

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on a "request for a scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease (CWD) in cervids"

Web-conference on 30 October 2017

(Agreed on 8 November 2017)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Sylvie Benestad, Dolores Gavier-Widen, Mike W. Miller, Giuseppe Ru, Marion Simmons (Chair), Glenn C. Telling, Morten Tryland

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Francesca Latronico, Angel Ortiz Pelaez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

WG members informed of the latest cases of CWD confirmed in Norway and on the ongoing experimental challenges of cases in transgenic mice and bank voles in the USA and Italy, respectively. The Chair provided feedback from the BIOHAZ Panel, following the thorough reading of the draft scientific opinion in the previous plenary meeting. The feedback was very positive with minor suggestions provided by the two internal reviewers. The WG reviewed the current contents of the sections "Answers to the Terms of Reference (ToRs)" and "Recommendations". A list of standing comments in the current draft was reviewed and some changes in the body of the text were agreed. Equally, the data included in the Appendices were reviewed.

5. Work plan: tasks and deadlines

Actions and deadlines were agreed during the revision of the sections of the current draft. This was the last WG meeting. It was agreed that there was no need to have any extraordinary WG meeting. A timetable was agreed to have the final draft of the scientific opinion ready for submission to the BIOHAZ panel for possible adoption on 6-7 December 2017.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00387>
<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00411>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on a "request for a scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease (CWD) in cervids"

Web-conference on 14 September 2017

(Agreed on 20 September 2017)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Sylvie Benestad, Dolores Gavier-Widen, Mike W. Miller, Giuseppe Ru, Marion Simmons (Chair), Glenn C. Telling, Morten Tryland

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Angel Ortiz Pelaez

- **Other:**

Lucie Carroueé (LC) (European Commission)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Chair provided feedback from the BIOHAZ panel, following the first reading of the draft scientific opinion in the previous plenary meeting, and of the follow-up of the collaboration with the TSE EURL, after the participation of its representative as hearing expert in the previous WG meeting. The WG reviewed the current contents and layout of the draft scientific opinion. The conclusions and recommendations of the 2004 and 2010 EFSA opinions, subject of the two Terms of Reference (ToR), are included in the current draft and all of them are commented, updated and/or qualified following the conclusions of the assessment, thoroughly elaborated in the corresponding section. Available data on performance of diagnostic tests for CWD were reviewed. Decisions were made on the need to seek for additional data from manufacturers and literature to complement the answer to ToR4. Surveillance data provided by Norway will be also analysed to estimate disease frequency in order to compare with similar data or new incursions of CWD in North America.

5. Work plan: tasks and deadlines

Actions and deadlines were agreed during the revision of the sections of the current draft. The next WG meeting will take place on 30 October 2017, as a web-conference.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on a "request for a scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease (CWD) in cervids"

Held on 21 July 2017, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 26 July 2017)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Sylvie Benestad, Dolores Gavier-Widen, Mike W. Miller, Giuseppe Ru (pm), Marion Simmons (Chair), Glenn C. Telling, Morten Tryland

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Yves van der Stede (am)

- **Other (hearing expert):**

Claire Cassar (TSE European Union Reference Laboratory)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the members of the working group (WG), the representative of the TSE EURL, and EFSA staff as observer. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The EC encouraged and recommended the collaboration of the TSE EURL and EFSA on their particular tasks regarding CWD diagnostics. The hearing expert and representative of the TSE EURL Claire Cassar, explained that the TSE EURL has been commissioned by the EC to produce guidelines of the tests to be used by MS for testing cervid samples within the scope of the newly-enforced CWD surveillance programme.

Sylvie Benestad presented an update of the situation of CWD in Norway, and details of the latest case reported (6th). The WG discussed profusely all aspects affecting the performance of rapid tests for the detection of CWD in cervids. Available data from manufacturers of rapid tests and scientific literature were critically reviewed. A long list of uncertainties underpinning the CWD diagnosis using rapid and confirmatory tests were highlighted and discussed. All these aspects will be articulated in the scientific opinion as background information. The design and implementation of the 2006-2010 surveillance system were critically reviewed. The conclusions of the 2004 and 2010 EFSA opinions were reviewed and most of them are still valid but need to be put into the context of the current knowledge and disease status in Europe.

5. Work plan: tasks and deadlines

Actions and deadlines were agreed during the revision of the sections drafted during the discussion. The Chair explained the WG of the suggestion by EFSA management to replace the remaining physical meeting by another web-conference due to budgetary constraints. It was agreed to fix the next web-conference on Thursday 14 September 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

16:00-20:00 CET, linked to the BIOHAZ Plenary meeting. Two doodle polls will be circulated for a fifth WG meeting (web-conference) in w/c 23 October 2017 and a potential extra-web-conference on w/c 13 November 2017

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on a "request for a scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease (CWD) in cervids"

Held on 6 June 2017, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 13 June 2017)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Sylvie Benestad, Dolores Gavier-Widen, Mike W. Miller, Giuseppe Ru, Marion Simmons (Chair), Glenn C. Telling, Morten Tryland

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Pietro Stella

- **Other:**

Jianghui Zhu (China National Center for Food Safety Risk Assessment)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Secretariat informed of the events following the publication of the scientific opinion Phase I on 16 January 2017 until the approval by the Standing Committee on Animals, Food and Feed of the amended TSE Regulation including the CWD surveillance plan. An update of the ongoing literature reviewed was given by the chair. Results of the screening will be presented during the next WG meeting. The approaches to be followed in order to address the two Terms of Reference (ToR) were brainstormed and possible topics to be elaborated during the assessment were listed as headings for the scientific opinion. They include: the evaluation of performance of diagnostic tests, the available diagnostic methods for CWD and the factors potentially affecting diagnostics for Tor4; the new surveillance data on CWD in Europe since 2010 and the description of the occurrence of CWD in new areas for ToR5. The conclusions and recommendations of the 2004 and 2010 EFSA opinions mentioned in the ToRs were reviewed.

5. Work plan: tasks and deadlines

Actions and deadlines were agreed during the revision of the sections drafted during the brainstorming session. The next WG meeting will take place on 21 July, as a physical meeting in Parma.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on a "request for a scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease (CWD) in cervids"

Held on 15-16 November 2016, Oslo (Norway)

(Agreed on 28 November 2016)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Sylvie Benestad, Dolores Gavier-Widen, Mike W. Miller, Giuseppe Ru, Marion Simmons (Chair), Glenn C. Telling, Morten Tryland

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Marta Hugas, Angel Ortiz Pelaez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Review actions from previous meeting ⁴

The chair and secretariat reviewed the actions points agreed in the previous meeting and all the contributions received.

4.2. Review Draft Scientific Opinion: sections 1, 2 and 3

The draft opinion was reviewed and the contributions to the background sections were critically assessed by the working group. It was considered that the background information included at the moment in the opinion is sufficient to justify scientifically the answers to the ToRs . Minor changes were agreed on the section Data and Methodologies.

4.3. Answer to ToR1-2-3: discussion and agreement

The WG discussed the answers to the ToRs and agreed on the final conclusions that should be clearly explained in the scientific opinion.

4.4. Breakout groups: drafting Answers to ToRs

During the morning of day 2, the working group was split in three breakout groups dedicated to draft the final version of the answers to the ToRs and the recommendations.

4.5. Joint review final draft answers to ToRs

The drafts produced by each group were discussed and modified until a general consensus was reached.

5. Work plan: tasks and deadlines

A final circulation of the opinion was agreed before it is submitted to the BIOHAZ Panel for possible adoption. It was agreed the Secretariat will contact the WG members to organize the first meeting of Phase II of this mandate

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00387>
<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00411>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on a "request for a scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease (CWD) in cervids"

Web-conference on 7 October 2016

(Agreed on 14 October 2016)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Sylvie Benestad, Dolores Gavier-Widen, Mike W. Miller, Giuseppe Ru, Marion Simmons (Chair), Morten Tryland

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Angel Ortiz Pelaez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Glenn Telling.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Review actions from previous meeting ⁴

The chair and secretariat reviewed the actions points agreed in the previous meeting, the contributions received and the ones still pending which are related to the zoonotic potential.

4.2. Review approach and developments of ToR1, ToR2 and ToR3.

The draft opinion was reviewed and the contributions received so far to the background sections were critically assessed by the working group. Amendments were agreed for some of them. Due to the absence of one key expert on the topic, it was agreed not to discuss ToR2 on this occasion. The sections on origin, pathogenesis, mechanisms of natural transmission and approaches for the study of the zoonotic potential of CWD are still underdeveloped.

4.3. Draft Scientific Opinion: Table of contents

The layout and sections agreed in the first meeting were reviewed. Some minor changes were agreed based on the discussion of the previous point.

5. Work plan: tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed

6. Preparation 3rd WG meeting November and Any Other Business

3rd meeting: 15-16 November 2016. Physical meeting. Norwegian Veterinary Institute, Oslo (Norway). The state of affairs needed to make a fruitful last meeting was discussed. It was agreed to submit contributions in two circulations of the draft opinion before the meeting, giving emphasis to the answers to the ToRs.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00387>
<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00411>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on a "request for a scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease (CWD) in cervids"

Held on 1 September 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 7 September 2016)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Sylvie Benestad, Dolores Gavier-Widen, Mike W. Miller, Giuseppe Ru, Marion Simmons (Chair), Glenn C. Telling, Morten Tryland

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Lucie Carrouée-Pook (DG SANTE)

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Mirena Ivanova, Ernesto Liebana Criado, Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Pietro Stella (morning session).

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with a change. After point 4, a new point (5) was added: "Update of the situation of CWD in Norway".

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Mandate and Terms of reference ⁴

The chair introduced the mandate received from the European Commission (EC) and terms of reference (ToRs).

4.2. Update of the situation of CWD in Norway

A WG member presented the latest data on the caseload of CWD in Norway.

4.3. Terms of reference

The WG discussed in detail the mandate and each of the ToR, with the aim to have a common understanding of the questions to be answered.

4.4. Scope and methodology of the evaluation

The WG discussed the methodological approaches that will be adopted for each of the three ToRs.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00387>
<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00411>

6. Next meeting(s)

2nd meeting: 7 October 2016. Web-conference

3rd meeting: 15-16 November 2016. Physical meeting, Oslo (Norway)