



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 25th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-CONFERENCE on the 28th November 2022

Agreed by written procedure on 9th December

- Working Group Members:
Virginie Michel (Chair)
Antonio Velarde
Anja Brinch Riber
Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich
Ingrid de Jong
Linda Keeling
Inga Tiemann

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno
Sean Ashe
Yves Van der Stede
Mariana Geffroy
Eléa Bailly-Caumette

- EC:
Kirsten Vornhagen

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 24th Working Group meeting held on the 7th and 8th of November, HYBRID.

The minutes of the 24th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21st of November 2022³.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

5.1 Scientific opinion: Cold stress

The Working group discussed the temperature at which chickens start to experience cold stress and agreed on conclusions for cold stress in broilers in mobile housing systems.

5.2 Scientific Opinion: Gait score as an ABM

The Working group discussed the use of gait score as an ABM for different welfare consequences (locomotory disorders and restriction of movement). The working group agreed on using walking impairment as ABM using the gait score as a means of measuring the walking impairment.

5.3 Scientific Opinion: AHAW Panel comments

The Working group discussed and addressed the comments and questions posed by the EFSA AHAW Panel during the thorough reading on the SO Broilers. The conclusions and recommendations were discussed and agreed for space allowance, light, maximum group size, the provision of nests and litter.

5.4 Scientific Opinion: Conclusions and recommendations

The Working group reviewed the major conclusions and recommendations for the minimal enclosure.

5.5 Retro planning and task allocation

The working group agreed that the draft of the scientific opinion on welfare of broilers is submitted to the AHAW Panel for possible adoption on the 145th AHAW Panel. The remaining tasks and deadlines were identified to deliver the scientific opinion on time for the adoption AHAW Panel.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-health/wq-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 24th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held HYBRID on the 7th and 8th November 2022

Agreed on 21st November 2022

■ Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel (Chair) (in-person)
Antonio Velarde (in-person)
Anja Brinch Riber (web)
Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich (in-person)
Ingrid de Jong (in-person)
Linda Keeling (in-person)
Inga Tiemann (in-person)

■ EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno (in-person)
Marika Vitali (web)
Michaela Hempten (in-person)
Yves Van der Stede (in-person)
Mariana Geffroy (in-person)
Eléa Bailly-Caumette (in-person)

MESE Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (web)

■ EC:

Kirsten Vornhagen (web)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting held on the 13th and 14th of October, HYBRID.

The minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21st October 2022³.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

5.1 ABMs at slaughter

The ABMs at slaughter were revised by the working group members to conclude on the final ABMs. Discussions about how these ABMs should be calculated, recorded and reported were made by the working group along with considerations of the current technologies used to measure these ABMs.

5.2 Scientific Opinion: Characteristics of the minimal enclosure and uncertainty assessment

The Working group discussed possible conclusions and recommendations for the characteristics of the minimal enclosure for broilers and broiler breeders. The working group discussed minimum and maximum group sizes for broilers and for broiler breeders, as well as the space of the enclosure to prevent highly relevant welfare consequences such as restriction of movement and soft tissue and integument damage. In broiler breeders a special emphasis was made on the sex ratio to prevent welfare consequences of inability to avoid unwanted sexual behaviour. In addition, equipment such as tiers, perches and nests and recommended dimensions and materials were discussed. The working group also discussed the characteristics of the outdoor range and the covered veranda for broilers.

5.3 Scientific Opinion: Heat stress

The working group revised and addressed the comments on the draft section of heat stress.

5.4 Scientific Opinion: Gastroenteric disorders

The working group addressed the comments on the draft section of gastroenteric disorders in broilers chickens in all husbandry systems.

5.5 Space allowance based on the behavioural approach

The behavioural approach to determine space allowance was revised and discussed by the Working group.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>

5.6 Scientific Opinion: Conclusion on minimum area and stocking density

The working group reached conclusions on the minimum area and stocking density that will prevent broilers and broilers breeding from experiencing several highly relevant welfare consequences.

5.7 Scientific Opinion: Impacts of genetics in broiler welfare

The working group discussed and agreed on the growing rates to determine if a certain broiler chicken belongs to the slower growing or fast-growing categories and how the genetics makes them more prone to certain welfare consequences.

5.8 Scientific Opinion: Comments by the AHAW Panel

The Working group discussed and addressed some pending comments and questions posed by the EFSA AHAW panel comments on the SO Broilers.

5.9 New structure of the scientific opinion

The new structure of the scientific opinion articulated by welfare consequence was discussed by the working group members. Comments were addressed and changes were made to improve consistency and readability. The new structure was approved by the working group.

5.10 Retro planning and task allocation

The remaining tasks and deadlines were identified to deliver the scientific opinion on time for the AHAW panel to revise the SO.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 28 of November 2022 by TELE-Conference.



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 23rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-CONFERENCE on the 13th and 14th October 2022

(Agreed on 21st October 2022)

■ Working Group Members:

Antonio Velarde (Chair)

Anja Brinch Riber

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Ingrid de Jong

Linda Keeling

Inga Tiemann

■ EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Marika Vitali, Sean Ashe, Mariana Geffroy, Yves Van der Stede

■ EC:

Kirsten Vornhagen

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Virginie Michel.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 22nd Working Group meeting held on the 20th of September, HYBRID.

The minutes of the 22nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 30th September 2022³.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

5.1 Scientific Opinion: Characteristics of the minimal enclosure and uncertainty assessment

The Working group discussed possible conclusions and recommendations for housing systems for broilers. At first they discussed group size, stocking density, and the minimal dimensions (height and surface) needed inside enclosures. Afterwards, the amount, type, size and characteristics of litter, nests, perches, feeders and drinkers were revised. Information about environmental characteristics like temperature, gases and light was also reviewed and discussed as well as the use of covered verandas, free range and their features.

5.2 Scientific Opinion: Conclusions and recommendations of general ToRs Broilers

The Working group addressed the comments on the conclusions and recommendations of the welfare consequence cold stress.

5.3 Scientific Opinion: Space allowance estimation

The working group agreed on the proposed approach to estimate space allowance. The allocated working group members will draft the methodology and results.

5.4 Scientific Opinion: ABMs at slaughter

The working group discussed the ABMs at slaughter to measure broiler welfare on farm. Mortality was the ABM discussed by working group members and the draft will be used to articulate the other ABMs at slaughter which are: footpad dermatitis, wounds and carcass condemnation. A deadline for a first draft was agreed.

5.5 Scientific Opinion: Comments by the AHAW Panel

The Working group discussed and addressed some of the comments and questions posed by the EFSA AHAW panel comments on the SO Broilers.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>

5.6 Retro planning and task allocation

The remaining tasks and deadlines were identified to produce timely the scientific opinion.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 7th and 8th of November 2022 in Parma.



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 22nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held HYBRID on 20th September 2022.

(Agreed on September 30th September)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel (Chair) (in-person)
 - Antonio Velarde (in-person)
 - Anja Brinch Riber (web)
 - Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich (web)
 - Ingrid de Jong (web)
 - Linda Keeling (web)
 - Inga Tiemann (web)

- EFSA:
 - BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Marika Vitali, Mariana Geffroy
 - MESE Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

- EC:
 - Kirsten Vornhagen

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting held on the 29th, 30th and 31st August, HYBRID.

The minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 13th September 2022³.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

5.1 Scientific Opinion – Comments by the AHAW Panel

The Working group discussed and addressed some of the comments and questions posed by the EFSA AHAW panel comments on the SO Broilers.

5.2 Scientific Opinion – Space allowance estimation

The working group discussed how to calculate space allowance for different behaviours considering interindividual space, depending on the amount of time broilers spend doing certain behaviours. The WG discussed how to standardize and select the relevant data.

5.3 Scientific Opinion: Characteristics of the minimal enclosure and uncertainty assessment

The Working group discussed possible conclusions and recommendations for housing systems for broilers.

5.4 Scientific Opinion: Conclusions and recommendations of general ToRs Broilers

The Working group addressed the comments on the conclusions and recommendations addressing the General ToRs in Broilers.

5.5 Scientific Opinion: ABMs at slaughter

Some working group members discussed ABMs at slaughter and were appointed to write the chapters depending on the selected ABMs.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 13th and 14th of October 2022.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 21st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held HYBRID on 29th, 30th, 31st August 2022

(Agreed on 13th September 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel (Chair) (in-person)
 - Antonio Velarde (in-person)
 - Anja Brinch Riber (in-person)
 - Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich (in-person)
 - Ingrid de Jong (in-person)
 - Linda Keeling (in-person)
 - Thea Van Niekerk (31st August, WEB, items 5.12 and 5.13)
 - Inmaculada Estevez (31st August, in-person, items 5.12 and 5.13)
 - Maryse Guinebretiere (31st August, in-person, items 5.12 and 5.13)
 - Bas Rodenburg (31st August, in-person, items 5.12 and 5.13)
 - Lars Schrader (31st August, items 5.12 and 5.13)
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Inga Tiemann (in-person), Christine Nicol (31st August, in-person, items 5.12 and 5.13), Stephanie Buijs (31st August, items 5.12 and 5.13)
- EFSA:
 - BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno (in-person)
 - Marika Vitali (in-person)

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/election.pdf

Michaela Hempen (in-person)
Yves Van der Stede (in-person)
Mariana Geffroy (in-person)

- EC:
Kirsten Vornhagen (web)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Stephanie Buijs and Lars Schrader for items 5.12 and 5.13.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 1st July, TELE-Conference.

The minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 4th August 2022⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Scientific Opinion – Conclusions and Recommendations of general ToRs Broilers

The Working group addressed the comments on the conclusions and recommendations addressing the General ToRs.

5.2 Scientific Opinion – Uncertainty Assessment

The working group identified hazards influencing welfare consequences. Levels of uncertainty were explored for two hazards.

5.3 Scientific Opinion: Specific scenario 1 a: The welfare of fast-growing chickens in barns and the risk associated with air and floor temperature

Comments in the narrative draft were provided and a plan was made.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-health/wq-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>

5.4 Scientific Opinion: Specific scenario 1b: The welfare of fast-growing chickens in barns and the risk associated with access to feed and water

Comments in the narrative draft were provided and a plan was made.

5.4 Scientific Opinion: Specific scenario 1c: The welfare of fast-growing chickens in barns and the risk associated with air quality

Comments in the narrative draft were provided and a plan was made.

5.5 Scientific Opinion: Specific scenario 3a: the welfare of broiler breeders and the risk associated with housing in (individual) cages

Comments in the narrative draft were provided and a plan was made.

5.6 Scientific Opinion: Specific scenario 3b: the welfare of broiler breeders and the risk associated with the practice of routine mutilation (beak trimming, detoeing, de-combing, de-clawing, ...)

Comments in the narrative draft were provided and a plan was made.

5.7 Scientific Opinion: Specific scenario 4: the welfare of day-old chick until they reach the rearing or breeding farms: hatchery conditions

Comments in the narrative draft were provided and a plan was made.

5.8 ABMs at slaughter (results of screening exercise)

The results of the screening filled by each expert individually were discussed in the group. The ranking of the scores according to the three criteria were discussed in the working group. Out of a list of initial 11 ABMs at slaughter, the Working group selected four ABMs at slaughter.

5.9 Comments by the EFSA AHAW panel on the SO

Some of the EFSA AHAW panel comments on the SO Broilers were discussed in the working group and addressed. The draft opinion will be presented to the AHAW panel on 21/22 September 2022. Possible adoption is planned for December 2022.

5.10 Scientific Opinion: Exercise on space allowance for broilers.

The new method of calculation of space allowance accounting for interindividual space was presented. The data extracted was revised.

5.11 Scientific Opinion – Timeline and retro-planning of the SO of the welfare of Broilers

The tasks were distributed amongst the experts to meet the expected deadlines.

5.12 Scientific Opinion: Data extracted for space allowance estimation for laying hens

The calculations for space allowance for laying hens based on selected behaviours were discussed. Tasks were assigned to verify extracted data from the scientific literature to inform the calculations.

5.13 Scientific Opinion: Discussion on definition/ characteristics of minimal enclosure

The WG discussed possible recommendations for housing systems for laying hens, pullets and layer breeders. This discussion will continue during the next meeting.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 20th September 2022.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 20th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 26th July 2022

(Agreed on 4th August 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel (Chair)
 - Antonio Velarde
 - Anja Brinch Riber
 - Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich
 - Ingrid de Jong
 - Linda Keeling
 - Thea Van Niekerk
 - Inmaculada Estevez
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Inga Tiemann
 - Christine Nicol
- EFSA:
 - BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno
 - Marika Vitali
 - Michaela Hempten
 - Yves Van der Stede
 - Mariana Geffroy

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/election.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Ingrid de Jong sent apologies in advance.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 1st July, TELE-Conference.

The minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 15th July 2022⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Scientific Opinion – Assessment of ABMs collected at slaughterhouses to monitor the level of welfare on broiler and laying hen farms

EFSA staff presented possible ABMs that could be collected at slaughterhouses ante-mortem and post-mortem to evaluate farm welfare. The proposed ABMs were subjected to a screening to four criteria: 1) had to be relevant to welfare, 2) directly related to the farm, 3) with existing literature sources and 4) also feasible to be measured at the slaughterhouse. If the ABMs fulfilled these criteria, they were retained for the next step of the assessment. Working group members voted yes/no, to decide which ones would be on the list to assess the level of welfare of laying hen and broiler farms.

5.1 Scientific Opinion – Pending items

The pending items that required Working group discussion were addressed.

5.2 Scientific Opinion – Planning of Specific scenarios 1, 2 and 4

The specific scenarios 1,2 and 4 were briefly presented and the deadlines were reminded to the working group.

5.3 Scientific Opinion – Timeline and retro-planning of the SO of the welfare of Broilers

This agenda item was not covered because of lack of time.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held from the 29th to the 31st of August 2022.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 19th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 1st July 2022

(Agreed on 15th July 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel (Chair)
 - Antonio Velarde
 - Anja Brinch Riber
 - Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich
 - Ingrid de Jong
 - Linda Keeling

- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Inga Tiemann (except for section 5.2)

- EFSA:
 - BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Linda Keeling sent apologies in advance.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one agenda item added on the estimation of space allowance.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/election.pdf

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting held on 9th June, TELE-Conference.

The minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 17th June 2022⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Scientific Opinion – Draft Opinion

Pending tasks were discussed and assigned to working group members.

5.2 Scientific Opinion – Conclusion and recommendations

The conclusions and recommendations were discussed, and the draft conclusions were agreed.

5.3 Scientific Opinion - Specific scenario 3: feed restriction of broiler breeders

This agenda item was not covered because of lack of time.

5.4 Scientific Opinion – Group stress

The text proposed during the WG laying hens meeting was discussed and agreed by the experts. The definition of the welfare consequence group stress has been changed accordingly.

5.5 Scientific Opinion- Estimation of space allowance

A short debrief was provided on the estimation of space allowance based on the new data extracted from literature. Interindividual space was accounted for in this estimation.

5.6 Timeline and retro planning of the Scientific Opinion of Broilers welfare

The experts agreed on the retro planning and responsibility allocation to timely produce the Scientific Opinion.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 26th July 2022.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 18th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 9th June 2022

(Agreed on 17th June 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel
 - Antonio Velarde
 - Anja Brinch Riber
 - Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich
 - Ingrid de Jong
 - Linda Keeling
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Inga Tiemann (except for section 5.1, 5.2)
- EFSA:
 - BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Michaela Hempen
- EC:
 - Kirsten Vornhagen

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Kirsten Vornhagen sent her apologies in advance.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/election.pdf

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 17 and 18th May 2022, Hybrid meeting (TELE-Conference and in-person).

The minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 26th May 2022⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Scientific Opinion – Conclusions and recommendations of welfare consequences in husbandry systems

The working group members discussed and addressed the pending comments on sections 3.5 to 3.15 of the SO. Tasks were distributed to the working group members.

5.2 Scientific Opinion – Group stress, definition, ABMs, conclusions, and recommendations

The working group drafted a nuanced definition of the group stress in broiler chickens highlighting its link with ABMs.

5.3 Scientific Opinion - Data extracted for space allowance estimation

The extracted data by the experts was presented and 11 behaviours were characterized as positive, negative and neutral. This task was distributed amongst the experts

5.4 Scientific Opinion - Presentation on the reporting of the EKE space allowance impact on Footpad dermatitis and % time walking

The report was presented, and final tasks were identified and distributed.

5.5 Scientific Opinion - Specific scenario 3: feed restriction of broiler breeders

The narrative text of the specific scenario 3 was presented. Conclusions and recommendations were agreed. The text will be finalized by the next meeting.

5.6 Timeline and retro planning of the Scientific Opinion of Broilers welfare

The experts agreed on the retro planning and responsibility allocation to timely produce the Scientific Opinion.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 1st July 2022.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 17th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held in Hybrid mode (in-person and Teleconference) on 17th and 18th May 2022

(Agreed on 26th May 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel (in-person, 17th and 18th May)
Antonio Velarde (in-person, 17th and 18th May)
Anja Brinch Riber (in-person, 17th and 18th May)
Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich (in-person, 17th and 18th May)
Ingrid de Jong (in-person, 17th and 18th May)
Linda Keeling (in-person, 17th and 18th May)
Werner Bessei (web, 17th and 18th May)
Maryse Guinebretiere (in-person, 18th May)
Lars Schrader (web, 18th May)
Inmaculada Estevez (web, 18th May)

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann (in-person, 17th and 18th May) (except for section 5.7, 5.9, 5.10, 5.11, 5.12)
Christine Nicol (in-person, 18th May) (except for section 5.7, 5.9, 5.10, 5.11, 5.12)
Stephanie Buijs (in-person, 18th May) (except for section 5.7, 5.9, 5.10, 5.11, 5.12)

■ EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Yves Van Der Stede, Michaela Hempten, Marika Vitali

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/election.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 6th May 2022, WEB meeting (TELE-Conference).

The minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 13th May 2022⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

Day 1

5.1 Scientific Opinion – Pending comments on Welfare consequences in day old chicks, broiler breeders and chickens kept for chicken meat in each of the ten husbandry systems (sections 3.5 to 3.15 of the SO)

The working group members discussed and addressed the pending comments on sections 3.5 to 3.15 of the SO.

5.2 Scientific Opinion – Presentation on narrative approach used to address Specific scenario 3 – Feed restriction in broiler breeders: Justification and conclusions and recommendations

The pending comments on Specific Scenario 3 were discussed and addressed.

5.3 Scientific Opinion – Presentation on the reporting of the EKE space allowance impact on Foot pad dermatitis and % time walking

The reports of the two EKES were presented and pending tasks were identified and planned to be finalized for the next meeting.

5.4 Scientific Opinion – Planning and progress of Specific Scenario 1: access to feed and water of day-old chicks

Tasks were allocated amongst the working group members and a time frame was agreed.

5.5 Scientific Opinion – Planning of Specific Scenario 3: routine mutilations of broiler breeders

Tasks were allocated amongst the working group members and a time frame was agreed.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-health/wq-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-O-2020-00479>

5.6 Timeline and retro planning of the Scientific Opinion of Broilers welfare

The experts agreed on the retro planning and responsibility allocation to timely produce the Scientific Opinion.

Day 2: Joint meeting with WG on the protection of laying hens

5.7 Scientific Opinions – Structure of the Conclusion & recommendations section by welfare consequence (either by animal category or by husbandry system) in Broilers and Laying Hens SO

The working group members agreed on structuring the section of conclusions and recommendations on welfare consequences of the broilers and laying hens Scientific Opinion by husbandry system and animal category.

5.8 Scientific Opinions – Presentation on the Space allowance in broilers and laying hens: ethogram approach and Expert Knowledge Elicitation (Broilers)

A presentation was provided on a tool used to calculate the space required to perform 11 behaviours (broilers and laying hens) based on data extracted from literature. The working group members agreed to identify additional data on positive welfare indicators to further fine tune the calculation of space allowance in broilers and laying hens. These results will complement the results reported in the EKE for the broilers under 5.3.

5.9 Scientific Opinions – Conclusions and Recommendations on Welfare consequences: 'Resting problems' and 'Exploratory and foraging behaviour': Discussion on pecking and scratching material and minimal size of perches for Broilers and Laying Hens

Working group members agreed to recommended elevated structures for all husbandry systems of broilers and laying hens.

5.10 Scientific Opinions – Conclusions and Recommendations on minimum space allowance outdoors (Covered veranda) for Broilers and Laying Hens

Working group members agreed to recommend a covered veranda for broilers and laying hens.

5.11 Scientific Opinions – Conclusions and recommendations on welfare consequence 'group stress' and the impact of group size for Broilers and Laying Hens

Group stress needs to be further discussed amongst the working group members.

5.12 Scientific Opinions – Conclusions and recommendations on Sensory under- and overstimulation for Broilers and Laying Hens

Due to lack of time this item was not addressed and will be addressed into the next joint meeting.

5.13 Scientific Opinions - Presentation on the Animal Based Measures collected in slaughterhouses to monitor the level of welfare

The approach was described and agreed upon the working group members and a timeline was identified.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 9th June 2022.



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 16th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 6th May 2022

(Agreed on 13th May 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Anja Brinch Riber
Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich
Ingrid de Jong
Linda Keeling
Werner Bessei

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann (except for section 5.1)

■ EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno, Yves Van Der Stede, Michaela Hempen

■ European Commission:

Kirsten Vornhagen

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/election.pdf

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one change. An item was added to explore an approach to estimate the minimum space allowance per broiler chicken.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 11th and 12th April 2022, Hybrid meeting (in-person / TELE-Conference).

The minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 22nd April 2022⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Scientific Opinion – Conclusions and Recommendations for the 19 Welfare consequences and related Animal Based Measures (section 3.4.2.2 to 3.4.2.21)

The working group members discussed and agreed on the conclusions and recommendations for each of the 19 welfare consequences.

5.2 Scientific Opinion – Welfare consequences in day old chicks, broiler breeders and chickens kept for chicken meat in each of the ten husbandry systems (sections 3.5 to 3.15)

The experts discussed the possible ways to present the conclusions and recommendations of the welfare consequences per husbandry systems and animal category. Two options were presented and discussed: structuring the welfare consequences per husbandry system and animal category and vice versa.

5.3 Scientific Opinion – approach to estimate the space allowance per broiler chicken

An approach to estimate the minimum space per broiler based on the space needed to perform each behaviour as per the normal ethogram was discussed and proposed by the experts as a complementary source of information to the EKE on space allowance in relation to the ABM Footpad dermatitis and % time walking.

5.4 SO: Retro planning of tasks and timeline of the Scientific Opinion of broilers welfare

The experts agreed on the retro planning and responsibility allocation to timely produce the Scientific Opinion.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 17th and 18th May 2022.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 15th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held in Hybrid mode (in-person and by TELE-conference) on 11th and 12th April 2022

(Agreed on 22nd April 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel (in-person)
 - Anja Brinch Riber (TELE-conference)
 - Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich (in-person)
 - Ingrid de Jong (in-person)
 - Linda Keeling (in-person)
 - Werner Bessei (TELE-conference)

- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Inga Tiemann (TELE-conference) (except for points 5.3, 5.4 and 5.5)

- EFSA:
 - BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno
 - BIOHAW Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Antonio Velarde Velasco sent his apologies for absence in advance.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/election.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda item "Conclusion and recommendations of sections on general welfare consequences (3.4.2.2 and 3.4.2.21) and sections on welfare consequences specific to the ten husbandry systems (3.5 to 3.15)" was added to the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 21st and 22nd March 2022, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 30th March 2022⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Scientific Opinion – Pending items of Section "3.4.2 Description of Welfare consequences identified as the most relevant ones in the context of broiler chickens and related Animal Based Measures" and Subsections 3.4.2.2 and 3.4.2.21

The experts addressed the pending comments in the abovementioned sections.

5.2 Scientific Opinion – Sections 3.5 to 3.15 Relevant welfare consequences for each of the 10 husbandry systems addressed in the SO

The experts discussed the structure of these subsections and addressed the pending comments.

5.3 Scientific Opinion – Conclusion and recommendations of sections welfare consequences 3.4.2.2 and 3.4.2.21 and 3.5 to 3.15 welfare consequences of the ten husbandry system

For sections welfare consequences and related ABMs (sections 3.4.2.2 to 3.4.2.21) and the welfare consequences of each of the ten husbandry systems (sections 3.5 to 3.15), the working group members agreed on the drafted conclusions and recommendations.

5.4 Scientific Opinion – Discussion on Specific Scenario 3. Feed restriction of broiler breeders - Conclusions and recommendations and the development of the argumentation to reach them

Based on a literature review, the experts drafted the argumentation supporting the draft conclusions and recommendations of the feed restriction of broilers (Specific Scenario 3).

5.5 Scientific Opinion- Status and next steps for Specific scenario 1: the welfare of fast-growing chickens in barns and the risk of space allowance. Conclusions and Recommendations of the two EKEs

The working group members agreed on the allocated tasks and deadlines proposed.

5.6 SO: Retro-planning of tasks and timeline of the Scientific Opinion of broilers welfare

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-O-2020-00479>

The experts agreed on the retro planning and responsibility allocation to timely produce the Scientific Opinion.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 6th May 2022.



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 14th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 21st and 22nd March 2022

(Agreed on 30th March 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Virginie Michel
 - Anja Brinch Riber
 - Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich
 - Ingrid de Jong
 - Linda Keeling
 - Werner Bessei
 - Julio Álvarez Sánchez

- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Inga Tiemann

- EFSA:
 - BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno
 - BIOHAW Unit: Denise Candiani
 - MESE Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Antonio Velarde Velasco sent his apologies for absence in advance.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/election.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one change. Agenda item 7 of the meeting on 21st March - Specific Scenario 1. In particular on: 1) air and floor temperature and 2) air quality was postponed to the next meeting. The duration of item 1 of the 22nd March "Scientific opinion – Pending issues on the sections 3.2 Production cycles and animal categories, 3.3 Husbandry systems per animal categories and 3.4.2 Description of the welfare consequences identified as the most relevant ones in the context of broiler chicken for meat production and related ABMs" was extended to two hours instead of one hour.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 14th February 2022, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 17th February 2022⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 EKE: Discussion on the results of the Expert Knowledge elicitation (EKE) for Specific Scenario 1

Based on the results of the EKE Specific scenario 1 - fast growing chicken/ variable - stocking density/ Animal Based Measures (ABM)- ABM 1) % Walking and ABM 2) footpad dermatitis (FPD), the Working Group members drafted preliminary conclusions and recommendations.

5.2. SO: Discussion on the Specific Scenario 3: The welfare of broiler breeders and the risks associated with feed restriction

The experts agreed on the narrative approach to address this part of the Specific Scenario 3. Based on an extensive literature review, the Working Group members drafted preliminary conclusions and recommendations.

5.3 SO: Discussion on the Scientific Opinion

The experts addressed the pending comments on the general Terms of Reference of the SO on the section dedicated to the Description of the welfare consequences identified as the most relevant ones in the context of broiler chicken for meat production and related ABMs.

The experts agreed on the retro planning and responsibility allocation to timely produce the Scientific Opinion.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 11th and 12th April 2022.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-health/wq-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS, ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 13th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 14th February 2022

(Agreed on 17th February 2022)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Anja Brinch Riber

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Ingrid de Jong

Linda Keeling

Hearing Experts¹:

Werner Bessei

Inga Tiemann

EFSA:

KNOW Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas

BIOHAW Unit: Cristina Rojo Gimeno

BIOHAW Unit: Denise Candiani

Others (attending the EKE discussion – item 4- via the EFSA Framework Contract on support services for Expert Knowledge Elicitation)

Hans-Hermann Thulke

Karen Laing

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

Laura Warin
Randi Opperman Moe

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one change. Initial item 4 Specific Scenario – Final decision on performing Expert Knowledge Elicitation (EKE) exercises on “feed restriction” & “access to feed and water” was postponed until the end of the EKE exercise.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 28th January 2022, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 3rd February 2022⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Discussion on the Expert Knowledge elicitation (EKE)

The evidence dossier supporting the upcoming EKE exercise for Specific scenario 1 - fast growing chicken/variable - stocking density/ Animal Based Measure (ABM)- %Walking was presented by Hans-Hermann Thulke. An agreement was reached on the articles and the related data to better reply to the four EKE questions. The EKE included four question to elicit the % of walking under different settings. A consensus was reached amongst the experts on the outcomes of the exercise.

5.2 Discussion on the Scientific Opinion

The experts agreed on the retroplanning and responsibility allocation amongst experts to timely produce the Scientific Opinion.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 21st and 22nd March 2022.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 12th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 28th January 2022

(Agreed on 3rd February 2022)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

Werner Bessei

EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas

ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

Others:

Hans-Herman Thulke (attending the EKE discussion – item 4- via the EFSA Framework Contract on support services for Expert Knowledge Elicitation)

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

Karen Laing (attending the EKE discussion – item 4 - via the EFSA Framework Contract on support services for Expert Knowledge Elicitation)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 20th December 2021, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21st December 2021⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Discussion on the Scientific Opinion

Section 3.4.2 was reviewed. The WG members agreed on adding an introductory text to all subsections related to the different selected welfare consequences (WC) describing the severity, duration, and prevalence of the WC. They also agree on adding a text including types of ABMs measures and sampling. The WG members agreed in a retro- planning on the tasks to be accomplished for the timely the adoption of the scientific opinion.

5.2 Discussion on the Expert Knowledge elicitation (EKE)

The draft evidence dossier supporting the upcoming EKE exercise for Specific scenario 1 - fast growing chicken/variable - stocking density/ Animal Based Measure (ABM)- %Walking was presented by Hans-Herman Thulke. Some actions on the need to retrieve additional data or to calibrate the regression model were discussed. An agreement was reached on the evidence dossier for Specific scenario 1 - fast growing chicken/variable - stocking density/ABM footpad dermatitis.

6. Next meeting

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>

The next meeting will be held on the 14th February 2022.



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 11th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 20th December 2021

(Agreed on 21st December 2021)

Participants

n Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

n Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

Werner Bessei (attending item 5.2)

Randi Oppermann Moe (attending item 5.2)

Laura Warin (attending item 5.2)

n EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas

ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

n Others:

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

Hans-Herman Thulke (attending the EKE discussion – item 5.2 - via the EFSA Framework Contract on support services for Expert Knowledge Elicitation)

Karen Laing (attending the EKE discussion – item 5.2 - via the EFSA Framework Contract on support services for Expert Knowledge Elicitation)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 12th November 2021, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 19th November 2021⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Discussion on the Scientific Opinion

Anja Brinch Riber presented to the working group an analysis on the latest scientific literature available on feed restriction for broiler breeders. The information provided will be further analysed by WG members at the next meeting to decide on the need for an EKE exercise on the Specific Scenario 3 for this mandate.

5.2 Expert Knowledge Elicitation (EKE) - Exercise

Olaf Mosbach-Schulz presented the Evidence Dossier for the EKE exercise on the Specific Scenario 1 related to Footpad dermatitis in relation to stocking density. The stocking density is expressed in kilograms per m² measured at the time of the assessment (up to five days before slaughter). For the evaluation of the FDP the average of a 3-level score within a flock is used. Step 1 of the EKE exercise - Median ABM under very high stocking density set to 30 – 42 kg/m² and Step 2: Low ABM under very high stocking density were facilitated by Olaf Mosbach-Schulz whereas Step 3: Median ABM with low stocking density and Step 4: Maximal stocking density without effect were facilitated by Hans-Herman Thulke.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 28th January 2022.



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 10th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 12th November 2021

(Agreed on 19th November 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas

ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

Others having attended the Expert Knowledge Elicitation discussion

Werner Bessei

Hans-Herman Thulke

Karen Laing

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 7th October 2021, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 18th October 2021⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

5.1 Discussion on the Scientific Opinion

An improved layout for the scientific opinion was agreed by the WG members. The different husbandry systems are presented at front followed by a section on the main welfare consequences identified and the related ABMs including also those applicable to more than one WC such as e.g. Stereotypic behaviour or Injurious pecking. The WG reviewed the text of the draft Scientific Opinion to ensure consistency. The WG members were requested to assess specific comments and finalise the description of all ABMs.

5.2 Discussion on the Expert Knowledge elicitation (EKE)

The results of the data extraction for exposure variable stocking density and ABM footpad dermatitis related to the specific scenario on fast growing chickens, were presented and discussed by WG members with an aim at finalising the EKE evidence dossier before the EKE exercise.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 20th December 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 9th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 7th October 2021

(Agreed on 18th October 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas

ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 8th September 2021, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 23rd September 2021⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

The WG was introduced to different aspects of the EKE methodology such as the evidence dossier template to be completed for each ABM as well as some common approaches for data extraction and data harmonisation. The WG members were requested to continue with the data extraction on the specific scenario for fast growing chickens. The latest versions of some ABM definitions, their measurement, interpretation, sensitivity, and specificity were discussed and agreed.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 12th November 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 8th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 8th September 2021

(Agreed on 23rd September 2021)

Participants

n Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

n Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

Ana Granados

Gerard Leveque

n EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 7th July 2021, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 16th July 2021⁴.

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Ms Ana Granados and Mr Gerard Leveque were invited to present their views for item 4 – Broiler breeders - discussion on the feedback from EFFAB (European Forum of Farm Animal Breeders) on individual and collective cages- of the present meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA invited Ms Ana Granados and Mr Gerard Leveque to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. Their participation in the present meeting was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group (i.e. not possible to draft or be involved in the discussion or the adoption of a scientific output), in accordance with the applicable legal framework⁷.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁸

Several aspects related to broiler breeders rearing practises, and including information on collective and individual cages, were presented by the two EFFAB hearing experts and further discussed by the WG members. ABMs found to be relevant for different welfare consequences, husbandry systems and animal categories were analysed by the WG to reach an agreement on a common term (e.g. mortality, walking, dust bathing or wounds) and on their measurement, interpretation, sensitivity, and specificity concepts. The outcomes of the exercise performed by the WG members to extract ABMs related to the exposure variable "stocking density" from literature was presented. From the exercise, the WG concluded to proceed with the extraction of data for 3 ABMs (i.e. footpad dermatitis, walking with mortality as additional factor). The WG members were requested to continue with the drafting of the

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁷ Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, Article 9:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁸ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>

description of the ABMs in the scientific opinion as well as other sections, in accordance with the latest agreements.

7. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 7th October 2021.



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 7th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 8th July 2021

(Agreed on 16th July 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas

ALPHA Unit: Yves van Der Stede

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 27th May 2021, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 10th June 2021⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

The WG members agreed on the interpretation for the four points to be covered when describing an ABM under different animal categories and husbandry systems. These are: definition, measurement, interpretation, sensitivity, and specificity. When an ABM is first described in the Scientific Opinion, this same definition will be used if this ABM is mentioned again in the document. However, measurement, interpretation, sensitivity, and specificity concepts may require some adaptations under different animal categories and/or husbandry systems. From the analysis on scientific literature, the WG members will extract some data on ABMs related to the exposure variable "stocking density". This will help with the preparatory work to perform the agreed EKE exercise on specific scenario 1 to reply to this mandate. The WG members were requested to continue with the drafting of the different sections of the scientific opinion in accordance with the latest agreements.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 8th September 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 6th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 27th May 2021

(Agreed on 10th June 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas

ALPHA Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 23rd April 2021, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 5th May 2021⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

The WG members reached an agreement on the common terms to be used in the scientific opinion for all ABMs and hazards under the main WCs. For the WC gastroenteric disorders, the group identified the need to further explore the possibility to divide this WC in two different ones. This will allow to differentiate between disorders consequent to infectious disease and those from e.g. metabolic disorders. From the introduction to the model recently developed by EFSA providing quantitative thresholds on welfare, and also from a preliminary discussion on data available in literature for the specific scenarios, the WG identified the need to perform four EKE exercises to reply to this mandate. Two hearing experts will be selected to support with these exercises. The WG members were requested to continue with the drafting of the different sections of the scientific opinion in accordance with the latest agreements on its layout.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 8th July 2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 5th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 23rd April 2021

(Agreed on 5th May 2021)

Participants

n Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

n Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

n EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 12th March 2020, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 18th March 2021⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

To avoid repetition, some aspects on the layout of the scientific opinion were discussed by the WG such as, to allocate the main welfare consequences (WCs) at an upper level to be referred to when describing the different floor husbandry systems (HS). The WG members agree to take a final decision on the layout once the scientific opinion is more advanced. Multitier systems in floor husbandry systems for broilers for meat will be described in the scientific opinion as a separate section under floor systems for broiler chickens. The WG members agreed on common terms for ABM and hazards under the respective WCs. These terms and related definitions should be considered when drafting the scientific opinion.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 27th May 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 4th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 12th March 2021

(Agreed on 18th March 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas, Denise Candiani

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 5th February 2021, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 15th February 2021⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

The WG members revised the most updated version of draft scientific opinion including the latest contributions on the description of husbandry systems and main welfare consequences (WCs). Some common approaches in the layout were agreed to avoid repetition; (i) a detailed description on main welfare consequences will be provided at the level of the husbandry system where they are first described, and to refer to this first description when the same WC is relevant for other subsequent systems, also (ii) to create a separate section in the scientific opinion for non-system specific WCs such as prolonged hunger, so that it is described only once. With the support of the EFSA facilitator, the WG members discussed the proposed Expert Knowledge Elicitation (EKE) model approach to assess the relationship between exposure variables and the corresponding ABMs. The different specific scenarios from the terms of reference were introduced to the WG members as well as the methodology proposed to retrieve literature and to collect quantitative data, if available. The WG members agreed on a common approach to be followed for each specific scenario: (i) after a first exercise to ascertain if sufficient quantitative data is available in literature on the various exposure variables for the identified ABS, (ii) the WG members may propose to perform an EKE to retrieve expert knowledge on scenarios where the data retrieved is scarce.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 23rd April 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 5th February 2021

(Agreed on 15th February 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas, Denise Candiani

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 15th December 2020, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21 December 2020⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

The WG members revised the welfare consequence on "soft tissues lesions" and proposed to add integument damages in the title and definition to be presented for agreement at the EFSA AHAW Task Force. After finalising the first part of the welfare consequences ranking exercise for one the husbandry system on broiler breeders pending from the previous meeting, and with the support of the EFSA facilitator, the WG members conducted the final part of this exercise for all ten broiler husbandry system selected. This exercise consisted in i) combining the individual rankings from all WG members in a single file ii) discussion and final ranking for those welfare consequences where the assessment among members differ significantly ii) reaching an agreement on the clearly relevant (highest ranked) welfare consequences per husbandry system iii) providing a justification for their selection by expert's opinion on duration, severity and occurrence. During the last part of the meeting, the description on the main broilers husbandry systems provided by EFSA Broilers WG members was discussed. Some changes were suggested to be implemented before the next meeting, as well as the description of all welfare consequences under the respective systems.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 14th March 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 2nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 15th December 2020

(Agreed on 21 December 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Ingrid de Jong

Hearing Experts¹:

Inga Tiemann

EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas, Denise Candiani, Michele Ardizzone

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Sabine Gebhardt-Henrich.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 11th November 2020, TELE-conference.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 23 November 2020⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁵

The first part of the meeting was held jointly with the members of the EFSA laying hens WG; i) the list of welfare consequences, revised by the EFSA AHAW Task Force, was presented and some amendments were proposed e.g. to incorporate predation stress, ii) the methodology to rank and identify the most relevant welfare consequences per husbandry system was explained and iii) and a full example to apply this methodology was conducted for one husbandry system. During the second part of the meeting, for all the remaining broilers husbandry systems, the EFSA Broilers WG performed the first part of the ranking exercise. This consisted in excluding the non-applicable welfare consequences for these systems and preparing the basis for ranking the relevant ones. Relevance is to be assessed by expert's opinion following judgement on duration, severity and occurrence of welfare consequences in those husbandry systems.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 5th February 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-health/wg-welfare-farmtofork-welfare-broilers.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2020-00479>



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

MINUTES OF THE 1st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON WELFARE OF BROILERS

Held by TELE-conference on 11th November 2020

(Agreed on 23 November 2020)¹

Participants

Working Group Members:²

Virginie Michel (Chair)

Linda Keeling

Anja Brinch Riber

Sabine Gebhardt- Henrich

Ingrid de Jong

Hearing Experts³:

Inga Tiemann

EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Raquel Garcia Matas, Denise Candiani, Michele Ardizzone

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁶

The first part of the meeting was held jointly with the members of the EFSA WG Laying Hens where the mandate on broiler and laying hens welfare on farm was presented in the context of the Farm To Fork Strategy. During the second part, the common terms of reference and specific scenarios were discussed. The list of welfare consequences with the definitions suggested by the Task Force was reviewed and suggestions will be considered at the next Task Force meeting. It was agreed that the relevant animal categories are day-old chick, chickens for meat production and broiler breeders. The husbandry systems were defined for the animal categories. The experts will list 5 relevant welfare consequences per each husbandry system by 27th November and when these are approved by the Task Force, they will start drafting the descriptions of the husbandry systems and the welfare consequences for the common terms of reference.

5. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on the 15th December 2020

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2020-00479>