

Parma, 05th March 2014

**Minutes of the 23rd web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
05th February 2014**

**EFSA / Assessment and Methodological Support Unit (AMU)
(Agreed by the WG on 06th March 2014)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Tony O’Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (AMU)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Elisa Aiassa, Fulvio Barizzone (AMU), Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit)

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interests made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

3. Discussion

The agenda of this meeting was adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last meeting on 28th and 29th January 2014 (workshop).

The Working Group discussed the results of the workshop on 28th and 29th January 2014 and the possible input to the Guidance document.

4. Next meeting dates

Physical meetings	on Thu., 6 th , and Fri., 7 th March 2014 on Mon., 12 th , and Tue., 13 th May 2014 (final meeting)
-------------------	--

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the oral declarations of interests done at the beginning of the meeting

NO CONFLICT: With regard to this meeting Prof. Tony O'Hagan declared the following interest: Short term contract of consultancy of Centre for Workforce Intelligence on application of Sheffield method in written procedure. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

Assessment and Methodological Support Unit (AMU)
Working Group on Expert Knowledge Elicitation (EKE)

Meeting on Expert Knowledge Elicitation Introduction – Case Studies – Implementation

Tuesday, 28th January 2014, 9:00-18:00 / Wednesday, 29th January 2014, 9:00-13:00
Parma, EFSA seat meeting room 00/Mo8 and 00/Mog

Agenda

Tuesday, 28th January 2014, morning session
Chaired by Didier Verloo

- | | |
|-------|--|
| 09:00 | Welcome |
| 09:15 | Olaf Mosbach-Schulz:
Organisation and tasks of the meeting |
| 09:30 | Fergus Bolger:
Overview over the elicitation process |
| 10:00 | Coffee break:
Participants are invited to exchange their expectations on the feedback wall |
| 10:20 | Anthony O'Hagan:
Eliciting a probability distribution
Part 1: Introduction |
| 11:20 | Part 2: Training on eliciting a probability distribution |
| 11:50 | Part 3: Individual exercise |
| 12:15 | Fulvio Barizzzone:
Initiation phase: An example of an elicitation problem |
| 12:30 | Lunch break |

Tuesday, 28th January 2014, afternoon session

Chaired by Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

- 13:30 Gene Rowe:
Pre-elicitation phase: Framing the problem
- 13:45 Fergus Bolger:
Pre-elicitation phase: Selecting the experts
- 14:10 Anca Hanea:
Pre-elicitation phase: Selecting the elicitation method
- 14:30 Common discussion on the pre-elicitation phase
- 14:45 **Coffee break**
Participants are invited to exchange their questions on the feedback wall
- 15:05 Anca Hanea:
Elicitation protocol: The Cooke method
Discussion
- 15:40 Meike Wentholt:
Elicitation protocol: The Delphi method
Discussion
- 16:15 Anthony O'Hagan:
Elicitation protocol: The Sheffield method
Discussion
- 17:00 **Coffee break**
Participants are invited to exchange their questions on the feedback wall
- 17:20 Olaf Mosbach-Schulz:
Post-elicitation phase: Documentation
Discussion
- 17:40 Gene Rowe:
Summary of the feedbacks
- 18:00 End of the afternoon session
- 20:00 Participants are invited to join the
Dinner in Trattoria Corrieri, Via Conservatorio 1, 43121 Parma

Wednesday, 29th January 2014, morning session

Chaired by Didier Verloo / Gene Rowe

- 09:00 Olaf Mosbach-Schulz:
Welcome and **tasks of the day**
- 09:10 Andrea Gervelmeyer:
Case study in AHAW: Application of the Sheffield method
Discussion
- 09:50 Sara Tramontini:
Case study in PLH: Application of the Delphi method
Discussion
- 10:30 Tine Hald:
Case study in BIOHAZ: Application of the Cooke method
Discussion
- 11:10 **Coffee break:**
Participants are invited to indicate barriers to EKE on the feedback wall
- 11:30 Gene Rowe:
Introduction to the final discussion
Discussion on the implementation of EKE in EFSA
- 12:45 Didier Verloo:
What comes next?
Closure of the meeting
- 13:00 End of the meeting

Parma, 05th March 2014

**Minutes of the 21st web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
22nd January 2014**

**EFSA / Assessment and Methodological Support Unit (AMU)
(Agreed by the WG on 06th March 2014)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Tony O’Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	Tine Hald
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (AMU)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Elisa Aiassa, Fulvio Barizzone (AMU), Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit)

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The members of the working group went through the agenda of the coming workshop (28th and 29th January), explained their role in the WG and summarized their presentation.

Final preparations of the workshop were done.

4. Next meeting dates

Workshop on EKE on Tue., 28th, and Wed., 29th January 2014 in Parma

Parma, 05th March 2014

**Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
on 08th and 09th January 2014**

**EFSA / Assessment and Methodological Support Unit (AMU)
(Agreed by the WG on 06th March 2014)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Tony O'Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	Tine Hald
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (AMU), Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit, partly)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Elisa Aiassa, Fulvio Barizzone (AMU), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit)

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The members of the working group discussed the structure and timeline of the coming workshop on 28th and 29th January. The content of the presentations were sketched. The final tasks for preparation of the workshop were distributed in the group.

4. Next meeting dates

Web meeting	on Wed., 22 nd January 2014
Workshop on EKE	on Tue., 28 th , and Wed., 29 th January 2014 in Parma

Parma, 07th January 2014

**Minutes of the 19th web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
11th December 2013**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 08th January 2014)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit), Eugen Christoph (SAS unit, partly), and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit, partly)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Tony O'Hagan, Elisa Aiassa (SAS unit), Fulvio Barizzzone (Biological Hazards unit), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit)

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The agenda of this meeting and minutes of the last meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last web meeting on 06th November 2013.

The Working Group reviewed the draft report on the public consultation prepared by EFSA. The report was endorsed for later publication (together with the final Guidance) with minor corrections.

The structure, content and format of the coming workshop on Expert Knowledge Elicitation were drafted and discussed. Responsibilities were distributed within the working group.

4. Next meeting dates

Physical meeting	on Wed., 8 th , and Thu., 9 th January 2014
Workshop in Parma	on Tue., 28 th , and Wed., 29 th January 2014

Parma, 24. October 2013

**Minutes of the 17th web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
16th October 2013**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 06th November 2013)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Tony O'Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit, partly), Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit) and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit, partly)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Elisa Aiassa, Eugen Christoph (SAS unit), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit)

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The agenda of this meeting and minutes of the last meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last web meeting on 09th August 2013, esp. the status of and work within the case study in Plant Health.

The Working Group reviewed the comments received from public consultation and decided on the workplan to answer the comments. More general discussion were made on the overall readability and structure of the Guidance.

4. Next meeting dates

Physical meeting in Parma	on Wed., 6 th , and Thu., 7 th November 2013
Web meeting	on Wednesday, the 11 th December 2013
Physical meeting	on Wed., 8 th , and Thu., 9 th January 2014
Workshop in Parma	on Tue., 28 th , and Wed., 29 th January 2014

Parma, 09. August 2013

**Minutes of the 16th web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
09th August 2013**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 16th October 2013)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Tony O'Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit) and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Elisa Aiassa, Eugen Christoph (SAS unit), Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit)

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interests made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex I.

3. Discussion

The agenda of this meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last web meeting on 28th May 2013, esp. the results of the internal review process (formatting, proofreading and discussions with the Scientific Committee), the preparations for the coming public consultations, the revised timeline for the coming workshop, and the status of the case study in Plant Health.

The Working Group discussed the comments received from the proofreading service and from the Scientific Committee. The draft Guidance were revised and approved.

4. Next meeting dates

Web meeting	on Wednesday, the 16 th October 2013
Physical meeting in Parma	on Wed., 6 th , and Thu., 7 th November 2013
Web meeting	on Wednesday, the 11 th December 2013
Physical meeting	on Wed., 8 th , and Thu., 9 th January 2014
Workshop in Parma	on 28 th and 29 th January 2014

Annex I

Interests and actions resulting from the oral declarations of interests done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting **Prof. Anca Hanea** declared the following interest:

She is acting since August 2013 as facilitator (advisor) for some expert elicitations for the World Health Organisation (WHO) as part of their effort to estimate the global burden of foodborne diseases.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

Parma, 06. May 2013

**Minutes of the 14th web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
16th April 2013**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 07th May 2013)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Tony O’Hagan and Gene Rowe
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit), Eugen Christoph, Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit) and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Jeremy Oakley, Meike Wentholt and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The participants reported on their activities since the last meeting on 06th and 07th March in Brussels. Special emphasis was given to discuss the second case study in connection with EFSA’s Plant Health unit.

The draft sketch of the workshop in December was presented and discussed. The timeline of the WG was updated accordingly.

The content of chapter 8 (3rd work package) were further discussed.

4. Next meeting dates

Next web meetings will take place on 07th May 2013.

The dates for the 2nd half of 2013 were planned as follows:

09th Aug. (web) / 03rd+04th Sep. (in NL) / 15th Oct. (web) / 12th+13th Nov. (Brussels) / 09th+10th Dec. (Workshop in Parma).

Parma, 08th March 2013

**Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
In Brussels, 06th and 07th March 2013
EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 16th April 2013)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger (only 6 th March, by web), Anca Hanea, Jeremy Oakley (by web), Tony O'Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit) and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit, only 6 th March, by web)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The minutes of the last meeting and the agenda of this meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last meeting on 18th and 19th February 2013.

The hypothetical example on expert elicitation for one parameter in a risk assessment of a non-toxicogenic bacteria contaminating a specific food item was further explicated. Several details of the example were discussed (Chapter 8, 3rd work package).

The timeline were adjusted due to the current status of the draft.

4. Next meeting dates

Next web meetings of the working group meeting are planned to take place on 16th April and 07th May 2013.

Parma, 22nd February 2013

**Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
In Sheffield, 18th and 19th February 2013
EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 06th March 2013)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Jeremy Oakley, Tony O’Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit), Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit), and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit)

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The minutes of the last meeting and the agenda of this meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last web-meeting on 25th January 2013.

Tony O’Hagen presented the results of the second (and final) workshop with Expert Knowledge Elicitation conducted for the case study on Rift Valley Fever of the AHAW unit.

The current draft of the guidance document was further discussed, especially the draft of chapter 7 on documentation of the results.

The content of the chapter 8 (3rd work package) was revised in detail.

4. Next meeting dates

Next physical working group meeting is planned to take place on 06th and 07th March 2013 in Brussels.

Parma, 14. February 2013

**Minutes of the 11th web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
25th January 2013**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 18th February 2013)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Jeremy Oakley, Tony O’Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit), Andrea Gervelmeyer, Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit) and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Elisa Aiassa, Sharon Cheek (SAS unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The minutes of the last meeting and the agenda of this meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last web meeting on 18th December 2012.

The structure of chapter 8 (3rd work package) were further discussed. Special emphasis was given to define a common example for this chapter.

4. Next meeting dates

Next physical meetings will take place on 18th and 19th February in Sheffield and on 06th and 07th March 2013 in Brussels.

Parma, 31. October 2012

**Minutes of the 10th web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
18th December 2012**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 25th January 2013)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Jeremy Oakley, Tony O’Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit), Andrea Gervelmeyer, Sofie Dhollander (Animal Health and Welfare unit), Olaf Mosbach- Schulz (SAS unit) and Sara Tramontini (partly, Plant Health unit)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Elisa Aiassa, Sharon Cheek (SAS unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The minutes of the last meeting and the agenda of this meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last meeting on 06th and 07th November.

The draft version of chapter 6 and the structure of chapter 8 (3rd work package) were discussed. Open questions were raised and clarified.

After the first elicitation workshop within the case study on Rift Valley Fever the group discussed “lessons learnt” for the Guidance document.

4. Next meeting dates

Next web meeting of the working group is planned for the 25th January 2013, and next physical meetings will take place on 18th and 19th February in Sheffield and on 06th and 07th March 2013 in Brussels.

Parma, 08th November 2012

**Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
In Parma, 6th and 7th November 2012
EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 18th December 2012)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Tony O’Hagan, Gene Rowe. and Meike Wentholt Jeremy Oakley (connected via web conference),
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit); and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit, partly)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit)

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The minutes of the last meeting and the agenda of this meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last web-meeting on 30th October 2012.

Tony O’Hagen presented his introduction and training of Expert Knowledge Elicitation prepared for the workshop of AHAW (case study on Rift Valley Fever).

The current draft of the guidance document was further discussed, especially the draft of chapter 6 on Principles and practice of handling multiple experts.

The content of the chapter 8 (3rd work package) was discussed. A rough structure was developed for this chapter.

4. Next meeting dates

Next web-meetings are agreed to take place on 18th December 2012, 10-15 CET, and 22nd January 2013, 10-15 CET, next physical working group meetings are planned to take place 13th and 14th February 2013 in Sheffield, and 06th and 07th March 2013 in Brussels.

Parma, 31. October 2012

**Minutes of the 8th web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
30th October 2012**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 06th November 2012)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Jeremy Oakley, Tony O’Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit) and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Anca Hanea, Elisa Aiassa, Sharon Cheek (SAS unit), Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit) and Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit)

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The minutes of the last meeting and the agenda of this meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last meeting on 18th and 19st September.

The preparations for the expert knowledge elicitation in the Rift Valley Fever (RVF) project were discussed. Tony O’Hagan will present the expert training on the next WG meeting.

The content of chapter 7 and the draft version of chapter 5 (2nd work package) were discussed. Open questions were raised and clarified.

4. Next meeting dates

Next physical working group meeting is planned to take place 06th and 07th November 2012.

Paris, 19th September 2012

**Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
In Paris, 18th and 19th September 2012
EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 30th October 2012)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Jeremy Oakley, Tony O’Hagan, and Gene Rowe Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Sharon Cheek, Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit); and Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit) Elisa Aiassa (SAS unit), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit) were partly (18 th September, 14:00-15:30, connected via web-meeting)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Lena Jacobi, and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The minutes of the last meeting and the agenda of this meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last web-meeting on 26th July.

The current draft of the guidance document was discussed. To harmonize the format of the chapters a general style for recommendations, definitions etc. was developed.

The content of the chapters 5 to 7 (2nd work package) was discussed. A rough structure was developed for each of these chapters.

4. Next meeting dates

Next web-meeting is agreed to take place on 16th October 2012, 10-15 CEST, next physical working group meeting is planned to take place 06th and 07th November 2012 in Parma.

Parma, 27 July 2012

**Minutes of the 6th web-meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
26th July 2012**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 18th September 2012)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Jeremy Oakley, Tony O’Hagan, Gene Rowe and Meike Wentholt
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit) and Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Elisa Aiassa, Lena Jacobi, Sharon Cheek (SAS unit), Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The minutes of the last meeting and the agenda of this meeting were adopted. The participants reported on their activities since the last meeting on 20th and 21st June.

The results of the web-search on existing Guidance documents were presented. Forthcoming tasks to evaluate specific papers were distributed in the group.

The content of the chapters 1 to 4 (1st work package) was discussed in details on the basis of sketches presented by the members. Open questions were raised and clarified.

4. Next meeting dates

Next physical working group meeting is planned to take place 18th and 19th September 2012.

Parma, 21 June 2012

**Web-minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
20th und 21st June 2012**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 26 July 2012)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Jeremy Oakley, Tony O’Hagan and Gene Rowe. Via web conference: Meike Wentholt (partly)
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit); Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit); and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit). Via web conference: Lena Jacobi (SAS Unit, partly), and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit, partly).

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Elisa Aiassa and Sharon Cheek (SAS unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The agenda was adopted. The participants reported on their activities to initiate and conduct case studies for different applications. The status of the systematic search on existing guidance documents was presented. The WG agreed on the evaluation procedure of the obtained documents.

The work plan of the working group was discussed and revised. The WG agreed on the responsibilities of the first work package and on the timeline until the finalization of the draft guidance document for public consultation in April 2013.

The structure of the guidance document was discussed and revised. The intended content of chapter 1 to 4 (1st work package) was discussed in details.

Gene Rowe and Jeremy Oakley were appointed as rapporteurs by the WG.

4. Next meeting dates

Next working group meetings are planned to take place on 26th July 2012 (web meeting) and 18th and 19th September 2012 (face-to-face meeting).

Parma, 8 May 2012

**Web-minutes of the 4th meeting (web-conference) of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
8 May 2012**

**EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 20th June 2012)**

Participants

WG Experts	Fergus Bolger, Anca Hanea, Jeremy Oakley, Tony O’Hagan and Gene Rowe.
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Elisa Aiassa, Lena Jacobi and Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit); Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit); Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit); and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit).

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Meike Wentholt; Sharon Cheek (SAS unit); and Sofie Dhollander (Animal Health and Welfare unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The participants introduced themselves. The agenda was adopted. A presentation of EFSA and the role of the Scientific Assessment Support unit was given.

The mandate terms of reference and the objectives of the project were presented and the draft content of the Guidance was discussed.

4. Next meeting dates

Next working group meeting is planned to take place on 20-21 June 2012 (face-to-face meeting).

Parma, 6 March 2012

**Web-minutes of the 3rd meeting (web-conference) of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”**

6 March 2012

EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)

(Agreed by the WG on 16th March 2012)

Participants

WG Experts	Anthony O'Hagan, Gene Rowe, Meike Wentholt.
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Elisa Aiassa and Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit); Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit); and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit).

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Sharon Cheek (SAS unit) and Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The agenda was adopted and the first results of the literature search and selection process for relevant guidance on expert knowledge elicitation methods were presented.

4. Next meeting dates

Next working group meeting is planned to take place on 17 April 2012 (teleconference).

Amsterdam, 7 February 2012

**Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
Amsterdam (Regus Meeting Centre, Schiphol Airport), 6 and 7 February 2012
EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)**

(Agreed by the WG on 7 February 2012)

Participants

WG Experts Anthony O’Hagan, Gene Rowe, Meike Wentholt.
Hearing Experts /
Observers (e.g. EC) /
EFSA: Elisa Aiassa and Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (SAS unit); Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit); Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit); and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit).

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Sharon Cheek (SAS unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussion

The agenda was adopted. Some EFSA examples of expert knowledge elicitation processes were presented. A preliminary search (and its results) for relevant reports on guidance for expert knowledge elicitation was presented and discussed. The draft table of contents of the Guidance agreed during the previous meeting was further discussed and integrated with new topics that should be considered.

4. Next meeting dates

Next working group meeting is planned to take place on 6 March 2012 (teleconference).

Parma, 15 December 2011

**Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on
“EFSA Guidance on Expert knowledge elicitation”
Parma, 14 and 15 December 2011
EFSA / Scientific Assessment and Support Unit (SAS)
(Agreed by the WG on 15 December 2011)**

Participants

WG Experts	Anthony O'Hagan, Gene Rowe, Meike Wentholt.
Hearing Experts	/
Observers (e.g. EC)	/
EFSA:	Elisa Aiassa, Marika De Santis, Olaf Mosbach-Schulz, Didier Verloo (SAS unit); Fulvio Barizzone (Biological Hazards unit); Andrea Gervelmeyer (Animal Health and Welfare unit).

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received Sharon Cheek (SAS unit) and Sara Tramontini (Plant Health unit).

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Discussions

The participants introduced themselves. The agenda was adopted. EFSA administrative rules related to reimbursements and travel arrangements were explained. A presentation of EFSA and the role of the Scientific Assessment Support unit was given.

The mandate terms of reference and the objectives of the project were presented and the working group had a preliminary discussion on the content of the Guidance.

4. Next meeting date

Next working group meeting is planned to take place on 6-7 February 2012.