

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 4th Working Group on Animal-based measures (ABMs) gap analysis

By WEB-conference, on 30th of July 2015

(Agreed on 16 December 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Sandra Edwards
- Linda Keeling
- Hans Spooler
- Hans Hermann Thulke (from 9.00 to 11.00)
- Antonio Velarde

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- ALPHA Unit: Chiara Fabris, Francesca Porta

- **Others:**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 13 July 2015, WEB-conference

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting, held on 17 June 2015, and the 3rd Working Group meeting, held on 8 - 9 - 10 July 2015, were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1. EFSA's internal project on "The use of animal-based measures to assess animal welfare in the EU – state of art of the last 10 years of activities and analysis of the gaps"⁵

Discussion of the outcomes of the extended WG meeting held in Parma the 8th – 9th – 10th of July 2015.

The main results of the project have been assessed: the structure of the Technical report and of the main points to be addressed have also been discussed.

6. Next meeting

Not Applicable.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/assets/ABMswg.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00148>

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Animal-based measures (ABMs) gap analysis

Held on 08, 09, 10 July 2015, Parma (IT)

(Agreed on 30 July 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Sandra Edwards
- Linda Keeling
- Hans Spoolder
- Hans-Hermann Thulke (08th and 09th)
- Antonio Velarde

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Bracke Marc (left on the 9th at 4.30 pm)
- Buijs Stephanie
- Correia Maria Jorge
- Canali Elisabetta
- Dalla Villa Paolo
- Dippel Sabine
- Garcia Rebeca
- Gibbons Jenny
- Heath Cheryl
- Kirchner Marlene Katharina
- Leeb Christine

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- Minero Michela
 - Mikus Tomislav
 - Mounier Luc (left on the 10th at 10.00 am)
 - Napolitano Fabio
 - Stilwell George
 - Stoddart Katja
- **European Commission:**
 - Cassidy Terence – FVO
 - Cavitte Jean-Charles – DG-AGRI (09th and 10th)
 - **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Chiara Fabris, Francesca Porta, Marianne Carlson, Mattews Watts, Denise Candiani, Andrea Gervelmeyer, Franck Berthe
 - DATA Unit : Luca Pasinato (on the 09th pm and the 10th)
 - **Others:**
 - University of Padova (IT) - Department of Animal Medicine, Production and Health (MAPS): Marta Brscic, Barbara Contiero, Flaviana Gottardo
 - Cartoonbase (BE): Luc de Brabandere

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. EFSA's internal project on "The use of animal-based measures to assess animal welfare in the EU – state of art of the last 10 years of activities and analysis of the gaps"⁴

EFSA's perspective and needs with regard to the use of ABMs to perform risk assessment of animal welfare have been presented and discussed.

A new approach to look at, and to think about, ABMs (thinking in new boxes) has been presented. The experts extensively discussed how to apply it to ABMs' scientific topics.

The results of the preparatory work on ABMs gaps' identification and analysis have been presented and discussed in detail. In particular the main gaps that have been discussed regarded the following questions:

- "Why do welfare scientists not standardise ABM terminology and measures?"
- "Why have welfare scientists still not provided the tools that users need?"
- "Why don't welfare scientists know more about the essential attributes of the ABM's they use?"
- "Why have ABMs not been more frequently taken up and standardised in practice outside welfare science?"

The experts discussed which relevant actions should be needed in order to fill the identified gaps and improve the use of ABMs among all the stakeholders.

5. Next meeting

July, 30th 2015 – Working Group members web-meeting.

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00148>

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Animal-based measures (ABMs) gap analysis

By WEB-conference, on 17th of June 2015

(Agreed on 30 July 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Sandra Edwards
- Linda Keeling
- Hans Spoolder
- Antonio Velarde

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- ALPHA Unit: Chiara Fabris, Francesca Porta
- DATA Unit : Luca Pasinato (only from 9.45 to 10.30)

- **Others:**

- University of Padova (IT) - Department of Animal Medicine, Production and Health (MAPS): Marta Brscic, Barbara Contiero, Flaviana Gottardo (from 10.15).

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 22 May 2015, WEB-conference

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 22 May 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1. EFSA's internal project on "The use of animal-based measures to assess animal welfare in the EU – state of art of the last 10 years of activities and analysis of the gaps"⁵

The results and the draft report of the preparatory work on ABMs gaps' identification and analysis have been presented and discussed in detail.

The structure of the July WG meeting extended to hearing experts has been also discussed: agenda, list of participants, presentations for the

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/ahawwgs/docs/ABMswg.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00148>

discussion sessions and the main results of the preparatory work that would be more relevant to focus on.

6. Next meeting

July, 8-10th 2015 – physical meeting in Parma extended to hearing experts.

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on ABMs gap analysis

By WEB-conference, 22nd of May 2015

(Agreed on 17 June 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Linda Keeling
- Hans Spoolder
- Hans-Hermann Thulke
- Antonio Velarde

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- ALPHA Unit: Chiara Fabris
- DATA Unit : Luca Pasinato

- **Others:**

- University of Padova (IT) - Department of Animal Medicine, Production and Health (MAPS): Marta Brscic, Barbara Contiero, Flaviana Gottardo (physically attenders).

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Sandra Edwards.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. EFSA's internal project on "The use of animal-based measures to assess animal welfare in the EU – state of art of the last 10 years of activities and analysis of the gaps"⁴

Background, objectives and approach of the EFSA's internal project have been presented.

The proposals for addressing the objectives of the procurement for the preparatory work have been presented and discussed in detail:

- Sources identification within the five areas of interest (EU-funded projects, peer-reviewed papers, quality assurance schemes, EU-legislative acts and EU-training initiatives)
- Methodologies for assessing how the concept and the use of ABMs have penetrated the AW community in the EU (five areas of interest)
- Gaps' identification: data model, data extraction and gap analyses (EU-funded projects, peer-reviewed papers, quality assurance schemes).

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00148>

Comments received by e-mail on these items in preparation of the meeting have been discussed and addressed.

Peer-reviewed papers to be considered in the study were identified by applying a codified literature search protocol and filtering for “animal welfare” firstly and “animal-based measures” (and synonyms), secondly. It was suggested to repeat the search by making the first search broader and disentangling the word “welfare” from the word “animal”. A scoping exercise of the literature will be repeated and the number of records resulting will be compared to the results of the previous search. The data models have been considered very thorough, and the variable “country” has been considered nonfundamental information to be collected and analysed. It was suggested to highlight that the aim of the project regards mainly “the use of the concept of ABMs”, whereas the gap identification and following analysis will regard both the concept of ABMs and specific ABMs.

The results of the gaps’ identification will be discussed at the next WG meeting.

5. Next meeting

June, 17th 2015– web-meeting