

17-19 September 2024

09:00-18:00 / 09:00-18:00 / 09:00-13:00

MINUTES – Agreed on 27 September 2024

Location: EFSA, Parma

Attendees:

○ **Panel Members:**

Giovanna Azimonti, Eleftherios Bonos, Henrik Christensen, Mojca Durjava, Birgit Dusemund, Ronette Gehring, Boet Glandorf, Maryline Kouba, Marta López-Alonso, Francesca Marcon, Carlo Nebbia, Alena Pechová, Miguel Prieto, Ilen Röhe, Katerina Theodoridou and Roberto Edoardo Villa (Chair).

○ **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not applicable.

○ **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

DG SANTE: Konstantinos Evangelopoulos, Paola Ferraro, Francesca Moretti, Almudena Rodríguez, Fabien Schneegans and Koen Van Dyck.

EURL: Maria Jose González De La Huebra Tejedor.

○ **EFSA:**

FEEDCO Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Nicole Bozzi Cionci, Rosella Brozzi, Anna Dioni, Maria Dulak-Lis, Joana P. Firmino, Stefania Fusani, Jaume Galobart, Yolanda García-Cazorla, Mary Bridget Gilsean, Davide Guerra, Orsolya Holczknecht, Laura Iancu, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Paola Manini, Alberto Navarro-Villa, Jordi Ortuño, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Joana Revez, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Piera Valeri and Maria Vittoria Vettori.

○ **Others:**

Not applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Panel members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² [Policy on Independence](#)

³ [Competing Interest Management](#)



4. Agreement of the minutes of the 176th FEEDAP Panel plenary meeting held on 2-4 July 2024 in Parma

The minutes of the 176th FEEDAP Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 12 July 2024.⁴

5. Report on written procedures

No written procedures to report.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion/adoption

6.1 Cosap (*Camellia oleifera* extract) for all animal species except fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00471](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Cosap (*Camellia oleifera* extract) as a technological additive for all animal species except fish.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.2 Econase[®] XT (endo-1,4-β-xylanase) for pigs for fattening, laying hens and minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00027](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Econase[®] XT (endo-1,4-β-xylanase) as a zootechnical additive for pigs for fattening, laying hens and minor poultry species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.3 Tartrazine for freshwater fish ([EFSA-Q-2022-00779](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of tartrazine as a sensory additive for freshwater fish.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.4 Propionic acid for all species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00881](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of propionic acid as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.5 *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* NCYC R618 (Benesacc[®]) for chickens for fattening and avian species reared for laying and fattening ([EFSA-Q-2023-00255](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Benesacc[®] (*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* NCYC R618) as a zootechnical additive for chickens for fattening and avian species reared for laying and fattening.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

⁴ https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2024-07/-minutes_12.pdf



6.6 *Lentilactobacillus buchneri* DSM 32651 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00392](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Lentilactobacillus buchneri* DSM 32651 as a technological additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.7 Lutein-rich extract from *Tagetes erecta* for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2023-00483](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of lutein-rich extract from *Tagetes erecta* as a sensory additive for turkeys for fattening.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.8 Fumaric acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00539](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of fumaric acid as a technological and sensory additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.9 3-phytase produced with *Komagataella phaffii* (CECT 13171) presented in solid (FSF10000) and liquid (FLF1000) forms for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species, pigs for fattening and minor porcine species for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2023-00738](#))

EFSA was requested to deliver an opinion on the safety of 3-phytase produced with *Komagataella phaffii* (CECT 13171) as a zootechnical additive for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species, pigs for fattening and minor porcine species for fattening.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.10 L-Valine produced with *E. coli* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00739](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of L-valine produced by *E. coli* as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.11 L-Arginine produced with *E. coli* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00868](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of L-arginine produced by *E. coli* as a nutritional additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.12 Preparation containing a smoke flavouring extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2023-00900](#))

This question refers to the renewal of the authorisation under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of a preparation containing a smoke flavouring extract as a sensory additive for cats and dogs.



The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation and safety. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.13 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories: Tea tree oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00119](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of tea tree oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.14 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Clary sage oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00304](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of clary sage oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed in the 174th Plenary meeting, but the opinion could not be adopted as the EURL report was missing. Following the reception of the report, the Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.15 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Lavender oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00306](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of lavender oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed in the 174th Plenary meeting, but the opinion could not be adopted as the EURL report was missing. Following the reception of the report, the Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.16 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories: Spanish sage oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00404](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of Spanish sage oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The draft opinion was discussed in the 176th Plenary meeting, but the opinion could not be adopted as the EURL report was missing. Following the reception of the report, the Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

6.17 Guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms in support of the risk assessment of products used in the food chain ([EFSA-Q-2024-00438](#))

This question refers to a self-task of the Scientific Committee of EFSA to prepare a guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms used in the food chain.

This document is currently being presented to all the relevant Scientific Panels for endorsement before it will be discussed and endorsed by the Scientific Committee.

The draft guidance was presented, highlighting the main novelties with regard the current FEEDAP Panel guidance for the characterisation of microorganisms. The Panel experts were invited to submit comments to the draft document, which will be tabled in one of the next plenary meetings for endorsement.



6.18 Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 01 - Lamiales for all animal species and categories: *Thymus origanum* oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00541](#))

This question refers to the authorisation under Article 4 and the re-evaluation under Article 10 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of *Thymus origanum* oil as a sensory additive for all animal species.

The Panel discussed the draft scientific opinion, and in particular assessed data regarding product characterisation, safety and efficacy. The Panel unanimously adopted the opinion.

7. Other scientific topics for information/discussion

- The Panel was presented the draft self-task mandate on the development of a specific guidance document for risk assessment of feed additives containing nanoparticles. The Panel was invited to comment on the draft mandate before it is endorsed and sent to the Executive Director.
- A member of the FEED Team made a general presentation on the "Guidance on the identity, characterisation and conditions of use of feed additives".⁵
- The Panel was informed on the publication of the external scientific report "EFSA Project on the use of NAMs to explore interspecies metabolic differences on essential oils as feed additives".⁶

8. Update on new mandates since the previous meeting

8.1 New applications under Regulation (EC) 1831/2003

The Commission has forwarded to EFSA the following new applications of feed additives seeking authorisation under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 since the last Plenary meeting. These applications were presented to the Panel:

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2024-00418	Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8) produced with <i>Trichoderma reesei</i> CBS 143953 as zootechnical additive for all poultry species, pigs for fattening, piglets (suckling and weaned piglets) and all minor porcine species
EFSA-Q-2024-00423	L-Arginine (3c363) produced with <i>Corynebacterium glutamicum</i> KCCM 80393 as nutritional additive for all animal species and categories
EFSA-Q-2024-00449	Vitamin B1: thiamine hydrochloride (3a820) and thiamine mononitrate (3a821) as nutritional additives for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00450	Coated granulated calcium iodate anhydrous (3b203) as nutritional additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00476	<i>Enterococcus faecium</i> DSM 10663 / NCIMB 10415 (4b1707) as zootechnical additive for piglets, chickens for fattening, turkeys for fattening, calves for rearing, cats and dogs
EFSA-Q-2024-00485	Betaine anhydrous (3a920) as nutritional additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00486	L-Valine (3c370) produced with <i>Escherichia coli</i> NITE BP-01755 as nutritional additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00488	Vitamin C in the form of ascorbic acid (3a300), sodium ascorbyl phosphate (3a311) and sodium calcium ascorbyl phosphate (3a312) as nutritional additives and in the form of ascorbic acid

⁵ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/j.efsa.2017.5023>

⁶ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/sp.efsa.2024.EN-8820>



EFSA-Q number	Subject
	(3a300), sodium ascorbate (1b301), calcium ascorbate (1b302) and ascorbyl palmitate (1b304) as technological additives for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00504	Beta-carotene (3a160(a)) as nutritional additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00505	Tocopherol extracts from vegetable oils (1b306(i)), tocopherol-rich extracts from vegetable oils (delta-rich) (1b306(ii)) and alpha-Tocopherol (1b307) as technological additives for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00506	L-Isoleucine as a nutritional additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00507	L-Arginine as a nutritional additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00509	Xanthan gum as technological additive for cats
EFSA-Q-2024-00510	<i>Lactocaseibacillus huelsenbergensis</i> DSM 115424 as technological additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00521	Vitamin B12 (cyanocobalamin) produced with <i>Ensifer adhaerens</i> CICC 11008s as a nutritional additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00531	Perlite as technological additive for all terrestrial animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00532	Zinc lysinate sulfate as a nutritional additive for all animal species
EFSA-Q-2024-00533	Chromium-DL-methionine as zootechnical additive for all fin fish
EFSA-Q-2024-00562	Preparation of <i>Weizmannia faecalis</i> DSM 32016 (4b1900) as a zootechnical additive for all poultry species for fattening, reared for breeding and laying and ornamental birds
EFSA-Q-2024-00563	Endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (4a1606i) produced with <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> LMG S-15136 as a zootechnical additive for all suidae and poultry species

8.2 Valid applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003

Applications considered valid for the start of the assessment:

EFSA-Q number	Subject	Valid on
EFSA-Q-2023-00715	<i>Saccharomyces cerevisiae</i> NBRC 0203 and <i>Lactocaseibacillus rhamnosus</i> NBRC 3425 as technological additive for all animal species	24/06/2024
EFSA-Q-2023-00744	1-Methoxy-4-(prop-1(trans)-enyl)benzene and eugenol as sensory additive for all avian species	04/07/2024
EFSA-Q-2023-00899	6-phytase produced with <i>Trichoderma reesei</i> as zootechnical additive for piglets, pigs for fattening, chickens for fattening and reared for laying, turkeys for fattening and reared for breeding, other-and-minor growing poultry species and reared for laying/breeding and other-and-minor growing porcine	24/06/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00004	Avi-Carb (semduramicin 3% and nicarbazin 8%) as coccidiostat for chickens for fattening	05/09/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00123	Preparation of eugenol, cinnamaldehyde and capsicum oleoresin as zootechnical additive for dairy cows for milk production and cows for reproduction	12/07/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00202	Cobalt (II)acetate tetrahydrate, cobalt(II) carbonate, cobalt(II)carbonate hydroxide (2:3)	05/08/2024



EFSA-Q number	Subject	Valid on
	monohydrate and cobalt(II) sulphate heptahydrate for camelids	
EFSA-Q-2024-00214	Xylocap [®] (capsaicin CAS No. 404-86-4) as a sensory additive for all animal species	26/06/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00222	<i>Pediococcus pentosaceus</i> NCIMB 12674 for all animal species	13/08/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00245	Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for piglets and pigs for fattening, calves, sheep, fish and dogs	15/07/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00246	Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for piglets and pigs for fattening, calves, sheep, fish and dogs	09/08/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00260	<i>Saccharomyces cerevisiae</i> NCYC R404 for dairy cows for milk production	25/07/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00263	Belfeed B MP/ML (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase EC 3.2.1.8 produced by <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> LMG S-15136) for gestating sows	24/07/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00273	25-hydroxycholecalciferol as nutritional additive for salmonids, other fish species and all other animal species	11/07/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00287	Guanidinoacetic acid as zootechnical additive for chickens and turkeys for fattening and reared for laying and breeding	07/08/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00301	Preparation of endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8) and endo-1,3-beta-glucanase (EC 3.2.1.6) as zootechnical additives for chickens for fattening and reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for breeding purposes, for fattening and reared for breeding and minor poultry species	07/08/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00302	L-Carnitine (3a910) and L-carnitine L-tartrate (3a911) as nutritional additives for all animal species	14/08/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00320	Biotin as nutritional additives for all animal species	30/08/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00329	<i>Enterococcus lactis</i> NCIMB 10415 (1k20601) as technological additive for all animal species	12/08/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00336	Guanidinoacetic acid (GAA) (4d372) and GAA preparation (4d372i) as zootechnical additive for turkeys for fattening and turkeys reared for breeding and laying	22/07/2024
EFSA-Q-2024-00407	Vitamin B1 as thiamine mononitrate (3a821) and thiamine hydrochloride (3a820) as nutritional additive for all animal species	22/08/2024

8.3 New questions under Regulation (EC) No 178/2002

EFSA-Q number	Subject
EFSA-Q-2024-00410	<i>Duddingtonia flagrans</i> strain IAH 1297 (NCIMB 30336) as zootechnical additive for all grazing animals
EFSA-Q-2024-00497	Elancoban [®] (monensin sodium) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying and turkeys
EFSA-Q-2024-00522	<i>Bifidobacterium longum</i> (CNCM I-5642) for dogs
EFSA-Q-2024-00534	Glyceryl polyethyleneglycol ricinoleate for all animal species



9. Feedback from Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels/EFSA/European Commission/EURL

9.1 Scientific Committee

The Chair of the Panel provided an overview of the main items discussed during the last plenary of the Scientific Committee.

9.2 Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups

Not discussed.

9.3 EFSA

Not discussed.

9.4 European Commission/EURL

- a) A member of the European Commission gave a presentation of the work of the DG SANTE Unit G5 – Food Hygiene, Feed and Fraud on the authorisation of feed additives.
- b) A member of the European Union Reference Laboratory (EURL) for feed additives gave a presentation on the activities of the EURL in the authorisation process of feed additives.

10. Any other business

10.1 MAGNI-PHI® (*Quilliaja saponaria* and *Yucca schidigera*) for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2021-00310](#))

The scientific opinion on the additive Magni-Phi was adopted on 4 June 2024. However, after adoption, an erratum was identified in the opinion regarding the data provided to assess the stability. This erratum will be corrected in the published opinion.

10.2 Additional data requests

The Panel was informed of the modification that will be applied by EFSA regarding the request of additional data to applicants during the risk assessment of applications for feed additives. EFSA will endeavour to request additional data in all areas of the assessment where required to reach a conclusion on the safety and efficacy. At the same time, it will also increase the number of clarification teleconferences with applicants to ensure a clear understanding of the requests made.

10.3 Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 15-17 October 2024 via teleconference.