



Brussels, 9<sup>th</sup> September 2004

**MINUTES OF THE 9<sup>th</sup> PLENARY MEETING OF  
THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS  
Held in Brussels on 8<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> of September 2004**

**AGENDA:**

---

1. Welcome
2. Apologies
3. Adoption of the agenda
4. Presentation by Dr Stan Bailey: *Salmonella* in Free Range and Organic Chicken
5. Official requests to EFSA
  - 5.1 Mandate received by the COM on biological risk vis-à-vis heat treatment of manure
6. Discussion and possible adoption of the following mandates:
  - 6.1 The use of antimicrobials to control *Salmonella* in poultry
  - 6.2 The use of vaccines to control *Salmonella* in poultry
  - 6.3 Microbiological risks in infant foods
  - 6.4 Freezing of cold tolerant strains of *Trichinella* and *C.bovis*
7. Progress reports and discussion on the following mandates:
  - 7.1 *Campylobacter* in animals and foodstuffs
  - 7.2 *Bacillus* in foodstuffs
  - 7.3 *Clostridium* in foodstuffs
  - 7.4 Revision of meat inspection for beef
  - 7.5 Risk assessment of *C. bovis*
  - 7.6 Risk assessment of *Trichinella*
  - 7.7 BSE risk related to stunning
  - 7.8 Quantitative risk assessment related to residual BSE risk in certain animal derived products.
  - 7.9 Evaluation of the BSE situation in Portugal (mandate from France).
  - 7.10 Animal By-products
  - 7.11 Safety vis-à-vis biological risk of biogas and compost treatment standards of ABP.
8. Feed-back by the Chairman on subjects discussed in the SC of interest to the Panel
9. Feed-back by Panel members attending working groups of other panels
  - 9.1 Welfare aspect of laying hens
  - 9.2 Avian influenza
  - 9.3 Rift Valley Fever
10. Risk Assessment-Risk Management Interface Report
11. Information from DG Research
12. Discussion on self tasking issues
13. AOB
14. Closure of the meeting

**MINUTES OF THE 9th PLENARY MEETING OF  
THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS**  
Held in Brussels on 8<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> September 2004

---

**PARTICIPANTS**

Panel Members:

Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, Pierre Colin, John D. Collins, Christian Ducrot, James Hope, Günter Klein, Hilde Kruse, Ernst Lücker, Simone Magnino, Riitta Liisa Maijala, Antonio Martínez López, Christophe Nguyen-The, Birgit Noerrung, Servé Notermans, George-John Nychas, Maurice Pensaert, Terence Roberts, Ivar Vågsholm, Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch and Mac Johnston.

Apologies

Ernst Lücker (9<sup>th</sup>); Pierre Colin (9<sup>th</sup>); . Christian Ducrot (9<sup>th</sup>)

EFSA

Marta Hugas, Wolfgang Gelbman, Shamila Nair, Pia Mäkela, (Scientific Staff)  
Angela Cohen, Radika Potier (Administrative staff)

Commission

DG Health and Consumer Protection: J-C Cavitte (8<sup>th</sup> September), T. Sateri  
DG RTD: Paul Vossen (9<sup>th</sup> September)

---

**1. WELCOME**

The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming everybody.

**2. APOLOGIES**

There were no apologies.

**3. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

There were no Expressions of Interest declared.

**4. PRESENTATION BY DR STAN BAILEY: *SALMONELLA* IN FREE RANGE AND ORGANIC CHICKEN**

Dr Bailey (United States Department of Agriculture), presented a comprehensive overview of the types of poultry production and *Salmonella* status of free range and organic chicken in the USA.

## **5. OFFICIAL REQUESTS TO EFSA**

### **5.1. Mandate received by the COM on biological risk vis-à-vis heat treatment of manure**

EFSA is asked to assess processing methods suggested by Member States (BE, FR, NL, FI) differing from the Regulation (EC) No. 1774/2002 (laying down health rules for the collection, transport, storage, handling, processing and uses or disposal of animal by-products not intended for human consumption). Member States claim that these standards are too stringent and thus have submitted data suggesting that different processing standards used by the industry meet the desired microbiological standards for resulting products set in the legislation. EFSA is asked to evaluate if the proposed heat treatment process would achieve equivalent level of microbiological standards and risk reduction as the process set in this Regulation. If not, what other process may achieve equivalent level of microbiological standards and risk reduction. The Chairman of the working group on Animal By-Products agreed to take over this mandate. Similar questions on “biogas and compost treatment” are already being dealt with by this WG.

## **6. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**

### **6.1. The use of antimicrobials to control *Salmonella* in poultry**

The draft document, which had been amended taking into account the comments made by the Panel members at the last plenary meeting, was presented. The document was discussed thoroughly and commented on, focusing on the conclusions and recommendations as well as the summary.

### **6.2. The use of vaccines to control *Salmonella* in poultry**

The draft opinion was presented to the Panel. The Chairman of the working group presented the draft document as amended since the last discussion. The Panel considered the conclusions and recommendations as well as the summary.

Following discussion it was agreed to send both draft opinions (6.1 and 6.2) to the Advisory Group on Antimicrobial Resistance of the Committee for Veterinary Medicinal Products (CVMP) for their scientific comments. Both drafts will be tabled for adoption at the next plenary meeting, when the feed-back received from CVMP will also be considered.

### **6.3. Microbiological risks in infant foods**

The Chairman of the working group presented the draft document as amended since the last discussion and in particular the Conclusions and Discussion section. The members of the Panel complimented the working group on the comprehensive draft presented and then considered the entire document. The panel discussed the present guidelines and recommendations for vulnerable groups. The opinion was unanimously adopted, subject to minor editorial changes to be made by the Chairman of the working group and the secretariat. It was agreed that the final document, once finalised, would be circulated for information to the members of the Panel.

#### 6.4. Freezing of cold tolerant strains of *Trichinella* and *C.bovis*

The draft opinion was distributed and introduced by the rapporteur through a presentation on the current legislation in force with regard to freezing as well as on the scientific evidence on the known cold resistant species of *Trichinella*. The Chairman outlined the limited literature available on this particular subject and discussed the contents of the draft document.

With respect to cold resistant species of *Cysticercus bovis*, a working group meeting including a new expert will be scheduled for October. The Panel agreed to revisit the opinion when finalised for both genera.

### 7. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES:

#### 7.1. *Campylobacter* in animals and foodstuffs

This working group had their third meeting on the 9th July. The Chair of the working group described the progress made on the opinion. The draft will be presented for the first time to the plenary in October for information and discussion. A draft opinion will be presented at the December plenary for possible adoption.

#### 7.2. *Bacillus* in foodstuffs

The Chairman of the working group briefed the panel on the draft document. Discussions revolved around the different species and taxonomy, the amount of bacterial cells ingested versus toxins emitted to cause disease. A draft opinion for information and discussion will be presented at the October plenary.

#### 7.3. *Clostridium* in foodstuffs

The working group had their second meeting on the 17th August. The Chairman described the progress made on the draft document. A draft opinion for information and discussion will be presented at the October plenary.

#### 7.4. Revision of meat inspection for beef

The Chairman of the working group provided feedback on the progress made with the draft document. The identification of lymph nodes as key indicators of potential *Mycobacterium bovis* infection, and the use of antigen tests for *Taenia saginata* cysticerci detection, monitoring and surveillance were discussed. A draft opinion for information, discussion and possible adoption will be presented at the October plenary.

#### 7.5. Inspection of slaughter animal in areas with low prevalence of *C. bovis* in veal calves

The working group had a meeting on the 31st August. The Chairman briefed the plenary on the progress made. The draft opinion will identify the contributing risk factors on the farm. The correct terminology now established for *C. bovis*, i.e. *Taenia saginata* cysticerci, will be used.

#### **7.6. Inspection of slaughter animal in areas with low prevalence of *C. bovis* in pigs**

The Chairman presented the progress made with addressing the ToR and the draft document. Discussions revolved around the costs of testing and analysis, and the associated safe guards to ensure an adequate level of service is maintained.

#### **7.7. BSE risk related to stunning**

The Chairman of the working group mentioned that the next working group meeting will be on September 13, 2004. At the next plenary meeting on October 20 - 21, it is proposed to present a draft opinion.

#### **7.8. Quantitative risk assessment related to residual BSE risk in certain animal derived products.**

The chairman of the WG described the progress made at the last working group meeting held on July 9, 2004, where DNV gave a presentation on the calculations carried out which are based on the assumptions made in the "Dormont report". DNV replied to the questions as were formulated by the members of the panel during the April plenary. The DNV representative is invited to attend the BSE working group meeting on 19 Oct 2004, when a completed merged report (DNV calculation plus "Dormont report") will be presented.

#### **7.9. Evaluation of the BSE situation in Portugal (mandate from France).**

The Chairman of the working group informed the panel about the initial discussion at the first working group meeting held on August 17, 2004. So far, Portugal has sent some information and declared in principle its willingness for collaboration. Following the working group meeting, a letter requesting additional information has been sent to Portugal.

#### **7.10. Animal By-products**

- Safety vis-à-vis biological risk of biogas and compost treatment standards of ABP.

The Chairman of the WG briefed the panel about the progress of questions currently being dealt with by the ABP working group. At the last meeting on August 16, 2004, the general outline structure (*viz.* process, hazard identification, process validation, conclusions) of the reports, as well as rapporteurs and time schedule, were agreed.

### **8. FEED-BACK BY THE CHAIRMAN ON SUBJECTS DISCUSSED IN THE SC OF INTEREST TO THE PANEL**

The Chairman reported on the last meeting of the Scientific Committee. Discussions included the future of EFSA in Parma, the advisory forum, stakeholders meetings and their involvement. [http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/sc\\_committee/sc\\_meetings/638\\_en.html](http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/sc_committee/sc_meetings/638_en.html)

#### **Feed-back by Panel members attending working groups of other panels**

##### **8.1. Welfare aspects of laying hens**

The BIOHAZ panel member involved in this working group briefed the members on the progress made with the current draft report. The BIOHAZ Panel will adopt the part of the

mandate dealing with the microbiological safety of eggs in respect of the different laying systems.

### **8.2. Avian influenza**

The BIOHAZ panel member involved in this working group briefed the members on the progress made with the current draft report.

### **8.3. Rift Valley Fever**

The BIOHAZ panel member involved in this working group briefed the members on the progress made with the current draft report. Public health aspects will be considered in addition to current meat inspection systems. A second Panel member was appointed to deal, together with the current member, with the public health aspects of the mandate.

### **8.4. Exposure Assessment**

The BIOHAZ panel member involved in this working group briefed the members on the progress made to-date with the current draft report.

## **9. RISK ASSESSMENT-RISK MANAGEMENT INTERFACE REPORT**

During the July plenary, a survey report form was distributed by the secretariat to the panel members together with the request to provide feed-back for the Scientific Committee before the 1<sup>st</sup> of September, 2004. Four reports were received and sent to the Scientific Committee.

## **10. INFORMATION FROM DG RESEARCH**

A representative from DG Research (RTD) (European Commission), presented information on projects funded by DG RTD with respect to food safety issues and outlined the current interfacing between EFSA and EC funded research. The panel was pleased to be informed that EFSA reports/opinions are systematically screened for recommendations on research topics. Future calls for proposals on food safety issues and conferences were also presented.

## **11. DISCUSSION ON SELF TASKING ISSUES**

This item was deferred for discussion at the next plenary.

## **12. AOB**

The secretariat briefed the panel on the practicalities and travel arrangements to be undertaken for the next plenary meeting in Parma.

Prof H. Budka presented an overview on three recent publications on TSE/BSE topics: first about an article from Legname/Prusiner in *Science* on synthetic mouse prions and secondly the article "Preclinical vCJD after blood transfusion in a PRNP codon 129 heterozygous patient" (Peden et al., 2004; *Lancet*). Additionally an outline of histopathological and molecular biological findings of an atypical BSE case in Italy showing an unusual distribution of PrPsc were presented. The panel appreciated Prof. Budka's presentation.

### **13. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was closed at 17.45.