

22 & 23 May 2024

09:00-17:30 & 09:00-13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 10 June 2024

Location: Teleconference

Attendees:

○ Panel Members:

Claude BRAGARD (Chair), Paula BAPTISTA, Elisavet CHATZIVASSILIOU, Paolo GONTHIER, Josep JAQUES, Alan MACLEOD, Panagiotis MILONAS, Juan NAVAS-CORTES, Roel POTTING, Philippe REIGNAULT, Emilio STEFANI, Hans-Hermann THULKE, Antonio VICENT CIVERA, Wopke VAN DER WERF, Jonathan YUEN, Lucia ZAPPALÀ

○ European Commission:

Leonard Shumbe

○ EFSA:

Cristiana DO VALE CORREIA, Ewelina CZWIENCZEK, Ciro GARDI, Alex GOBBI, Dejana GOLIC, Agata KACZMAREK, Virág KERTÉSZ, Marco PAUTASSO, Giuseppe STANCANELLI, Franz STREISSL, Emanuela TACCI, Anastasia TERZIDOU

○ Hearing Experts:

Davide Rassati, Giacomo Santoiemma (University of Padova, IT); Alberto Santini, Francesco Pecori (CNR IPSP, IT); John Sweeney (Natural Resources, Canada),

EFSA art.36 Tasking grants: Alzbeta MIKULOVA (University of Padova, Italy); Oresteia SFYRA (Benaki Phytopathological Institute, Greece),

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants, apologies received from Francesco DI SERIO and Christer MAGNUSSON.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence^[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,^[2] EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex I.

4. Report on written procedures

4.1 Agreement by written procedure of minutes of 122nd Panel plenary meeting

The Panel was informed that the minutes were published in time and were thanked for their contributions.



5. Scientific output(s) submitted for discussion/adoption

5.1 Scientific opinion on Quantitative Pest Risk Assessment on *Phlyctinus callosus* EFSA-Q-2023-00466

Following a request from the European Commission, the EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a quantitative risk assessment for the EU of *Phlyctinus callosus* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae), a polyphagous pest occurring in Australia, New Zealand, and South Africa. The current risk assessment focused on potential pathways for entry, the climatic conditions allowing establishment, the expected spread capacity, and the impact considering a time horizon of 10 years (2023-2032). The Panel identified the import of apples, cut flowers and table grapes as the most relevant entry pathways. Over the next 10 years, an annual median estimate of approximately 49.9 (90% Certainty Range, CR, ranging from 3.9 to 881.1) potential *P. callosus* founder populations are expected. When the probability of establishment is considered, the model estimated a median of 1 founder population every 1.3 years (90% CR: 1 every 31.5 years – 23.8 per year) under the scenario of maximum area of establishment and 1 founder population every 12.0 years (90% CR: 1 every 263.1 years – 2.5 per year) in the scenario of the minimum area of establishment. The estimated number of founder populations per year is mostly driven by the probability of establishment in the rural areas, infestation rate in table grapes and the probability of transfer to a suitable host in the rural area. The risk of entry for cut flowers and apples is substantially lower than the risk from the table grapes. If such founder populations were to establish, *P. callosus* is estimated to spread by natural dispersal and common agricultural practices at a rate of 15.5 m/year (90% CR 5.1–46.8 m/year) after a lag phase of 4.0 years (90% CR 1.3–8.7 years). The impact, expressed as percentage loss of the production directly attributable to *P. callosus* in the areas where establishment is possible and assuming farmers do not apply specific control measures was estimated at 0.5% (90% CR 0.01% to 2.8%) for cut flowers/foilage, 5.2% (90% CR 2.2% to 11.7%) for apples, and 2% (90% CR 1.3% to 5.2%) for table grapes. Options for risk reduction are discussed but their effectiveness is not quantified.

The scientific opinion was adopted on 22 May 2024.

5.2 Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation on *Popillia quadriguttata* EFSA-Q-2024-00042

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Popillia quadriguttata* (Coleoptera: Scarabaeidae), following a commodity risk assessment of bonsai *Pinus parviflora* grafted onto *P. thunbergii* from China, in which *P. quadriguttata* was identified as a pest of possible concern for the territory of the European Union. This is a univoltine polyphagous pest that occurs in eastern Asia from Vietnam northwards through eastern China and Taiwan, South Korea and into Far East Russia. Hosts include species of fruit trees within the genera *Malus* and *Prunus*, trees of forestry and environmental importance such as *Quercus* and *Ulmus*, shrubs such as *Wisteria*, soft fruit such as *Rubus*, grasses, including amenity turf and field crops such as potatoes, maize and soybean. Adults feed on host leaves, tender stems, flower buds, flowers and fruits; larvae feed on host roots. In northern China *P. quadriguttata* is a major pest of soybean; in South Korea, *P. quadriguttata* is one of the most serious insect pests of golf course turf. *P. quadriguttata* could enter the EU on various pathways including infested soil and growing media accompanying host plants for planting. Biotic factors (host availability) and abiotic factors (climate suitability) suggest that large parts of the EU would be suitable for establishment. Local spread would be mainly via natural dispersal of adults. Long distance spread would be facilitated by the movement of eggs, larvae and pupae infesting soil especially with plants for planting; adults could spread on plants for planting without soil. Economic and or environmental impacts would be expected on a range of plants if *P. quadriguttata* were to establish in the EU. Phytosanitary measures are available to reduce the likelihood of its introduction. *P. quadriguttata* satisfies all of the criteria that are within the remit of EFSA to assess for it to be regarded as a potential Union quarantine pest.

The scientific opinion was adopted on 23 May 2024.



5.3 Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation on *Monema flavescens* EFSA-Q-2023-00344

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Monema flavescens* (Lepidoptera, Limacodidae), following the commodity risk assessment of *Acer palmatum* plants grafted on *A. davidii* from China, in which *M. flavescens* was identified as a pest of possible concern to the European Union (EU). This species can be identified by morphological taxonomic keys and by barcoding. The adults of the overwintering generation emerge from late June to late August. The eggs are laid in groups on the underside of the host-plant leaves, on which the larvae feed throughout their six-eight larval instars. Pupation occurs in ovoid cocoons at the junction between twigs and branches, or on the trunk. Overwintering occurs as fully grown larvae or prepupae in their cocoon. There are one or two generations per year. *M. flavescens* is polyphagous and feeds on broadleaves; it has been reported on 51 plant species belonging to 24 families. It mainly occurs in Asia (Bhutan, China, the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, Japan, Nepal, the Republic of Korea), Russia (Eastern Siberia) and Taiwan). It is also present in the USA (Massachusetts). The pest's flight capacities are unknown. The main pathway for entry and spread is plants for planting with cocoons attached. This is partially closed by prohibition of some hosts. In several EU member states climatic conditions are conducive for establishment and many host plants are widespread. Introduction of *M. flavescens* may result in defoliations influencing tree health and forest diversity. The caterpillars also have urticating spines affecting human health. Phytosanitary measures are available to reduce the likelihood of entry, establishment and spread, and there is a definite potential for classical biological control. Recognising that natural enemies prevent *M. flavescens* being regarded as a pest in Asia, there is uncertainty regarding the magnitude of potential impact in EU depending on the influence of natural enemies. All criteria assessed by EFSA for consideration as a potential quarantine pest are met.

The scientific opinion was adopted on 23 May 2024.

5.4 Scientific Opinion on Commodity Risk assessment *Sorbus aucuparia* from UK

The European Commission requested the EFSA Panel on Plant Health to prepare and deliver risk assessments for commodities listed in Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2018/2019 as 'high risk plants, plant products and other objects'. Taking into account the available scientific information, including the technical information provided by the applicant country, this Scientific Opinion covers the plant health risks posed by the following commodities: *Sorbus aucuparia* bare-root plants and rooted plants in pots up to 7 years old and specimen trees in pots up to 15 years old imported into the EU from the UK. A list of pests potentially associated with the commodities was compiled. The relevance of any pest was assessed based on evidence following defined criteria. Three EU quarantine pests (*Entoleuca mammata* and *Phytophthora ramorum* (non-EU isolates), *Erwinia amylovora*), were selected for further evaluation. For two of the selected pests, the risk mitigation measures implemented in the UK and specified in the technical dossier were evaluated taking into account the possible limiting factors. For these pests, an expert judgement is given on the likelihood of pest freedom taking into consideration the risk mitigation measures acting on the pest, including uncertainties associated with the assessment. The degree of pest freedom varies between the pests evaluated, with *P. ramorum* being the pest most frequently expected on the imported *S. aucuparia* plants. The Expert Knowledge Elicitation indicated, with 95% certainty, that between 9,812 and 10,000 bare-root *S. aucuparia* plants per 10,000 will be free from *P. ramorum*.

The scientific opinion was adopted on 23 May 2024.

5.5 Scientific Opinion on Commodity Risk assessment *Prunus avium* plants from UK EFSA-Q-2023-00335

The European Commission requested the EFSA Panel on Plant Health to prepare and deliver risk assessments for commodities listed in Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2018/2019 as "High risk plants, plant products and other objects". This Scientific Opinion covers plant health



risks posed by plants of *Prunus avium* possibly grafted on rootstocks of either *P. avium*, *P. canescens*, *P. cerasus*, *P. pseudocerasus* or their hybrids imported from the United Kingdom (UK), taking into account the available scientific information, including the technical information provided by the UK. All pests associated with the commodities were evaluated against specific criteria for their relevance for this opinion. Four quarantine pests (*Bemisia tabaci* EU populations, *Scirtothrips dorsalis*, tobacco ringspot virus and tomato ringspot virus), and three non-regulated pests (*Colletotrichum aenigma*, *Eulecanium excrescens* and *Takahashia japonica*) that fulfilled all relevant criteria were selected for further evaluation. The risk mitigation measures proposed in the technical Dossier from the UK were evaluated, taking into account the possible limiting factors. For these pests, expert judgment is given on the likelihood of pest freedom, taking into consideration the risk mitigation measures acting on the pest, including uncertainties associated with the assessment. The degree of pest freedom varies among the pests evaluated, with *Colletotrichum aenigma* being the pest most frequently expected on the imported potted plants. The Expert Knowledge Elicitation indicated with 95% certainty that between 9,971 and 10,000 plants per 10,000 would be free from the above-mentioned fungus.

The scientific opinion was adopted on 23 May 2024.

5.6 Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation on *Cenopalpus irani* EFSA-Q-2024-00046

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Cenopalpus irani* (Trombidiformes: Tenuipalpidae), known as the Iranian false spider mite, following the commodity risk assessment of *Malus domestica* plants from Türkiye, in which *C. irani* was identified as a pest of possible concern for the territory of the European Union (EU). The pest is only known to be present in Iran and Türkiye and has not been reported from the EU. The mite primarily feeds on Rosaceae plants but is considered polyphagous. Important crops of the EU that are hosts of *C. irani* include apples (*Malus domestica*), pears (*Pyrus communis*), and figs (*Ficus carica*). Plants for planting and fruits provide potential pathways for entry into the EU. Host availability and climate suitability in southern EU countries would most probably allow this species to successfully establish and spread. This mite is not listed in Annex II of Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/2072. Phytosanitary measures are available to reduce the likelihood of entry and spread of this species into the EU. The mite *C. irani* satisfies the criteria that are within the remit of EFSA to assess for it to be regarded as a potential Union quarantine pest, although there is a key uncertainty over the likelihood and magnitude of impact.

The scientific opinion was adopted on 23 May 2024.

5.7 Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation *Coniella castaneicola* EFSA-Q-2024-00193

The Panel started the discussion on the pest categorisation on *Coniella castaneicola* but its possible adoption was postponed to the June plenary due to lack of time.

6. Feedback from EFSA, SC and EC DG SANTE

6.1 Draft statement on Protocol development for standard Plant Health Scientific opinion First discussion

The Panel was updated on the progresses on the development of standard protocols for recurrent plant health scientific opinions (pest categorisations, quantitative pest risk assessments, commodity risk assessments). These will be presented to the Panel for discussion and possible adoption at the next meeting in June.



6.2 Feedback from SC

The last Scientific Committee panel meeting was held in April with the several discussions on guidance (margin of exposure, biomarkers of effects, ...), the plant health work program was presented. An overview the architecture of EFSA guidance portfolio was discussed, this point will be further discussed over the next meeting at the end of May, with special emphasis on cross-cutting topics. An interesting discussion on the role of SC was held, the SC tries to have more strategic point of view in RA and a larger view on the science of RA, to be less involved in protocol development, with more flexibility. Next week during the SC the last version of the epidemiology guidance will be presented for adoption, and a self-task mandate on microorganism characterization. Last meeting in June is to address and finalise the ongoing tasks.

6.3 Feedback from EC DG SANTE

First batch of amendment of the annex is ongoing, now undergoing SPS consultation. Second batch of annexes on the way, will include certain pests already categorized.

6.4 Feedback from EFSA, including outline of lessons learned discussion at June plenary

The Panel Coordinator informed the panel on the discussion foreseen for the last Plenary in June. A short online survey would be sent the week before the plenary to collect answers from the Panel, with questions focusing on key aspects of pest categorisation, quantitative pest risk assessment and commodity risk assessment

6.5 Intermediate results from EFSA art 36 Grant Project SAPTREEES on the European host range *Saperda tridentata*

Following the uncertainties identified by the Panel it its pest categorisation, EFSA has launched an Art. 36 Grant open call to investigate the European host range of the American elm borer *Saperda tridentata*. The grant has been awarded to University of Padova (IT) and the Italian national research council (CNR) to conduct research in Canada in collaboration with Natural Resources Canada. Intermediate results of this project were presented to the Panel. The Panel congratulated the research consortium for the results achieved so far that, once the experiments will be concluded, will support the Panel risk assessment.

7. AOB

Information was provided about the planned agenda for the last plenary of this Panel on 18-19 June 2024.



Annex I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

With regard to this meeting, **Dr. Panagiotis Milonas** declared the following interest with regard to the two draft Scientific opinions on:

5.2 Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation on *Popillia quadriguttata* EFSA-Q-2024-00042

5.3 Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation on *Monema flavescens* EFSA-Q-2023-00344

5.6 Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation on *Cenopalpus irani* EFSA-Q- 2024-00046

He informed the Panel that he participates to the work on these opinions as coordinator of EFSA Art. 36 Tasking Grant Specific Contracts. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence^[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management^[2], and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest (CoI).

This results in the exclusion of the expert from discussion or voting as PLH Panel Member of items 6.3, however, he can participate to this agenda meeting to present the work he conducted as coordinator of the related EFSA Art 36 Tasking Grant Specific Contracts.