodney Nagoshi (via web) joined the meeting, and the discussion focused on the establishment and on the natural spread.

For the natural spread it was agreed to go back for the fully mechanistic estimate of natural spread, and to postpone the elicitation of the parameters, after the preparation and collection of further evidences.

The second and the third day, after Allan Hruska joined the meeting, was dedicated to the elicitation of parameters for the three commodities pathways.

A list of tasks and sub-tasks were defined.

## 5. Next meeting(s)

Next meeting will be on 23, 24 and 25 May 2018 in Exeter.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the Fourth meeting of the Working Group on *Spodoptera frugiperda*

**Held on 23-25/05/2018, Exeter, UK  
(Agreed on 4-06-2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Alan MacLeod (chair)  
Wopke van der Werf (member)  
Regan Early (member)  
Rodney Nagoshi (member)

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:  
Ciro Gardi

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertsselection.pdf>.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

### **Discussion on the pest risk assessment of *Spodoptera frugiperda* (EFSA-Q-2018-00068) for the EU territory.**

The WG meeting started by recapping the project scope, aims and activities and the progress so far.

Trade pathways were elaborated with more detailed sub-steps being added. An evidence dossier for each pathway was reviewed and supplemented with additional information before an abbreviated expert knowledge elicitation approach was adopted to collect estimates for each pathway sub-step. Pathways assessed in an earlier WG meeting were reviewed to take account of the newly introduced sub-steps.

The pathway of natural migration was reviewed and supplemented with very recent (unpublished) information introduced via personal communication.

The assessment of establishment was reviewed and results from an alternative approach discussed. It was agreed that determining the boundary of a species climatic niche is often the most challenging aspect of species distribution modelling.

A list of tasks and sub-tasks was agreed.

## 5. Next meeting(s)

Next meeting will be on 5, 6, 7 and 8 June in Parma.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the Fifth meeting of the Working Group on *Spodoptera frugiperda*

**Held on 5-8/06/2018, EFSA, Parma  
(Agreed on 27-06-2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Alan MacLeod (chair) – via Web  
Wopke van der Werf (member)  
Regan Early (member) – via Web  
Rodney Nagoshi (member) – via Web  
Allan Hruska (member) – via Web  
Roger Day (member) – via Web

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:  
Ciro Gardi  
AMU Unit:  
Olaf Mosbach-Schultz

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

## **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

**Discussion on the pest risk assessment of *Spodoptera frugiperda* (EFSA-Q-2018-00068) for the EU territory.**

The WG revised the elicitation of parameters on:

- Sweetcorn Pathway
- Natural spread

The final simulation with @Risk was run and the results discussed

The final draft of the partial risk assessment was completed and made ready to be circulated to the Panel.

## **5. Next meeting(s)**

Next meeting will be on 19 June in Parma.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Animal and Plant Health Unit

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the Sixth meeting of the Working Group on *Spodoptera frugiperda*

**Held on 19/06/2018, EFSA, Parma  
(Agreed on 05-07-2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Alan MacLeod (chair)

Wopke van der Werf (member)

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit:

Ciro Gardi

AMU Unit:

Olaf Mosbach-Schultz

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertsselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

**Discussion on the pest risk assessment of *Spodoptera frugiperda* (EFSA-Q-2018-00068) for the EU territory.**

The WG addressed the comments received by the panel and finalized the document for the adoption.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>