

**SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON  
PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES**  
2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting on methodologies in  
assessing PPP long-term toxicity and carcinogenicity.



30 September 2024 (14:00-18:00)  
MINUTES – Agreed on 18 October 2024

**Location:** Web-conference

**Attendees:**

- **Working Group Members:**

Martin Wilks (Chair), Susanne Bennekou, Francesca Metruccio

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Denise Bloch (BfR) (14:00-18:00)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

None

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Peer Review (PREV) Unit: Mathilde Colas  
Methodology and Scientific Support (MESE) Unit: Isabelle Delaunois, Elisa Aiassa

- **Others:**

None

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the WG members and the hearing expert, Denise Bloch. Meeting participants briefly introduced themselves.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

The ADoI of Susanne Bennekou has been resubmitted for a new interest and is under assessment at EFSA level.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



## 4. Hearing expert

Denise Bloch was invited as hearing expert to share her expertise and comments on the draft protocol. Denise Bloch is employed in the German Federal Institute for Risk Assessment (BfR) and has recognised expertise and is the author of several publications in the field of regulatory toxicology, pesticide risk assessment and New Approach Methodologies-based risk assessment, in particular in the area of mixtures and coformulants. Based on her expertise in regulatory toxicity and pesticide risk assessment, as well as her relevant publications on the topic, Denise Bloch was invited to provide comments on the draft protocol.

## 5. Protocol refinement

The draft protocol was updated in real-time based on the working group's discussion.

The WG revisited the discussion on the problem formulation, specifically the types of components present in PPP to be included in the scope.

Furthermore, an overview of the search results was presented to the WG, detailing the number of studies retrieved using the following search terms.

The WG also refined the list of relevant endpoints, grouped by lines of evidence.

Finally, discussions focused on the data model and creation of the systematic evidence map. The proposed data model would serve as the foundation for creating an evidence map (i.e., a dynamic, interactive database of studies). The map will be structured in a table format, with selected variables used to classify the studies. For example, a key variable might be the lines of evidence with attributes such as *in vitro*, *in vivo*, etc.

## 6. Any Other Business

### 6.1. Agreement on action points

Action points were distributed among the WG experts with the aim of providing a clean version of the draft protocol by 11 October.

The protocol will then be shared with the PPR Panel reviewers for 1-week proof reading. Comments from PPR Panel reviewers will then be available to the WG for the third WG meeting.

### 6.2. Next WG meeting

Next WG meeting is planned on 22 October 2024 by teleconference.

**SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON  
PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES**  
1<sup>st</sup> Working Group meeting on methodologies in  
assessing PPP long-term toxicity and carcinogenicity.



20 September 2024 (11:00-18:00)  
MINUTES – Agreed on 4 October 2024

**Location:** Web-conference

**Attendees:**

- **Working Group Members:**

Martin Wilks (Chair), Susanne Bennekou, Francesca Metruccio

- **Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:**

Denise Bloch (BfR) (11:00-18:00)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

None

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Peer Review (PREV) Unit: Mathilde Colas  
Methodology and Scientific Support (MESE) Unit: Isabelle Delaunois, Elisa Aiassa

- **Others:**

None

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the WG members and the hearing expert, Denise Bloch. Meeting participants briefly introduced themselves.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

The ADoI of Susanne Bennekou has been resubmitted for a new interest and is under assessment at EFSA level.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



## **4. Hearing expert**

Denise Bloch was invited as hearing expert to share her expertise and comments on the draft protocol. Denise Bloch is employed in the German Federal Institute for Risk Assessment (BfR) and has recognised expertise and is the author of several publications in the field of regulatory toxicology, pesticide risk assessment and New Approach Methodologies-based risk assessment, in particular in the area of mixtures and coformulants.

## **5. Presentation on mandate's ToRs and draft protocol**

EFSA introduced the mandate from the European Parliament to conduct a scientific literature review of the available methodologies to assess the long-term toxicity and carcinogenicity of pesticide products, including those resulting from interactions in the product. The background information and the terms of references (ToRs) were presented to the experts. More specifically, the regulatory context, the work already carried out by EFSA and an overview of the timeline and steps applicable to this mandate were outlined.

## **6. Discussion on problem formulation & interpretation of ToRs**

The WG reviewed the draft protocol, updating the document in real-time based on the discussion.

The discussion focused on several key aspects, including the interpretation of the mandate's terms of reference, which encompasses the inclusion of both primary and secondary research studies. Additionally, the WG examined the scope of the mandate, addressing factors such as the type of area, assessment methods, endpoints, target population, and exposure. Lastly, the WG delved into the problem formulation at hand.

The WG also reviewed the eligibility criteria for study selection for each line of evidence, as well as the criteria for selecting relevant studies. Additionally, the experts discussed the methodology for evidence retrieval and the search strategy.

It was noted that data collection will be outsourced to external experts. The use of tools such as Distiller SR and Distiller AI (for screening titles and abstracts, followed by human validation) was proposed.

## **7. Agreement of WG meeting minutes**

The WG meeting minutes have been agreed.

## **8. Any Other Business**

### **8.1. Agreement on WG meeting dates**

The planning for the next WG meeting was shared and discussed with the Working Group.

Next WG meeting is planned on the 30<sup>th</sup> of September 2024 by teleconference.