



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 2nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON “on the evaluation of an alternative method for production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3 animal by products”

Physical meeting, 9 January 2020

(Agreed on 17 January 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Avelino Alvarez Ordóñez (Chair)
Olivier Andreoletti
Pablo Fernandez Escámez
John Griffin
Marion M. Simmons
John Spiropoulos
Giuseppe Ru
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
BIOCONTAM Unit: Sean Ashe, Katrin Bote, Angel Ortiz Pelaez.
- Others:

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Annual Declarations of Interest, please refer to the Annex. Oral Declaration(s) of Interest were asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 16 December 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 16 December 2019 in Parma were agreed by written procedure on 20 December 2019⁴.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1. Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of an alternative method for production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3 animal by-products⁵

The chair and the Secretariat reviewed the level of completion of the actions agreed in the previous meeting. The state of the draft opinion circulated prior to the meeting was reviewed section by section. The validity of the results of the studies provided by the applicant to demonstrate the effectiveness of the alternative method to reduce the 263k hamster strain were discussed thoroughly. The first draft of the conclusions and recommendations were produced. A list of items about the Western blot

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/biological-hazards/wq-biohaz-ABP-biodiesel-fats.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00432>



protocol and the spiking experiments will be requested to the applicant without stopping the clock. Tasks were allocated to EFSA staff and WG experts.

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting

It was agreed to hold the next meeting on Thursday 27 February 2020 as a half-day web-conference.



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: In the Annual Declaration of Interest filled by Dr John Griffin, the following interests have been declared:

Dr Griffin declared that until his retirement in February 2019 he was the Head of the TSE and ABP Veterinary Division (SAT Division) in the Department of Agriculture Food and the Marine in Ireland which is classified by EFSA as a Public Institution. As Head of this Division Dr Griffin was responsible for the implementation of the measures set out in EU Regulation 999/2001 for the control and eradication of TSEs and the measures set out in EU Regulation 1069/2009 for the control of ABP. Dr Griffin was therefore performing risk management activities overlapping with the mandate of the EFSA scientific group in question. This constitutes a conflict of interest according to the above-mentioned rules on Competing Interest Management, thereby excluding the expert from participating in the BIOHAZ WG on ABP application (EFSA-Q-2019-00432) and resulting in the incompatibility with membership for two years after the activity is over.

Dr Griffin also declared that in 2018 he provided advice to the current applicant, the company College Proteins, for the evaluation of an alternative method for the production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3 animal by products (EFSA-Q-2019-00432). He provided advice to a representative of the abovementioned company at an early stage in the process with a view to enlightening her on the procedure and requirements for submitting an application for an alternative ABP method. He did this by going through the relevant legislation and the EFSA 2010 guidelines. The advice that Dr Griffin provided was in the context of his role as Head of the SAT Division of the Competent Authority in Ireland that deals with applications for alternative methods under Article 20 of EU Regulation 1069/2009. Therefore, the Competent Authority is required to provide such an advice as part of the EU legislative mandate. Dr Griffin indicated that he provided only advice on requirements for the structure of the application and submission procedure, while he did not have any role in the assessment of the application. According to Article 7(3) of the ED Decision on Competing Interest Management, EFSA considers the review, assessment and rating by experts of their own work as a conflict of interest incompatible with the experts' participation in these activities. In the present case, considering that the abovementioned application constitutes the main subject of the mandate, a conflict of interest is identified leading to the exclusion of Dr Griffin from participating in the BIOHAZ WG on ABP application (EFSA-Q-2019-00432), which will evaluate such an application. The same conclusion is reached even though Dr Griffin was provided only advice on requirements for the structure of the application and submission procedure the reason being that according to the said Decision the weight of the level of intensity of the interest is not required any longer.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁷, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted in accordance with Article 21 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.

Pursuant to Article 21(6) of the above-mentioned Decision, the concerned expert was allowed to take part in the discussion and in the drafting phase of the EFSA Scientific Opinion *"on the evaluation of an alternative method for production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3"*

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁷ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



animal by products", and has not been allowed to be, or act as, a chairman, a vice-chairman or rapporteur of the Working Group.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 1st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON “on the evaluation of an alternative method for production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3 animal by products”

WEB-conference, 16 December 2019

(Agreed on 20 December 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Avelino Alvarez Ordóñez (Chair)
Olivier Andreoletti
Pablo Fernandez Escámez
John Griffin
Marion M. Simmons
John Spiropoulos
Giuseppe Ru
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
BIOCONTAM Unit: Sean Ashe, Katrin Bote, Angel Ortiz Pelaez.
- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Annual Declarations of Interest, please refer to the Annex. Oral Declaration(s) of Interest were asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1. Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of an alternative method for production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3 animal by-products⁴

The WG members discussed the dossier as submitted by the applicant. It was considered complete. A review of the draft opinion previously populated with the description of the alternative method and the standard sections as required by Regulation (EC) 142/2011 was conducted. Key issues for deep review were identified. Tasks were allocated to EFSA staff and WG experts.

5. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will take place on Thursday 9 January 2020 as a one-day physical meeting in Parma, at EFSA headquarters. It was agreed to circulate a doodle poll for the availability of the WG members to the third half-day web-conference (3rd meeting) sometime in the second half of February or beginning of March. If an extra web conference was required, it would be decided during the second meeting and scheduled at the end of January - beginning of February 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00432>



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: In the Annual Declaration of Interest filled by Dr John Griffin, the following interests have been declared:

Dr Griffin declared that until his retirement in February 2019 he was the Head of the TSE and ABP Veterinary Division (SAT Division) in the Department of Agriculture Food and the Marine in Ireland which is classified by EFSA as a Public Institution. As Head of this Division Dr Griffin was responsible for the implementation of the measures set out in EU Regulation 999/2001 for the control and eradication of TSEs and the measures set out in EU Regulation 1069/2009 for the control of ABP. Dr Griffin was therefore performing risk management activities overlapping with the mandate of the EFSA scientific group in question. This constitutes a conflict of interest according to the above-mentioned rules on Competing Interest Management, thereby excluding the expert from participating in the BIOHAZ WG on ABP application (EFSA-Q-2019-00432) and resulting in the incompatibility with membership for two years after the activity is over.

Dr Griffin also declared that in 2018 he provided advice to the current applicant, the company College Proteins, for the evaluation of an alternative method for the production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3 animal by products (EFSA-Q-2019-00432). He provided advice to a representative of the abovementioned company at an early stage in the process with a view to enlightening her on the procedure and requirements for submitting an application for an alternative ABP method. He did this by going through the relevant legislation and the EFSA 2010 guidelines. The advice that Dr Griffin provided was in the context of his role as Head of the SAT Division of the Competent Authority in Ireland that deals with applications for alternative methods under Article 20 of EU Regulation 1069/2009. Therefore, the Competent Authority is required to provide such an advice as part of the EU legislative mandate. Dr Griffin indicated that he provided only advice on requirements for the structure of the application and submission procedure, while he did not have any role in the assessment of the application. According to Article 7(3) of the ED Decision on Competing Interest Management, EFSA considers the review, assessment and rating by experts of their own work as a conflict of interest incompatible with the experts' participation in these activities. In the present case, considering that the abovementioned application constitutes the main subject of the mandate, a conflict of interest is identified leading to the exclusion of Dr Griffin from participating in the BIOHAZ WG on ABP application (EFSA-Q-2019-00432), which will evaluate such an application. The same conclusion is reached even though Dr Griffin was provided only advice on requirements for the structure of the application and submission procedure the reason being that according to the said Decision the weight of the level of intensity of the interest is not required any longer.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁶, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted in accordance with Article 21 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.

Pursuant to Article 21(6) of the above-mentioned Decision, the concerned expert was allowed to take part in the discussion and in the drafting phase of the EFSA Scientific Opinion *"on the evaluation of an alternative method for production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3"*

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



animal by products", and has not been allowed to be, or act as, a chairman, a vice-chairman or rapporteur of the Working Group.



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS AND CONTAMINANTS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON “on the evaluation of an alternative method for production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3 animal by products”

Web-conference, 27 February 2020

(Agreed on 5 March 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Avelino Alvarez Ordóñez (Chair)
Olivier Andreoletti
Pablo Fernandez Escámez
John Griffin
Marion M. Simmons
John Spiropoulos
Giuseppe Ru
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
BIOCONTAM Unit: Sean Ashe, Katrin Bote, Angel Ortiz Pelaez.
- Others:

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Annual Declarations of Interest, please refer to the Annex. Oral Declaration(s) of Interest were asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 9 January 2020, Parma.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 9 January 2020 in Parma were agreed by written procedure on 17 January 2020⁴.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1. Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of an alternative method for production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3 animal by-products⁵

The chair and the WG reviewed the version circulated of the draft opinion including contributions received. There were no major discussions on the conclusions and recommendations although a certain rewording was conducted in abstract, summary, conclusions and recommendations. The secretariat informed the WG about the confidentiality claim.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-biohaz-ABP-biodiesel-fats.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00432>



6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting

This was the last meeting of this working group.



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: In the Annual Declaration of Interest filled by Dr John Griffin, the following interests have been declared:

Dr Griffin declared that until his retirement in February 2019 he was the Head of the TSE and ABP Veterinary Division (SAT Division) in the Department of Agriculture Food and the Marine in Ireland which is classified by EFSA as a Public Institution. As Head of this Division Dr Griffin was responsible for the implementation of the measures set out in EU Regulation 999/2001 for the control and eradication of TSEs and the measures set out in EU Regulation 1069/2009 for the control of ABP. Dr Griffin was therefore performing risk management activities overlapping with the mandate of the EFSA scientific group in question. This constitutes a conflict of interest according to the above-mentioned rules on Competing Interest Management, thereby excluding the expert from participating in the BIOHAZ WG on ABP application (EFSA-Q-2019-00432) and resulting in the incompatibility with membership for two years after the activity is over.

Dr Griffin also declared that in 2018 he provided advice to the current applicant, the company College Proteins, for the evaluation of an alternative method for the production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3 animal by products (EFSA-Q-2019-00432). He provided advice to a representative of the abovementioned company at an early stage in the process with a view to enlightening her on the procedure and requirements for submitting an application for an alternative ABP method. He did this by going through the relevant legislation and the EFSA 2010 guidelines. The advice that Dr Griffin provided was in the context of his role as Head of the SAT Division of the Competent Authority in Ireland that deals with applications for alternative methods under Article 20 of EU Regulation 1069/2009. Therefore, the Competent Authority is required to provide such an advice as part of the EU legislative mandate. Dr Griffin indicated that he provided only advice on requirements for the structure of the application and submission procedure, while he did not have any role in the assessment of the application. According to Article 7(3) of the ED Decision on Competing Interest Management, EFSA considers the review, assessment and rating by experts of their own work as a conflict of interest incompatible with the experts' participation in these activities. In the present case, considering that the abovementioned application constitutes the main subject of the mandate, a conflict of interest is identified leading to the exclusion of Dr Griffin from participating in the BIOHAZ WG on ABP application (EFSA-Q-2019-00432), which will evaluate such an application. The same conclusion is reached even though Dr Griffin was provided only advice on requirements for the structure of the application and submission procedure the reason being that according to the said Decision the weight of the level of intensity of the interest is not required any longer.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁷, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted in accordance with Article 21 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.

Pursuant to Article 21(6) of the above-mentioned Decision, the concerned expert was allowed to take part in the discussion and in the drafting phase of the EFSA Scientific Opinion *"on the evaluation of an alternative method for production of biodiesel from processed fats derived from category 1, 2 and 3*

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁷ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



animal by products", and has not been allowed to be, or act as, a chairman, a vice-chairman or rapporteur of the Working Group.