



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 8th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON UPDATE AND REVIEW OF CONTROL OPTIONS FOR CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILERS AT PRIMARY PRODUCTION

Held on 16 December 2019, web-meeting

(Agreed on 18 December 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Thomas Alter
 - Declan Bolton
 - Marianne Chemaly
 - Matteo Crotta
 - Johanne Ellis-Iversen
 - Maarten Nauta

- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Andrew Hart
 - Peter Craig

- European Commission representatives:
 - Luisa Antunes

- EFSA:
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Michaela Hempen

- Others:
 - Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Luisa Antunes (EC).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held as on 18 November in Parma

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 26th November, 2019.⁴

5. Hearing Experts

Andrew Hart and Peter Craig were invited to provide support in the implementation of the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments⁵ to the draft opinion.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA invited Andrew Hart to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. Their participation in the present meeting was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group (i.e. not possible to draft or be involved in the discussion or the adoption of a scientific output), in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

6. Scientific topic for discussion

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/biological-hazards/working-groups>

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5123>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, Article 9:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6.1. Scientific opinion on Update and review of control options for *Campylobacter* in broilers at primary production⁷

The WG chair informed the WG about the feedback from the panel on the progress of the draft opinion. The Panel suggested to add an introductory chapter before the ranking of control options that explains the use of expert knowledge elicitation. The conclusions should be refined and presented in five sub-sets: review, identify and rank control options, advantages and disadvantages and combination of control options.

The WG then went through the contributions to the draft opinion, addressing comments and drafted the concluding remarks for each section which will inform the final conclusions.

The updated draft opinion will be presented to the BIOHAZ Panel on 29/30 January 2020.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting is scheduled for 9 January 2020.

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00676>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 7th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON UPDATE AND REVIEW OF CONTROL OPTIONS FOR CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILERS AT PRIMARY PRODUCTION

Held on 19-20 November 2019, Parma)Italy

(Agreed on 26 November 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Thomas Alter
Declan Bolton (by tele-conference)
Marianne Chemaly
Matteo Crotta
Johanne Ellis-Iversen
Maarten Nauta

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Andrew Hart
Peter Craig

■ European Commission representatives:

Luisa Antunes

■ EFSA:

BIOCONTAM Unit: Katrin Bote, Michaela Hempen, Winy Messens, Pietro Stella, Alice Vismarra

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Luisa Antunes (EC).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held as on 1st October as web-meeting

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 4th October, 2019.⁴

5. Hearing Experts

Andrew Hart and Peter Craig were invited to provide support in the implementation of the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments⁵ to the draft opinion.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA invited Andrew Hart to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. Their participation in the present meeting was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group (i.e. not possible to draft or be involved in the discussion or the adoption of a scientific output), in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

6. Scientific topic for discussion

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/biological-hazards/working-groups>

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5123>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, Article 9:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6.1. Scientific opinion on Update and review of control options for *Campylobacter* in broilers at primary production⁷

The WG chair informed the WG about the feedback from the panel on the progress of the draft opinion. The WG then went through the draft opinion addressing the remaining comments in the documents and update on the contribution since the last meeting.

The afternoon of the first day and morning of the second day were dedicated to the expert knowledge elicitation on the uncertainty about effectiveness of control options. In a first step, the experts were asked to provide a judgement on the effectiveness of a control option to reduce human campylobacteriosis by >10%. In a second step, those interventions that were expected to have such an effect, were discussed in more detail. From that process resulted a ranking of control options based on their estimated effectiveness and the uncertainty around that estimate.

The remainder of the second day was focussing on how the ranking should be described in the draft opinion, followed by a discussion on the advantages and disadvantages of control option and how to address effects of combined control options, as requested in the terms of reference.

A first set of conclusions and recommendations was drafted.

The outcome of the expert knowledge elicitation and the updated draft opinion will be presented to the BIOHAZ Panel on 11/12 December 2019.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting is scheduled for 16 December 2019.

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00676>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 6th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON UPDATE AND REVIEW OF CONTROL OPTIONS FOR CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILERS AT PRIMARY PRODUCTION

held on 1 October 2019, Web

(Agreed on 5 October 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Thomas Alter
 - Declan Bolton
 - Marianne Chemaly
 - Matteo Crotta
 - Johanne Ellis-Iversen
 - Maarten Nauta

- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Andrew Hart
 - Peter Craig

- European Commission representatives:
 - Luisa Antunes

- EFSA:
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Michaela Hепен
 - SCER Unit: Caroline Merten

- Others:
 - Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Johanne Ellis-Iversen and Luisa Antunes (EC).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held as on 1-2 July 2019 in Parma

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 15 July, 2019.⁴

5. Hearing Experts

Andrew Hart and Peter Craig were invited to provide support in the implementation of the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments⁵ to the draft opinion.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA invited Andrew Hart to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. Their participation in the present meeting was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group (i.e. not possible to draft or be involved in the discussion or the adoption of a scientific output), in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

6. Scientific topic for discussion

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/biological-hazards/working-groups>

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5123>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, Article 9:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6.1. Scientific opinion on Update and review of control options for *Campylobacter* in broilers at primary production⁷

The WG chair informed the WG about the feedback from the panel on the progress of the draft opinion. The WG then discussed questions relating to the modelling of the effect of intervention as that aim at reducing the concentration of *Campylobacter* in the caeca of broilers. The WG then decided on which interventions will be included in the model. This was followed by a discussion on the contributions the draft opinions and task were assigned.

The second part of the meeting was dedicated to the discussion on uncertainty analysis. The hearing experts provided advice on the preparatory tasks for the expert knowledge elicitation (EKE) in November. The evidence tables for the interventions and the uncertainty table for the overall uncertainty have been completed. In preparation to the EKE, the experts will pre-screen the interventions in relation to uncertainty to inform the actual EKE which will be used to provide a probability judgement and ranking of interventions.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting is scheduled for 19/20 November 2019.

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00676>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 5th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON UPDATE AND REVIEW OF CONTROL OPTIONS FOR CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILERS AT PRIMARY PRODUCTION

held on 1-2 July 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 15 July 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Thomas Alter
Declan Bolton
Marianne Chemaly
Matteo Crotta
Johanne Ellis-Iversen
Maarten Nauta

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Andrew Hart

■ European Commission representatives:

Luisa Antunes

■ EFSA:

BIOCONTAM Unit: Michaela Hепен, Maria Francesca Iulietto
SCER Unit: Caroline Merten

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Thomas Alter.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held as web-meeting on 7th May 2019

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 16 May, 2019.⁴

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Andrew Hart was invited to provide support in the implementation of the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments⁵ to the draft opinion.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA invited Andrew Hart to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. Their participation in the present meeting was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group (i.e. not possible to draft or be involved in the discussion or the adoption of a scientific output), in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Scientific opinion on Update and review of control options for *Campylobacter* in broilers at primary production⁷

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/biological-hazards/working-groups>

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5123>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, Article 9:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00676>



During the first day, the WG discussed contributions to the draft opinion. In particular, first results of estimates of population-attributable fractions were discussed and next steps were agreed. The outcome of both approaches will be expressed as relative risk reductions. Effect of control options that cannot be quantified will be expressed qualitatively. The ranking will be done based on effectiveness including the uncertainty.

During the second day, discussions focussed on uncertainty analysis. The Hearing expert provided advice on how the WG could implement the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments. An approach on how to assess uncertainty about the effectiveness of control measures was agreed and the questions and preparatory tasks for an expert knowledge elicitation were identified.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting is scheduled for 1 October 2019.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 4th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON UPDATE AND REVIEW OF CONTROL OPTIONS FOR CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILERS AT PRIMARY PRODUCTION

WEB-conference, 07 May 2019

(Agreed on 16 May 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Thomas Alter

Declan Bolton

Marianne Chemaly

Matteo Crotta

Johanne Ellis-Iversen

Maarten Nauta

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Peter Craig

Andrew Hart

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Pamina Suzuki

■ EFSA:

BIOCONTAM Unit: Michaela Hempen, Maria Francesca Iulietto

SCER Unit: Caroline Merten

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No Apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 4th March 2019 in Parma

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 15 March, 2019.⁴

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Andrew Hart and Peter Craig were invited to provide support in the implementation of the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments⁵ to the draft opinion.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA invited Andrew Hart and Peter Craig to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. Their participation in the present meeting was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group (i.e. not possible to draft or be involved in the discussion or the adoption of a scientific output), in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/biological-hazards/working-groups>

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5123>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, Article 9:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6.1. Scientific opinion on Update and review of control options for *Campylobacter* in broilers at primary production⁷

The discussions during the first part of the meeting focussed on the methodology to be applied to estimate the effect of interventions targeting a reduction of *Campylobacter* prevalence in broiler flocks and a reduction of *Campylobacter* concentration in broiler caecal content. A quantitative approach will be followed as far as possible using population-attributable fractions (PAF) for the prevalence-based interventions. The results of the literature search were discussed and a list of risk factors and related control options to be taken further was agreed. The approach for assessing the effect of measures targeting concentrations of *Campylobacter* in caecal contents of broilers was discussed and agreed.

The contributions to the draft opinion were presented and comments from the WG and BIOHAZ panel were addressed.

The WG suggested approaches for uncertainty analysis and with support of the hearing experts the next steps were agreed. Uncertainties will be described per risk factor/control measure. A simplified table suggested in the last meeting, will be modified in this regard.

Tasks were distributed and deadlines agreed.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting is scheduled for July 2019.

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00676>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON UPDATE AND REVIEW OF CONTROL OPTIONS FOR CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILERS AT PRIMARY PRODUCTION

held on 04 March 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 15 March 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Thomas Alter

Declan Bolton

Marianne Chemaly

Matteo Crotta

Johanne Ellis-Iversen

Maarten Nauta

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Peter Craig

Andrew Hart

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

BIOCONTAM Unit: Michaela Hempen, Maria Francesca Iulietto, Winy Messens

SCER Unit: Caroline Merten

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No Apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held as web-meeting on 31st January 2019

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 8 February, 2019.⁴

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Andrew Hart and Peter Craig were invited to provide support in the implementation of the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments⁵ to the draft opinion.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA invited Andrew Hart and Peter Craig to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. Their participation in the present meeting was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group (i.e. not possible to draft or be involved in the discussion or the adoption of a scientific output), in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/biological-hazards/working-groups>

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5123>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, Article 9:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6.1. Scientific opinion on Update and review of control options for *Campylobacter* in broilers at primary production⁷

The discussions during this meeting focussed on the methodology to be applied to estimate the effect of interventions targeting a reduction of *Campylobacter* prevalence in broiler flocks and a reduction of *Campylobacter* concentration in broiler caecal content. A quantitative approach will be followed as far as possible using population-attributable fractions for the prevalence-based interventions and consumer-phase model and dose-response model for the concentration-based interventions.

The Hearing experts provided advice on how the WG could implement the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments. A simplified table was suggested to record uncertainties related to data, publications and models used.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting is scheduled for May 2019.

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00676>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 2ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON UPDATE AND REVIEW OF CONTROL OPTIONS FOR CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILERS AT PRIMARY PRODUCTION

by **WEB-conference, 31 January 2019**

(Agreed on 08 February 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Thomas Alter
 - Declan Bolton
 - Marianne Chemaly
 - Matteo Crotta
 - Johanne Ellis-Iversen
 - Maarten Nauta

- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Andrew Hart has participated via teleconference

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

- EFSA:
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Michaela Hemen, Maria Francesca Iulietto, Winy Messens, Pietro Stella
 - SCER Unit: Caroline Merten

- Others:
 - Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No Apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 4th December 2018, Parma

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 14 December 2018.⁴

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Dr. Andrew Hart was invited to provide support in the implementation of the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments⁵ to the draft opinion.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA invited Dr Andrew Hart to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. His participation in the present meeting was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group (i.e. not possible to draft or be involved in the discussion or the adoption of a scientific output), in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Scientific opinion on Update and review of control options for *Campylobacter* in broilers at primary production⁷

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/biological-hazards/working-groups>

⁵ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5123>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, Article 9:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00676>



The WG chair gave feedback from the BIOHAZ panel which recommended to keep the draft opinion as concise as possible. The panel also asked about data collection strategy which remains to be specified.

The WG went through the draft document introducing the contributions and addressing comments and assigning tasks for the next meeting.

The Hearing expert suggested a practical approach to how the WG could address the implementation of the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting is scheduled for March 2019.

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Update and review of control options for Campylobacter in broilers at primary production

Held on 04 December 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 14 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Thomas Alter

Declan Bolton

Marianne Chemaly

Matteo Crotta

Johanne Ellis-Iversen

Maarten Nauta

- **Hearing Experts:**

Andrew Hart has participated via teleconference

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Ángela Bolufer de Gea (DG SANTE) has participated via teleconference

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Michaela Hempen, Maria Francesca Iulietto, Winy Messens

SCER Unit: Caroline Merten

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Expert

Dr. Andrew Hart was invited to provide support in the implementation of the EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments³ to the draft opinion.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA invited Dr. Andrew Hart to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. His participation in the present meeting was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group (i.e. not possible to draft or be involved in the discussion or the adoption of a scientific output), in accordance with the applicable legal framework⁶.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

²

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5123>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, Article 9:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Scientific opinion on Update and review of control options for *Campylobacter* in broilers at primary production⁷

The WG chair introduced the mandate to the WG including a short presentation of the scientific opinion on *Campylobacter* control options in broiler meat published in 2011. The current mandate requires an update and review of that opinion focussing only on control options in primary production. A timeline for WG meetings in 2019 was suggested.

This was followed by a presentation of available mathematical models to assess the effect of control options including those used in the 2011 opinion. In addition, results from the CAMCON project in relation to on-farm interventions were presented.

An approach to answering the terms of reference was discussed which includes a literature review including publications from 2010-2019 and a modelling approach for measures affecting flock prevalence and the concentration of *Campylobacter* in the intestines of broilers.

The EFSA Scientific Committee's Guidance on Uncertainty Analysis in Scientific Assessments⁸ was introduced and the WG agreed on an approach on how to apply the principles of this guidance to the draft opinion.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting is scheduled for January 2019.

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00676>

⁸ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5123>