

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 10 11/11/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 19/02/2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
 - Sandra Edwards
 - Cathy Dwyer
 - Fabio Napolitano
- **EFSA:**
 - Animal and Plant Health Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 17 18/09/2014.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The comments from the public consultation process were checked and considered in the draft scientific opinion when relevant. The draft scientific opinion was finalised in order to prepare for possible adoption during the December AHAW Plenary meeting.

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 17 18/09/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
 - Sandra Edwards
 - Cathy Dwyer
 - Fabio Napolitano
- **EFSA:**
 - Animal and Plant Health Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 28/07/2014.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The draft scientific opinion was revised and completed in preparation of the public consultation process, occurring from 24th September till the 5th November 2014.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the next WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

10-11/11/2014, physical meeting in Parma

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on webconference on 28/07/2014
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
 - Fabio Napolitano
- **EFSA:**
 - Animal and Plant Health Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo, Sandra Edwards and Cathy Dwyer.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 16/07/2014.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.2 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The WG discussed tables and graphical representations for the outcomes of the online questionnaire as well as the outcomes of the meeting with hearing experts, held on 26 June.

6. Any Other Business

6.2 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the next WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

17-18/09/2014, physical meeting in Parma

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on webconference 16/07/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
 - Sandra Edwards
 - Cathy Dwyer
 - Fabio Napolitano
- **EFSA:**
 - Animal and Plant Health Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 10/07/2014 in Madrid.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.3 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The state of drafting of the opinion was reviewed and task for completing the draft opinion were allocated.

6. Any Other Business

6.3 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the next WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

28/07/2014, webconference

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

10/07/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair participated, on behalf of the working group, to a meeting in Spain at Interovic, a Spanish organisation for sheep and goat farming recognised by the Spanish government.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests⁸, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 26 27/06/2014 in Parma.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.4 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair presented the mandate received by the European Commission and the methodology for its development. Preliminary outcomes of the on-line “Questionnaire on the main welfare problems for sheep for wool, meat and milk production” were presented.

6. Any Other Business

6.4 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the twelfth WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

16/07/2014, webconference

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 26 27/06/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
 - Sandra Edwards
 - Cathy Dwyer
 - Fabio Napolitano
- **Hearing experts:**
 - Gustavo Maria Levrino
 - George Fthenakis
 - Dinu Gavojdian
 - Gerogios Arsenios
 - David Henderson
 - Huw Davies
 - Lindsay Matthews
 - Antonello Cannas
 - Alison Small
 - Luc Mirabito
- **EFSA:**
 - Animal and Plant Health Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests¹⁰, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 3 4/06/2014 in Parma.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.5 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

A technical meeting with hearing experts was held on the 26th June 2014. The Chair summarised the mandate and the actions carried out for its development. In particular, the outcomes of the on-line "Questionnaire on the main welfare problems for sheep for wool, meat and milk production" were presented, where the main welfare consequences for sheep kept in different management systems were defined. A discussion about the main risk factors leading to those welfare consequences was held, following a previous questionnaire that was distributed to the participants of the meeting. Consensus was reached about such main risk factors.

On the second meeting day, the WG produced and discussed new text for the scientific opinion based on the outcomes of the technical meeting.

6. Any Other Business

6.5 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the next WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

10 07 2014, Antonio Velarde in Madrid

⁹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

¹⁰ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 3-4/06/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
 - Sandra Edwards
 - Cathy Dwyer (on web-conference)
- **EFSA:**
 - Animal and Plant Health Unit: Maria Ferrara, Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo and Fabio Napolitano and, by Cathy Dwyer and Hans-Hermann Thulke on the second day.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests¹², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

¹² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 12/05/2014 in Parma.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.6 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair summarised the actions carried out since the last WG meeting and in particular the state of replies received to the on-line “Questionnaire on the main welfare problems for sheep for wool, meat and milk production”, launched on 7 May.

The WG discussed the methodology to analyse the questionnaire’s replies and performed assessment and analysis of the replies so far received. The organisation and objectives of the meeting with hearing experts, to be held on 26 June, were also discussed.

Finally, the state of drafting of the opinion was reviewed.

6. Any Other Business

6.6 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the twelfth WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

26-27/06/2014, physical meeting in Parma

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 12/05/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Fabio Napolitano
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
- **EFSA:**
 - Animal and Plant Health Unit: Maria Ferrara, Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo, Cathy Dwyer and Sandra Edwards.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹³ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests¹⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

¹⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 23-24/04/2014 in Parma.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.7 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair summarised the actions carried out since the last WG meeting and in particular the state of replies received to the on-line “Questionnaire on the main welfare problems for sheep for wool, meat and milk production”, launched on 7 May.

The on-line survey aims at identifying, based on experts opinion, the main welfare consequences in terms of prevalence and amount of suffering they cause to sheep. As follow-up to the survey, the WG discussed the methodology to gather experts’ knowledge on the main risk factors, associated to the identified welfare consequences, through a technical meeting with hearing experts to be held on 26 June. The WG discussed the criteria and profile to identify such hearing experts.

6. Any Other Business

6.7 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the eleventh WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

3-4/06/2014, physical meeting in Parma

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 23-24/04/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

• **Working Group Experts:**

- Antonio Velarde (Chair)
- Cathy Dwyer
- Sandra Edwards
- Mohan Raj
- Fabio Napolitano

• **EFSA:**

- Animal and Plant Health Unit: Maria Ferrara

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo and Hans-Hermann Thulke

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests¹⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

¹⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 26-27/03/2014 in Dublin.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.8 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair introduced the new expert, Dr Fabio Napolitano, appointed as member of the WG, and summarised the objectives of the mandate and the state of play of the draft opinion.

With the inputs of the new expert, the WG reviewed the description of the management systems covered by the draft opinion. Following the inputs received by two testers, the WG further discussed and reviewed the draft questionnaire to gather experts' knowledge on the prevalence and importance of main welfare consequences for ewes and lambs.

The WG also discussed the profiles and criteria to identify the experts to be contacted to reply to the questionnaire.

Finally the WG discussed the structure of the draft opinion and the state of play of the drafting.

6. Any Other Business

6.8 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the tenth WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

12/05/2014, physical meeting in Parma

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 26-27/03/2014, Dublin
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

• **Working Group Experts:**

- Antonio Velarde (Chair)
- Cathy Dwyer
- Sandra Edwards
- Hans-Hermann Thulke

• **EFSA:**

- Animal and Plant Health Unit: Maria Ferrara

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo and Mohan Raj.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held by web-conference on 18/03/2014.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair summarised the actions agreed and carried out since the seventh WG meeting. Given the lack of quantitative data, the WG further discussed and agreed on the methodology to gather experts' knowledge on the prevalence and importance of the welfare consequences for ewes and lambs, identified by the WG for the different management systems. At this end, the WG started the drafting of the questionnaire to be launched electronically over the month of May.

The WG also decided to appoint an additional member in the group, with specific expertise on sheep welfare and Mediterranean sheep production.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the ninth WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

23-24/04/2014, physical meeting in Parma

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

WEB-conference, 18/03/2014
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

• **Working Group Experts:**

- Antonio Velarde (Chair)
- Mohan Raj
- Cathy Dwyer
- Sandra Edwards
- Hans-Hermann Thulke

• **EFSA:**

- Animal and Plant Health Unit: Maria Ferrara

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 4/03/2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.2 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair summarised the actions agreed and carried out since the sixth WG meeting. The WG further discussed the methodology to identify the main welfare consequences for sheep in the different management systems, through experts' knowledge.

6. Any Other Business

6.2 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the eight WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

26-27/03/2014, physical meeting in Dublin

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

WEB-conference, 4/03/2014
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

• **Working Group Experts:**

- Antonio Velarde (Chair)
- Mohan Raj
- Cathy Dwyer
- Sandra Edwards
- Hans-Hermann Thulke

• **EFSA:**

- Animal and Plant Health Unit: Maria Ferrara

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented by Mariano Domingo

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 3-6/02/2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.3 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair summarised the actions agreed and carried out since the fifth WG meeting. The WG discussed the methodology to identify the main welfare consequences for sheep in the different management systems. In particular, given the lack of quantitative data on prevalence and importance of welfare consequences in the different management systems, the WG explored methodologies to gather experts' knowledge on this.

In the frame of the EFSA Framework Contract on literature reviews OC/EFSA/SAS/2012/01 and as follow-up to the mapping of literature performed by the contractor, the WG also discussed which topic could be further evaluated through a systematic literature review process.

6. Any Other Business

6.3 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the seventh WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

18/03/2014, web-conference

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 3-6/02/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 02/10/2014)

Participants

• **Working Group Experts:**

- Antonio Velarde (Chair)
- Mohan Raj
- Cathy Dwyer
- Sandra Edwards
- Mariano Domingo
- Hans-Hermann Thulke

• **Hearing Experts:**

- Lindsay Matthews
- Xavier Roura

• **EFSA:**

- Animal and Plant Health Unit: Maria Ferrara

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Hearing experts were invited to attend only the first day of meeting. Apologies were presented on the second day by Cathy Dwyer, Sandra Edwards and Mariano Domingo

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests⁸, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 14/01/2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02/10/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 03/10/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.4 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair summarised the actions agreed and carried out since the fourth Working Group (WG) meeting. He introduced the hearing experts and explained the objectives of their participation to the meeting.

The WG together with the hearing experts further discussed the definitions of the selected management systems for sheep as well as the characteristics of the main breed typologies that will be considered in the risk assessment scenarios.

The WG discussed the first draft report of the systematic literature review on sheep welfare, being carried out by an external contractor in the frame of the EFSA Framework Contract on literature reviews OC/EFSA/SAS/2012/01.

Finally, the WG discussed the methodology to identify the main welfare consequences for sheep in the different management systems.

6. Any Other Business

6.4 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the sixth WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

4/03/2014, web-conference

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 14/01/2014, Parma
(Agreed on 29/01/2014)

Participants

• **Working Group Experts:**

- Antonio Velarde (Chair)
- Mohan Raj
- Cathy Dwyer
- Sandra Edwards
- Mariano Domingo

• **Hearing Experts:**

- Lindsay Matthews

• **EFSA:**

- Animal and Plant Health Unit: Maria Ferrara

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Hans-Hermann Thulke

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 19/12/2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 09/01/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 13/01/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair summarised the actions agreed and carried out since the third WG meeting. He introduced the hearing expert and explained the objectives of his participation to the meeting.

The Working Group (WG) together with the hearing expert further discussed the definitions of the selected management systems for sheep as well as the characteristics of the main breed typologies that will be considered in the risk assessment scenarios.

Moreover, the WG discussed and tested the draft scoping questions prepared by the contractor who is carrying out a systematic literature review on sheep welfare, in the frame of the EFSA Framework Contract on literature reviews OC/EFSA/SAS/2012/01.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the fifth WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

3-6/02/2014, physical meeting in Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

**Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep**

**WEB-conference, 19/12/2013
(Agreed on 09/01/2014)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Cathy Dwyer
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
 - Mariano Domingo

- **EFSA:**
 - Animal Health and Welfare Unit: Maria Ferrara

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Sandra Edwards.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 28-29/11/2013, Parma.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 09/01/2014 and published on the EFSA website on 13/01/2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair summarised the actions agreed and carried out since the second WG meeting.

The Working Group (WG) further discussed the definitions of the selected management systems for sheep and revised the draft conceptual model identifying welfare consequences and risk factors. Moreover, it was agreed as next step to link those consequences and factors to the selected management systems.

The WG also discussed and prepared for the forthcoming kick-off meeting with the external contractor that will carry out a systematic literature review on sheep welfare, in the frame of the EFSA Framework Contract on literature reviews OC/EFSA/SAS/2012/01.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the fourth WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

14/01/2014, physical meeting in Parma

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep

Held on 28-29/11/2013, Parma
(Agreed on 09/01/2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Cathy Dwyer
 - Mariano Domingo
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
 - Sandra Edwards

- **EFSA:**
 - Animal Health and Welfare Unit: Maria Ferrara

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Sandra Edwards and Hans-Hermann Thulke attended only the first day of the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 05/11/2013, WEB-conference.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 13/11/2013 and published on the EFSA website on 28/11/2013.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

Following the methodological approach agreed at the kick-off meeting, the WG discussed the scenarios for the risk assessment. In particular the main management systems for sheep for wool, meat and milk production to be considered as part of the scenarios, were agreed and defined as well as the main breed grouping that were linked to the relevant management systems. In this regard and according to EFSA's administrative procedures, the WG agreed to consult additional external experts on the elements and definitions of the agreed systems.

The WG discussed and developed a first conceptual model, identifying welfare consequences and related risk factors, following the principles and criteria developed by the Welfare Quality® project.

The WG discussed the state of play of the ongoing EU-funded research project *Animal Welfare Indicators* (AWIN) as well as the roadmap for the development of the draft opinion.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the third WG meeting.

7. Next meeting

19/12/2013, web-conference

ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT

**Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare
Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Welfare of Sheep**

**WEB-conference, 05/ 11/2013
(Agreed on 13 11 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Antonio Velarde (Chair)
 - Mohan Raj
 - Cathy Dwyer
 - Hans-Hermann Thulke
 - Mariano Domingo

- **EFSA:**
 - Animal Health and Welfare Unit: Maria Ferrara

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Sandra Edwards.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00580](#))

The Chair introduced the members of the Working Group (WG), the background of the mandate and its terms of reference that were thoroughly discussed.

The WG reflected on the methodological approach to follow on the basis of the EFSA Guidance on Risk Assessment for Animal Welfare. Given the broad scope of the mandate, discussions focused on defining the target population, the elements of the exposure scenarios and on how to identify risk factors and welfare consequences for sheep for wool, meat and milk production.

The WG agreed, as first step, to start defining the welfare consequences for sheep and, as second step, to identify the factors leading to those consequences and relate them to the corresponding scenarios. The principles and criteria developed by the Welfare Quality® project will be used as a framework to start identifying, from sheep's physiology, the welfare consequences in a structured way. Furthermore, the WG agreed on the possibility to consider both negative and positive welfare consequences for the main factors as well as on the need to consider concrete factors for the defined scenarios.

As regard the definition of the scenarios, the WG agreed to group the relevant sheep breeds by their main typologies and characteristics within management systems which should be defined as precisely as possible.

As regard data availability, the WG discussed available sources of information including the ongoing EU-funded research project *Animal Welfare Indicators (AWIN)*. Moreover, the WG agreed to include in the group an additional expert on sheep welfare.

5. Any Other Business

5.1 Tasks and deadlines

Tasks and deadlines were agreed in preparation of the second WG meeting.

6. Next meeting

28-29/11/ 2013, physical meeting