

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS

8th meeting of the
Cross-cutting Working Group



27 May 2024

09:00 – 16:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 17/06/2024

Location: Teleconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Josep Casacuberta, Javier Moreno, Fabien Nogué and Nils Rostoks
- Hearing Experts¹:
ANSES staff: Celine Druet, Youssef El Ouadrhiri and Catherine Golstein
Expert of the ANSES Working Group on Biotechnology: Valérie Le Corre
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
None
- EFSA:
NIF: Ana Afonso, Paolo Lenzi, Franco Maria Neri (chair), Nikoletta Papadopoulou and Tommaso Raffaello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Ewen Mullins.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting and to the preparatory meeting under item 6. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in these meetings have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of these meetings.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 2 May 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting were agreed on 8 May 2024.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 European Parliament's request for a scientific opinion on recent studies on the proposal for a regulation of the European Parliament and the Council on plants obtained by certain NGT and their food and feed and amending regulation (EU) 2017/625 (EFSA-Q-2024-00178)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



In the hearing section, ANSES presented the main points of their analysis,⁴ including considerations about terms, definitions and scientific rationale for the criteria in Annex I of the EC proposal, and considerations on the risks associated to Category 1 NGT plants.

The Cross-cutting Working Group experts discussed with ANSES the exclusion of intragenesis from Category 1 NGT plants, non-targeted cisgenesis, the definition of targeted site and the risk of Category 1 NGT plants.

The discussion provided the Cross-cutting Working Group experts with a better understanding of the ANSES opinion. Before and after the hearing session, the Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion.

6. Preparatory meetings

- Preparatory meeting
Date: 17 May 2024
Working group members: Josep Casacuberta, Ewen Mullins and Fabien Nogué
EFSA staff (NIF): Paolo Lenzi, Franco M. Neri, Nikoletta Papadopoulou and Tommaso Raffaello
Mandate for discussion: EFSA-Q-2024-00178⁵

Next meeting

TBD

⁴Original French version: <https://www.anses.fr/fr/system/files/BIOT2023AUTO0189.pdf>.

English translation: <https://www.anses.fr/fr/system/files/BIOT2023AUTO0189EN.pdf>.

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2024-00178>

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS

7th meeting of the
Cross-cutting Working Group



2 May 2024

09:00 – 13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 8/5/2024

Location: Teleconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Josep Casacuberta, Javier Moreno, Ewen Mullins and Nils Rostoks
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
None
- EFSA:
NIF: Ana Afonso, Paolo Lenzi, Franco Maria Neri (chair), Nikoletta Papadopoulou and Tommaso Raffaello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 11 April 2024, via web-conference

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting were agreed on 11 April 2024.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1** European Parliament's request for a scientific opinion on recent studies on the proposal for a regulation of the European Parliament and the Council on plants obtained by certain NGT and their food and feed and amending regulation (EU) 2017/625 (EFSA-Q-2024-00178)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



The Working Group discussed the draft scientific opinion on the analysis carried out by ANSES and published on 21 December 2023.⁴ Further discussion is needed.

Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 27 May 2024, online.

⁴ <https://www.anses.fr/en/content/plants-derived-new-genomic-techniques-analysis-category-1-inclusion-criteria-proposed>

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS

6th meeting of the
Cross-cutting Working Group



11 April 2024

09:00 – 16:30

MINUTES - Agreed on 11/04/2024

Location: Webconference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Josep Casacuberta, Javier Moreno, Ewen Mullins, Fabien Nogué and Nils Rostoks
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
None
- EFSA:
NIF: Ana Afonso, Antonio Fernandez Dumont, Andrea Gennaro, Sara Jacchia, Dafni Maria Kagli, Paolo Lenzi, Aleksandra Lewandowska, Ana Martin Camargo, Franco Maria Neri (chair), Nikoletta Papadopoulou, Tommaso Raffaello and Reinhilde Schoonjans

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 11 November 2023, via web-conference

The [minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting](#) were agreed on 11 November 2023.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 European Parliament's request for a scientific opinion on recent studies on the proposal for a regulation of the European Parliament and the Council on plants

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



obtained by certain NGT and their food and feed and amending regulation (EU) 2017/625 (EFSA-Q-2024-00178)

The Working Group discussed the analysis of the principles of equivalency for certain types of NGT plants (proposed in Annex 1 of the draft Regulation adopted on 5 July 2023) carried out by ANSES in the opinion published on 21 December 2023.⁴ The Working Group also discussed the structure and the content of the scientific opinion. Further discussion is needed.

Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 2 May 2024, online.

⁴ <https://www.anses.fr/en/content/plants-derived-new-genomic-techniques-analysis-category-1-inclusion-criteria-proposed>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS

MINUTES OF THE 5th MEETING OF THE CROSS-CUTTING WORKING GROUP

Held on 21 November 2023, Tele/WEB

(Agreed on 21 November 2023)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Tamas Dalmay (chair), Ian Dewhurst, Thomas Frenzel, Antoine Messéan, Javier Moreno, Ewen Mullins, José Sanchez Serrano and Giovanni Savoini

■ Hearing Experts¹:

None

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

DG SANTE: Alexandre Huchelmann

■ EFSA:

NIF Unit: Michele Ardizzone, Giacomo De Sanctis, Antonio Fernández Dumont, Andrea Gennaro, Aina Belén Gil González, Tilemachos Goumperis, Paschalina Grammatikou, Paolo Lenzi, Aleksandra Lewandowska, Ana Martín Camargo, Franco Maria Neri, Nikoletta Papadopoulou and Marta Rodrigues

■ Other

None

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. EFSA-GMO-NL-2019-159 (Maize DP-202216-6)⁴

The working group discussed the application. Further discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

None.

6. Next meeting

To be determined.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2019-00419>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS

MINUTES OF THE 4th MEETING OF THE CROSS-CUTTING WORKING GROUP

Held on 19 December 2022, Tele/WEB

(Agreed on 19 December 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Tamas Dalmay (chair), Ian Dewhurst, Thomas Frenzel (for item 4.2), Jan Hejátko (for item 4.2), Javier Moreno and Fabien Nogué (for item 4.1)
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
DG SANTE: Juliette-Marie Margueritte
- EFSA:
NIF Unit: Michele Ardizzone, Antonio Fernández Dumont, Andrea Gennaro, Jose Gómez Ruiz, Tilemachos Goumperis, Paschalina Grammatikou, Paolo Lenzi, Aleksandra Lewandowska, Franco Maria Neri, Nikoletta Papadopoulou, Tommaso Raffaello and Kyriaki Xiftou
- Other
None

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. GMFF-2022-5890 (maize MON 95275)⁴

The working group discussed the application. Further discussion is needed.

4.2. EFSA-GMO-DE-2019-157 (oilseed rape LBFLFK)⁵

The working group discussed the application and the draft scientific opinion. Further discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

None.

6. Next meeting

To be determined.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00330>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2019-00394>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE CROSS-CUTTING WORKING GROUP

Held on 18 July 2022, Tele/WEB

(Agreed on 18 July 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Tamas Dalmay (chair), Philippe Guerche, Javier Moreno, Ewen Mullins, Hanspeter Naegeli, Fabien Nogu e and Jose Sanchez Serrano
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
DG SANTE: Iliaria Ciabatti and Alexandre Huchelmann
- EFSA:
NIF Unit: Antonio Fernandez Dumont, Nikoletta Papadopoulou and Tommaso Raffaello
- Other
None

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. EFSA statement on the criteria for risk assessment for plants produced by targeted mutagenesis and cisgenesis⁴

The working group discussed the mandate and the draft statement. Further discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

None.

6. Next meeting

To be determined.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00309>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS

MINUTES OF THE 2nd MEETING OF THE CROSS-CUTTING WORKING GROUP

Held on 7 July 2022, Tele/WEB

(Agreed on 7 July 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Tamas Dalmay (chair), Ian Dewhurst, Thomas Frenzel, Antoine Messéan, Javier Moreno, Ewen Mullins, Hanspeter Naegeli and José Sanchez Serrano
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
DG SANTE: Alexandre Huchelmann, Juliette-Marie Margueritte
- EFSA:
NIF Unit: Michele Ardizzone, Giacomo De Sanctis, Antonio Fernandez Dumont, Silvia Federici, Andrea Gennaro, Tilemachos Goumperis, Franco Maria Neri and Nikoletta Papadopoulou
- Other
None

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 9 June 2022, Tele/WEB.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 9 June 2022 were agreed on 17 June 2022.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. EFSA-GMO-NL-2019-159 (Maize DP-202216-6)⁵

The working group discussed the application. Further discussion is needed.

6. Any other business

None.

7. Next meeting

18 July 2022, Tele/WEB

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/gmo/working-groups>

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2019-00419>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS

MINUTES OF THE 1st MEETING OF THE CROSS-CUTTING WORKING GROUP

Held on 9 June 2022, Tele/WEB

(Agreed on 17 June 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Tamas Dalmay (chair), Ian Dewhurst, Philippe Guerche, Javier Moreno, Ewen Mullins, Hanspeter Naegeli and Fabien Nogué
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
DG SANTE: Iliaria Ciabatti and Alexandre Huchelmann
- EFSA:
NIF Unit: Antonio Fernandez Dumont, Andrea Gennaro, Franco Maria Neri, Nikoletta Papadopoulou and Tommaso Raffaello
- Other
None

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from José Sanchez Serrano.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. EFSA statement on the criteria for risk assessment for plants produced by targeted mutagenesis and cisgenesis⁴

The working group discussed the mandate and the draft statement. Further discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

None.

6. Next meeting

7 July 2022, Tele/WEB

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00309>