

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on the Risk for the development of Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics

(EFSA-Q-2015-00611)

**7 November 2016, Parma**

**(Agreed on 18 November 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Lieve Herman (Chair)

Björn Bengtsson

Damien Bouchard

Benno H. ter Kuile

Luke Randall

Bernd-Alois Tenhagen

John Wallace

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Ernesto Liebana Criado

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Eric Verdon.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Scientific topic**

#### **4.1. Development of resistance due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics<sup>3</sup>**

The Chair and EFSA Secretariat updated the members of the WG on the discussions resulting from the thorough reading of the draft opinion during the 108th Plenary meeting of the BIOHAZ panel held in Parma on 19-20 October. The members of the WG made a thorough reading of the Draft addressing comments made by experts from the BIOHAZ Panel and, for an specific section, also from experts of the AHAW Panel. This Opinion has been selected to evaluate and give feedback on the Draft for Internal Testing of the "Guidance on Uncertainty in EFSA Scientific Assessment" (EFSA Scientific Committee, 2016).

### **5. Next meetings**

This was the last meeting of the Working Group. The Opinion will be presented for Adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel at the 109<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting that will be held in Parma on 30 November-1 December.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00611>

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on the Risk for the development of Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics

(EFSA-Q-2015-00611)

**4-5 October 2016, Parma**

**(Agreed on 4 November 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Lieve Herman (Chair)

Björn Bengtsson

Damien Bouchard

Benno H. ter Kuile

Luke Randall

Bernd-Alois Tenhagen

John Wallace

Eric Verdon

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Andy Hart

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pietro Stella, Ernesto Liebana Criado

FEED Unit: Rosella Brozzi

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic**

### **4.1. Development of resistance due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics<sup>4</sup>**

The Chair and EFSA Secretariat updated the members of the WG on the discussions resulting from the first reading of the draft opinion during the 107th Plenary meeting of the BIOHAZ panel held in Brussels on 7-8 September. The experts were also informed about the main comments provided by the revision of the previous draft done by experts from the EFSA FEEDAP Panel, staff of the FEED Unit and partially by the EMA. The members of the WG discussed the different sections of the draft, made a thorough reading of the Draft, and focused on the options, conclusions and recommendations to prepare the draft for the thorough reading by the BIOHAZ Panel at their 108<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting (19-20 October). This Opinion has been selected to evaluate and give feedback on the Draft for Internal Testing of the "Guidance on Uncertainty in EFSA Scientific Assessment" (EFSA Scientific Committee, 2016). As requested by the Panel, a narrative approach for the uncertainty analyses was conducted supported by a hearing expert member of the EFSA Working Group on Uncertainty in Risk Assessment.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00611>

## **5. Next meetings**

The last meeting (Web-conference) of the working group is scheduled for 7 November 2016. If needed to, an additional Web-conference meeting will be held.

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on the Risk for the development of Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics

(EFSA-Q-2015-00611)

**14 September 2016, Web Conference**

**(Agreed on 03-10-2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Lieve Herman (Chair)

Björn Bengtsson

Damien Bouchard

Luke Randall

Bernd-Alois Tenhagen

John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Andy Hart

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Ernesto Liebana Criado

FEED Unit: Rosella Brozzi

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Eric Verdon, Benno H. ter Kuile.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic**

### **4.1. Development of resistance due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics<sup>4</sup>**

The Chair updated the members of the WG on the discussions resulting from the first reading of the draft opinion during the 107th Plenary meeting of the BIOHAZ panel held in Brussels on 7-8 September. Especially the discussions regarding the approach followed so far for the uncertainty analysis were communicated. The experts were also informed about the main comments provided by one of the two EFSA FEEDAP Panel experts who had been asked to revise the draft. The members of the WG discussed the different sections of the draft and decided to focus on the options and conclusions sections before the next physical meeting (4-5 October), in which also the pilot uncertainty analyses will be further conducted.

## **5. Next meetings**

The next physical meeting will be held on 4-5 October in Parma.

This meeting will be followed by a last Web-conference meeting scheduled for 7 November 2016.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00611>

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on the Risk for the development of Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics

(EFSA-Q-2015-00611)

**23 August 2016, Web Conference**

**(Agreed on 7 September)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Lieve Herman (Chair)

Björn Bengtsson

Damien Bouchard

Luke Randall

Benno H. ter Kuile

Eric Verdon

John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Andy Hart

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pietro Stella, Ernesto Liebana Criado

FEED Unit: Rosella Brozzi

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Bernd-Alois Tenhagen.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic**

### **4.1. Development of resistance due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics<sup>4</sup>**

The WG discussed the different sections of the draft opinion and the text re-organization needs, including the distribution of tasks, the contributions received, and the approach to scale/rank the uncertainties, following the advice of the hearing expert A. Hart. The Opinion will be presented for first reading at the 107<sup>th</sup> BIOHAZ Panel Plenary meeting to be held in Brussels (7-8 September 2016). Comments received from Panel members will be addressed during the next WG meeting.

## **5. Next meetings**

The next physical meeting will be held on 4-5 October in Parma.

This meeting will be followed by a last Web-conference meeting scheduled for 7 November 2016.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00611>

The possibility to hold an additional Web-Conference meeting at the end of September is currently being explored.

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the Risk for the development of Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics

(EFSA-Q-2015-00611)

**27 June 2016, Parma**

**(Agreed on 15 July)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Björn Bengtsson  
Lieve Herman  
Luke Randall  
Bernd-Alois Tenhagen  
Benno H. ter Kuile  
Eric Verdon  
John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Andy Hart

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pietro Stella, Ernesto Liebana Criado

FEED Unit: Rosella Brozzi

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Damien Bouchard.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic**

### **4.1. Development of resistance due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics<sup>4</sup>**

The WG discussed the different sections of the draft opinion and the text re-organization needs, including the distribution of tasks, the contributions received, main challenges and data gaps, and the need to scale/rank the uncertainties identified so far, following the advice of the hearing expert A. Hart. The Opinion had been presented at the BIOHAZ Panel Plenary meeting hold in Parma (8-9 June 2016). Comments received from Panel members were addressed during the WG meeting.

## **5. Next meetings**

The next meeting will be held via Web Conference on 23 August.

The additional meetings scheduled so far are: one additional physical meeting (4-5 October 2016) and one WEB-conference meeting (7

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00611>

November 2016). An additional Web-Conference meeting might be held according to the needs of the WG.

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on the Risk for the development of Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics

(EFSA-Q-2015-00611)

**Web conference 31 May 2016**

**(Agreed on 17 June 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Björn Bengtsson  
Damien Bouchard  
Lieve Herman  
Luke Randall  
Bernd-Alois Tenhagen  
Benno H. ter Kuile  
Eric Verdon  
John Wallace

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Wolfgang Trunk (DG SANTE)

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pietro Stella, Ernesto Liebana Criado

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Rosella Brozzi (FEED Unit).

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic**

### **4.1. Development of resistance due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics<sup>3</sup>**

The WG discussed the different sections of the draft opinion and the text re-organization needs, including the distribution of tasks, the contributions received, main challenges and data gaps and the need to identify and list uncertainties.

## **5. Next meetings**

The next meeting will be held on 27 June 2016 in Parma.

The additional meetings scheduled so far are: one additional physical meeting (4-5 October 2016) and two WEB-conference meetings (23 August and 7 November 2016). An additional Web-Conference meeting might be held according to the needs of the WG.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00611>

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on the Risk for the development of Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics

(EFSA-Q-2015-00611)

**Held on Parma, Italy, 18 April 2016**

**(Agreed on 13 May 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Björn Bengtsson  
Damien Bouchard  
Lieve Herman  
Luke Randall  
Bernd-Alois Tenhagen  
Benno H. ter Kuile  
John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Robin Simons  
Andy Hart

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Wolfgang Trunk (DG SANTE)

- **EFSA:**

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pietro Stella, Ernesto Liebana Criado

FEED Unit: Rosella Brozzi

## **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Eric Verdon (Working Group Member).

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic**

### **4.1. Development of resistance due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics<sup>4</sup>**

The Working Group clarified doubts on the terms of reference of the mandate with the European Commission. The WG discussed the different sections of the draft opinion, including the distribution of tasks, the allocation of section leaders, the contributions received, the main topics to be covered, the main challenges and data gaps. An existing model on the development of resistance in calves fed with waste milk was presented by Robin Simons (hearing expert). For this opinion, the current draft "Guidance on Uncertainty in EFSA Scientific Assessment", which is under EFSA internal evaluation, will be applied. During the meeting, support on this subject was provided by Andy Hart (hearing expert), member of the EFSA WG Uncertainty in Risk Assessment.

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00611>

## **5. Next meetings**

The next meeting will be held on 31 May 2016 via Web-Conference.

The additional meetings scheduled so far are: two additional physical meetings (27 June and 4-5 October 2016) and two WEB-conference meetings (23 August and 7 November 2016). An additional Web-Conference meeting might be held according to the needs of the WG.

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the Risk for the development of Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics

(EFSA-Q-2015-00611)

**Held on Parma, Italy, 22 February 2016**

**(Agreed on 18 March 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Björn Bengtsson  
Damien Bouchard  
Lieve Herman  
Luke Randall  
Bernd-Alois Tenhagen  
Benno H. ter Kuile  
Eric Verdon  
John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Wolfgang Trunk (DG SANTE)

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Pietro Stella, Ernesto Liebana Criado, Valentina Rizzi

## **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Rosella Brozzi (FEED Unit).

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topic**

### **4.1. Development of resistance due to feeding of calves with milk containing residues of antibiotics<sup>4</sup>**

The Working Group discussed the mandate and clarified the terms of reference of the request with the European Commission. A preliminary table of contents of the draft Scientific Opinion was presented and reviewed. A repository of relevant scientific documents obtained through a literature search was presented.

## **5. Next meetings**

The next meeting will be held on 18 April in Parma.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00611>

Two additional physical meetings (27 June and 4 October) and three WEB-conference meetings (31 May, 23 August, 7 November) have been already scheduled for 2016. An additional WEB-conference meeting will be held according to the needs of the WG.

## Document history

Document reference	Version 1
--------------------	-----------

Prepared by Beatriz Guerra
----------------------------

Reviewed by Lieve Herman
--------------------------

Last date modified 07.03.2016
-------------------------------