



**MINUTES OF THE 28TH PLENARY MEETING OF
THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS
HELD IN PARMA ON 13 AND 14 DECEMBER 2006**

AGENDA:

- 1 Opening, apologies for absence
- 2 Adoption of the agenda
- 3 Declarations of interest
- 4 Official requests to EFSA
 - 4.1 Presentation of new mandates received from the Commission
 - 4.2 Organization of Working Groups
- 5 Discussion and possible adoption of opinions
 - 5.1 Cattle SRM related back-calculations
 - 5.2 BSE in fishmeal
 - 5.3 Quantitative Risk Assessment for residual BSE risk in sheep
 - 5.4 BSE batch testing
- 6 Progress reports and discussion on the following mandates
 - 6.1 Update on QRA tallow opinion diverging with opinion of BFR/FLI
 - 6.2 ABP: Progress on process applications received
 - 6.3 Update GBR methodology public consultation
 - 6.4 Public health risks on consumption of reptile meat
 - 6.5 Microbiological criteria and targets based on analysis
 - 6.6 Revision of the opinion on microbiological risks in infant formulae
 - 6.7 QMRA on *Salmonella* in slaughter and breeding pigs
 - 6.8 MRA on *Salmonella* in meat and meat preparations
- 7 Discussion on self tasking suggestions
 - 7.1 Antimicrobial resistance self mandate
 - 7.2 EFSA's suggestions
- 8 Feed back from the Scientific Committee and from other WG
- 9 AOB
 - 9.1 Risk factors for human infection with Avian Influenza A H5N1, Vietnam
 - 9.2 Foodborne transmission of Nipah virus, Bangladesh
 - 9.3 EFSA's 5th Anniversary
- 10 Closure of the meeting

PARTICIPANTS

Panel Members:

Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, Pierre Colin, John D Collins, Aline De Koeijer, Arie Havelaar, James Hope, Günter Klein, Simone Magnino, James McLauchlin, Karsten Noeckler, Birgit Noerrung, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Terence Roberts, and Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Bart Goossens, Fulvio Barizzzone, Paolo Calistri, Tobin Robinson, Eirini Tsigarida, Didier Verloo (Scientific Staff); Angela Cohen, Cristiana Ventura (Administrative staff).

European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumer Protection: Taina Sateri (telephone conference).

1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from Olivier Andreoletti, John Griffin, Hilde Kruse, Antonio Martínez López, Christophe Nguyen-The and Ivar Vågsholm.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no new declarations of interest.

4. OFFICIAL REQUESTS TO EFSA

4.1. PRESENTATION OF NEW MANDATES RECEIVED FROM THE COMMISSION

The following new mandates were received from the European Commission:

4.1.1. REVIEW OF TSE TESTING PROTOCOLS

A mandate was received from the EC to review the current protocols for the laboratory evaluation and field trials for TSE testing¹. The first Working Group (WG) meeting will be held on 17 January. The deadline for the mandate is 1 March 2007.

4.1.2. BSE RELATED RISK OF BOVINE INTESTINES AFTER PROCESSING INTO NATURAL SAUSAGE CASINGS

EFSA is requested to evaluate the design and the conclusions of a study on quantitative histological studies of bovine small intestines before and after processing into natural casings. In addition EFSA is requested, if considered possible based on the report and any other new relevant scientific information, to re-assess the BSE related risk of bovine intestines after processing into natural sausage casings. The study was circulated to the Panel. The deadline for the mandate is 1 April 2007.

4.2. ORGANISATION OF WORKING GROUPS

A Chair was appointed and WG members were proposed for item 4.1.2 on natural sausage casings.

5. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF OPINIONS

5.1. CATTLE SRM RELATED BACK-CALCULATIONS

The draft document was discussed. The WG will meet on 8 January to discuss and integrate the experimental pathogenesis and epidemiology sections of the opinion. The opinion will be presented for possible adoption at the January Plenary.

5.2. BSE IN FISHMEAL

The document will be presented for possible adoption at the January Plenary.

¹ www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/tse_assessments/bse_tse/612.html
www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/tse_assessments/bse_tse/560.html
http://ec.europa.eu/food/fs/sc/ssc/out300_en.pdf

5.3. QUANTITATIVE RISK ASSESSMENT FOR RESIDUAL BSE RISK IN SHEEP

The WG met on 1 December. The opinion will be finalised by the WG and presented for possible adoption at the January Plenary.

5.4. BSE BATCH TESTING

The WG on “Batch Testing of approved *post-mortem* BSE tests” met on 4 December. The Chair gave a progress report on the draft opinion. Amendments were made and the document was further discussed towards the end of the Plenary on 14 December. The Secretariat will send the document to the Panel members for adoption by written procedure.

6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES

6.1. UPDATE ON QRA TALLOW OPINION CONCERNING THE DIVERGING OPINION WITH BFR/FLI

There was nothing further to report since the last Plenary.

6.2. ABP: PROGRESS ON PROCESS APPLICATIONS RECEIVED

6.2.1. Treatment of animal by-products in mesophilic biogas fermenters

The first meeting of the WG was held on 17 November.

6.3. UPDATE GBR METHODOLOGY PUBLIC CONSULTATION

The draft opinion² was placed on EFSA’s website for public consultation on 21 November. Comments are invited from the public until 14 January 2007. The document is expected to be ready for final adoption at the March Plenary.

6.4. PUBLIC HEALTH RISKS ON CONSUMPTION OF REPTILE MEAT

The WG will have its first meeting on 7 February.

6.5. MICROBIOLOGICAL CRITERIA AND TARGETS

A short report was given on the WG meeting of 22 November. EFSA formally agreed to extend the deadline to March 2007.

² www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/biohaz/biohaz_consultations/gbr_methodology.html

6.6. REVISION OF THE OPINION ON MICROBIOLOGICAL RISKS IN INFANT FORMULAE

The WG met on 16 November. The Chair of the WG gave an interim report on the draft document. The Panel agreed that the scope of the work will be limited to the existing Terms of Reference (ToR). The document will be presented for possible adoption at the January Plenary.

6.7. QMRA ON *SALMONELLA* IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS

The WG met on 12 December and considered how to address the ToR. The Chair of the WG outlined the approach envisaged by the WG. Some aspects of the work may be outsourced later on under the terms of Article 36. EFSA will write to the EC to request an extension to the deadline for the mandate.

6.8. MRA ON *SALMONELLA* IN MEAT AND MEAT PREPARATIONS

The WG met on 12 December. The Chair reported that a preliminary review of the ToR was made. The WG will look at different food chains and request data from various meat associations. The WG set its work plan until May 2007 and also discussed the difference between this mandate and item 6.7. concerning *Salmonella* in pigs.

7. DISCUSSION ON SELF TASKING ACTIVITIES

7.1. ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE SELF MANDATE

The ToR of a self-tasking mandate on foodborne antimicrobial resistance as a biological hazard were revised following comments collected at the November Plenary. Further comments were suggested and the ToR will be updated and circulated to the Panel members for approval.

7.2. EFSA'S SUGGESTIONS

Several suggestions for EFSA's mandates to the Panel were made. The topics were discussed and EFSA will prepare the mandates to the Panel accordingly. Further suggestions were made by Panel members for later consideration.

8. FEEDBACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WG

The Scientific Committee (SC) will meet on 14-15 December³.

³ www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/sc_committee/sc_meetings.html

8.1. AHAW - PIG WELFARE

There was nothing to report since the last Plenary.

8.2. AHAW - FISH WELFARE

The AHAW WG on Fish Welfare had met on previous occasions. The WG on Fish Welfare meeting of 27 November was the first to be attended by a BIOHAZ member, since safety aspects were discussed. Six fish species are currently being looked at and a draft report is in preparation.

8.3. QUALIFIED PRESUMPTION OF SAFETY - QPS

The SC intends to endorse the draft opinion and submit it for public consultation in 2007.

8.4. TRANSPARENCY

The Chair outlined a draft response to a request received from the SC concerning the Panel's approach to transparency when formulating its Opinions. A WG meeting will be held in January and the Panel members were invited to send any queries to the Chair.

8.5. EMERGING RISKS

The SC requested a list of emerging risks⁴ in the domain of each Panel. The WG on Emerging Risks will meet on 15 December.

8.6. RESPONSE TO URGENT SCIENTIFIC QUESTIONS

The Panel was requested to consider how urgent scientific questions are addressed.

8.7. EXPERT PER DIEMS

Following concerns expressed by members of various Panels, the Executive Director is reviewing reimbursement issues such as the per diem paid to experts.

⁴ Definition of emerging risks can be found in the Opinion of the Scientific Committee related to the early identification of emerging risks (adopted on 4 July 2006)
www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/sc_committee/sc_opinions/sc_op_ej375_emrisk.html

9. AOB

9.1. THE RISK FACTORS FOR HUMAN INFECTION WITH AVIAN INFLUENZA A H5N1, VIETNAM

Articles on Avian Influenza and related issues were brought to the attention of the Panel for information.⁵

9.2. EFSA'S 5TH ANNIVERSARY CELEBRATIONS

It was brought to the Panel's attention that celebrations will take place in Week 47 in Brussels to mark EFSA's 5th year. The BIOHAZ Panel agreed to have a one day Plenary in Brussels during this period.

10. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

The meeting closed at 13.30.

⁵ Risk factors for human infection with Avian Influenza A 5N21, Vietnam, 2004. Emerging Infectious Diseases, Vol 12 No 12, December 2006