

22-23 May 2024
9:00-16:30 and 9:00-13:00
MINUTES - Agreed on 31 May 2024

Location: EFSA, Parma / Teleconference

Attendees:

- Panel Members:
ALVAREZ Julio, VELARDE Antonio, BICOUT Dominique, CALISTRI Paolo, CANALI Elisabetta, DREWE Julian Ashley, GARIN-BASTUJI Bruno, GONZALES ROJAS Jose Luis, GORTAZAR SCHMIDT Christian, HERSKIN Mette, MICHEL Virginie, MIRANDA Miguel Angel, NIELSEN Søren Saxmose, PADALINO Barbara, ROBERTS Helen, STÅHL Karl, VILTROP Arvo, WINCKLER Christoph.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: ALAEZ PONS Ester, DITTMANN RASMUSSEN Susanne
- EFSA:
ASHE Sean, AZNAR Inma, BALDINELLI Francesca, BALMOS Oana Maria, BROGLIA Alessandro, CANDIANI Denise Francesca, DHOLLANDER Sofie, FABRIS Chiara, GERVELMEYER Andrea, KOHNLE Lisa, LANFRANCHI Barbara, MANAKIDOU Aikaterini, MUR Lina, ORTIZ PELAEZ Angel, PREITE Ludovica, ROJO GIMENO Cristina, VAN DER STEDE Yves, VERDONCK Frank, VITALI Marika
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

¹ As defined in Article 34 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4. Agreement of the minutes of the 156th AHAW Panel Plenary meeting held on 24 April 2024, via teleconference

The minutes of the 156th Panel plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 3 May 2024.

5. Report on written procedure

Not applicable.

6. Scientific output(s) submitted for discussion/adoption

6.1 Draft opinion on concerning the on-farm killing of small ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2018-00722](#))

The scientific opinion was adopted unanimously after discussion of few points: i. the position for application of the non-penetrative captive bolt was clarified; ii. the impact on welfare of the use of potassium chloride and magnesium sulfate for lethal injection was discussed and a sentence was added; iii. the question for the uncertainty around the conclusion on percussive blow on lambs and kid goats weighing less than 5 Kg was revised; iv. the list of unacceptable methods in the conclusions was expanded in line with the text in the corresponding chapter. The opinion will be published at the end of June 2024.

6.2 Art. 29 – Request for a Scientific Opinion concerning the protection of turkeys on farm ([EFSA-Q-2023-00647](#)) and Art. 31 Technical assistance concerning the welfare of turkeys on farm ([EFSA-Q-2023-00648](#)): Update

An update was presented to the Panel on the progress of the work on the Scientific Opinion (Art 29), specifically on the progress on ToR B Request 2 a, 3, and 5. The progress on the assessment of the risk factors in the mandate 'the type and condition of the litter', 'the type and presence of enrichment' and 'space allowance' (ToR B Request 2a), ABMs at the slaughterhouse to measure the welfare of turkeys on farm (ToR B Request 5) and the definitions of 10 welfare consequences and identified ABMs to measure the welfare consequences was provided (ToR B Request 3). An update was provided on the outcomes of an exercise conducted in the framework of the EFSA Animal Health and Animal Welfare network (topic animal welfare) meeting on the practice of mutilations in turkeys in the EU and EFTA countries, which will be taken into account as inputs for ToR A Request 1 and ToR B Request 2 f. An update on the progress regarding the report on the housing systems and practices of keeping turkeys was also provided (ToR A Request 1 Art. 31).

6.3 Art. 29 - Request for a scientific opinion concerning the protection of animals kept for fur production ([EFSA-Q-2023-00869](#)) – Tollgate 1

The AHAW Panel was consulted regarding the protocol for the request of a Scientific Opinion concerning the welfare of animals kept for fur production. The Terms of Reference have been turned into risk assessment questions and sub-questions using the APRIO (Agent-Pathway-Receptor-Intervention-Output) framework for the problem formulation. The Panel discussed



and agreed with the approach and protocol made for the assessment and Tollgate 1 was successfully passed.

6.4 Update ASF epidemiological situation in 2023 (EFSA-Q-2022-00380)

The main results, conclusions and recommendations of the Annual epidemiological report of African swine fever during 2023 were presented to the Panel. The report, published in May, shows the increase in the number of outbreaks in domestic pigs in 2023 and the spread to new areas in the EU.

6.5 Pandemic drivers of Avian Influenza ([EFSA-Q-2023-00745](#))

An update was provided on the progress of the work on the Scientific Opinion on pandemic drivers of Avian Influenza. The contractor should screen the sequence database and literature and provide a database including all the virus subtypes presenting zoonotic markers and mutations, together with an overview per mutation, per subtype, per species, per geographical area. Then, if all works as expected, the WG could assign a zoonotic score per each genotype and provide a ranking.

6.6 Art. 29 -- Request for a Scientific Opinion concerning the use of high-expansion foam for stunning and killing pigs and poultry ([EFSA-Q-2022-00344](#)): Thorough discussion (Tollgate 2)

The draft Scientific Opinion on the use of high-expansion foam for stunning and killing pigs and poultry was submitted to the Panel for thorough discussion. Most of the comments raised by the Panel had already been resolved and some of them were further discussed constructively. The Panel suggested improvement on few sentences regarding the uncertainty, the stocking density, one hazard and an explanation to the glossary. It was agreed that these amendments will be made, and that the opinion will be submitted to the Panel by the end of May for proceeding to adoption through written procedure until 10 June 2024.

7. Other scientific topics for information/discussion

7.1 Workshop: Feedback on past Panel mandate and recommendations for future AHAW Panel

The feedback from the current panel experts' survey launched in December 2023 was presented to the Panel. The survey's objective was to measure the Panel experts' satisfaction with EFSA's support, across three dimensions: scientific support, organisational support and engagement. Insights into areas of strength and suggestions for improvement from the whole of EFSA as well as specific recommendations for improvement from the AHAW Panel were presented. The Panel was prompted to provide more specific recommendations for improving scientific support to the AHAW Panel and improve preparedness and engagement of the Panel in the future.

7.2 Living Online Risk Assessment tool (LORA)

The objectives and different work packages of the living online risk assessment tool were presented to the Panel. The tool is being validated until September 2024, after which the outcomes will be presented to the Panel.

7.3 Updated list of target wild bird species for passive surveillance of HPAI: a procurement



The Panel was presented with the new list of target species for passive surveillance of highly pathogenic avian influenza in wild birds. EC had requested to update the list produced in 2017 to take account of the changing epidemiological pattern and extended host spectrum. The new list is based on both epidemiological and ornithological data. Methods used to identify, rank and categorise wild bird species into five ecological groups included literature review, expert elicitation and a detailed scoring system. Finally, recommendations on how to use the list and how it could be adapted to a specific situation were provided. The work was carried out through a procurement procedure and will guide stakeholders involved in avian influenza surveillance activities.

7.4 Update on calls for tenders for EFSA's grants on animal welfare

EFSA presented updates on ongoing projects/grants on animal welfare as a follow-up of the roadmap 'more welfare' activities aiming to develop methodologies for quantitative risk assessment and ongoing strategic data collection projects. Project on dairy herd welfare indicators and positive welfare assessment methodologies were presented as well as two upcoming grants/calls that will be launched in the week of 27-31 May 2024. A grant focused on welfare data collection in pigs and a call on developing a heat-stress model for livestock transport.

7.5 VectorNet 3

The Panel was informed that the new framework contract of Vectornet has been awarded to a consortium involving 16 European institutions. The aim of Vectornet is to support EFSA and ECDC, the contracting authorities, with increasing the preparedness for vector-borne diseases in the EU by increasing collaboration and exchange of information among stakeholders involved in the prevention and control of vector borne diseases; supporting and facilitating the collection and analysis of harmonised vector data; and supporting the development of efficient and sustainable control strategies. The framework contract will run for 4 years.

8. Update on new Mandates

Not applicable

9. Feedback from the Scientific Committee

Not applicable

10. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 2-3 July 2024 in Parma