

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

17th Working Group meeting on Aquatic Animal Diseases

Listing and Categorisation:
Salmonid alphavirus (SAV)

16th of June 2023

13:00-17:00



Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Dominique Bicout
Helen Roberts
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca
David Stone
Hilde Sindre
Niccolo Vendramin
Niels Jørgen Olesen
Barbara Padalino
Julio Alvarez
Julian Drewe
Arvo Viltrop
James Bron
Bruno Garin-Bastuji

- Hearing Experts¹: no hearing experts
- European Commission: no representative for the EC
- EFSA: Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou, Anna Eleonora Karagianni, Alessandro Broglia
- Others: Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The EFSA SO coordinator welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Karl Stahl, Søren Nielsen and Mette Herskin for not being able to participate.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 12th of June 2023, via web-conference

The 16th Working Group Meeting Minutes (the previous one on listing and categorisation) were agreed by written procedure on 22nd of June 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Expert Judgement on Salmonid alphavirus (SAV)

The results of the judgement based on the replies to the individual questions were presented to the experts. The reasoning for the questions where no consensus or uncertainty was reached among the experts was thoroughly discussed. After the discussion, some experts reconsidered the range of their scores and amended their initial replies accordingly.

There were no questions considered as not applicable (NA) by the experts this time, apart from the question B(ii). Therefore, no further questions were discussed.

Lists of species (susceptible, vectors, reservoirs)

The lists of the susceptible, vector and reservoir species as provided in the fact sheet based on the results of the literature review were provided to the experts for consideration. The WG members decided not to include any Vector species in the list this time, as there is not enough evidence in the factsheet to support this approach.

VI. Any Other Business

The draft Opinion with the results will be shared first with the experts that participated to the judgement before being shared with the Panel for deep discussion.

Since this was the last Judgement exercise on the Listing and Categorisation mandate, at the end the experts provided some feedback on the procedure. The experts agreed that the questions to be addressed in the judgment exercises were somehow ambiguous, therefore further clarification on the questions should be provided to the experts in advance to minimise the number of questions where there is no consensus in future judgment exercises.

Moreover, the experts agreed that they should be better trained in relation to the methodological approaches to be followed in such exercises, e.g., performing a mock exercise in a WG meeting in advance, where they could have the chance to practice the methodology, understand the process and ask questions.

Overall, the experts described this process as a very positive experience, where they all learned a lot and had the opportunity to meet and share their expertise with other outstanding experts from all around the globe.

VII. Next meeting



There is no next meeting sheduled at the moment. This was the last judgement exercicise on Listing and Categorisation. If required, a meeting may be sheduled in late August or beginninig of September in order to discuss further the Opinions.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

16th Working Group meeting on Aquatic Animal Diseases
Listing and Categorisation:
Bacterial Kidney Disease (BKD)

12th of June 2023
13:00-17:00



Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Dominique Bicout
Helen Roberts
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca
David Stone
Hilde Sindre
Niccolo Vendramin
Niels Jørgen Olesen
Barbara Padalino
Mette Herskin
Julio Alvarez
Karl Stahl
Søren Nielsen
Julian Drewe
Arvo Viltrop

- Hearing Experts¹: no hearing experts
- European Commission: no representative for the EC
- EFSA: Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou, Anna Eleonora Karagianni, Inma Aznar
- Others: Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The EFSA SO coordinator welcomed the participants. Apologies received from James Bron and Julian Drewe for not being able to participate.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 26th May 2023, via web-conference

The 15th Working Group Meeting Minutes (the previous one on listing and categorisation) were agreed by written procedure on 9th of June 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Expert Judgement on Bacterial Kidney Disease (BKD)

The results of the judgement based on the replies to the individual questions presented to the experts. The reasoning for the questions where no consensus or uncertainty was reached among the experts was thoroughly discussed. After the discussion, some experts reconsidered the range of their scores and amended their initial replies accordingly.

The questions considered as not applicable (NA) by one or more experts were discussed as well and the expert reconsidered and finally provided a new range.

b. Lists of species (susceptible, vectors, reservoirs)

The lists of the susceptible, vector and reservoir species as provided in the fact sheet based on the results of the literature review was provided to the experts for consideration.

VI. Any Other Business

The draft Opinion with the results will be shared first with the experts that participated to the judgement before being shared with the Panel for deep discussion.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting for the Judgemnt of Salmonid Alphavirus will be held on 16 June 2023.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

15th Working Group meeting on Aquatic Animal Diseases

Listing and Categorisation:

Infection with *Gyrodactylus salaris* (GS)

26th of May 2023

13:00-17:00



Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Dominique Bicout
Helen Roberts
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca
David Stone
Hilde Sindre
Niccolo Vendramin
Niels Jørgen Olesen
James Bron
Barbara Padalino
Mette Herskin
Julio Alvarez
Karl Stahl
Søren Nielsen
Julian Drewe

- Hearing Experts¹: no hearing experts
- European Commission: no representative for the EC
- EFSA: Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou, Anna Eleonora Karagianni, Lisa Kohnle
- Others: Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The EFSA SO coordinator welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Bruno Garin-Bastuji and Arvo Viltrop for not being able to participate.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 22nd May 2023, via web-conference

The 14th Working Group Meeting Minutes (the previous one on listing and categorisation) were agreed by written procedure on 9th of June 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Expert Judgement on Infection with *Gyrodactylus salaris* (GS)

The results of the judgement based on the replies to the individual questions presented to the experts. The reasoning for the questions where no consensus or uncertainty was reached among the experts was thoroughly discussed. After the discussion, some experts reconsidered the range of their scores and amended their initial replies accordingly.

The questions considered as not applicable (NA) by one or more experts were discussed as well and the expert reconsidered and finally provided a new range.

b. Lists of species (susceptible, vectors, reservoirs)

The lists of the susceptible, vector and reservoir species as provided in the fact sheet based on the results of the literature review was provided to the experts for consideration.

VI. Any Other Business

The draft Opinion with the results will be shared first with the experts that participated to the judgement before being shared with the Panel for deep discussion.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting for the Judgemnt of the Bacterial kidney disease will be held on 12 June 2023.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

14th Working Group meeting on Aquatic Animal Diseases:
Listing and Categorisation:
Spring Viraemia of carp (SVC)



22nd of May 2023

09:00-13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 9th May 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Dominique Bicout
Helen Roberts
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca
David Stone
Hilde Sindre
Niccolo Vendramin
Niels Jørgen Olesen
James Bron
Julian Drewe
Barbara Padalino
Mette Herskin
Julio Alvarez
Arvo Viltrop
Søren Nielsen

- Hearing Experts¹: no hearing experts
- European Commission: no representatives from the EC
- EFSA: Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou, Anna Eleonora Karagianni, Alessandro Broglia
- Others: Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The EFSA SO coordinator welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Niccolo Vendramin for short delay and from Bruno Garin-Bastuji and Karl Stahl for not being able to attend the meeting.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

The experts James Bron and Mette Herskin declared that they have no new conflicts of interest to declare.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 30th January 2023, via web-conference

The 9th Working Group Meeting Minutes (the previous one on listing and categorisation) were agreed by written procedure on 13th of February 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Expert Judgement on Spring Viraemia of carp (SVC)

The results of the judgment based on the replies to the individual questions presented to the experts. The reasoning for the questions where no consensus was reached among the experts or there was uncertainty, was thoroughly discussed. After the discussion, some experts reconsidered the range of their score and amended their initial replies accordingly.

The questions considered as not applicable (NA) by one or more experts were discussed as well and the expert reconsidered and finally provided a new score.

b. Lists of species (susceptible, vectors, reservoirs)

The lists of the susceptible, vector and reservoir species as provided in the fact sheet based on the results of the literature review was provided to the experts for consideration. The experts on aquatic diseases will use this list to prepare the Opinion.

c. Results on collective judgement

The results of the collective judgement after the discussion will be included in the document of the Scientific Opinion and will be shared with the experts to review the reasoning.

VI. Any Other Business

The draft Opinion with the results will be shared first with the experts that participated to the judgement before being shared with the Panel for deep discussion.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting for the Collective Judgement of the infection with *Gyrodactylus salaris* will be held on 26 May 2023.

15th of May 2023

09:00-13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on the 22nd of May 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Helen Roberts (chair)
Hilde Sindre
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
Niccolo Vendramin
David Stone
Isabel Azul
 - Hearing Experts¹:
Morten Schiott
 - EFSA:
Sofie Dhollander
- Marzia Gnocchi

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Dharmaveer Shetty

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on the 12th of April 2023, via web-conference

The [12th Working Group Meeting Minutes](#) were agreed by written procedure on the 19th of April 2023.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

TOR 1: Finish the assessment of vectors or reservoirs of AHL-listed pathogens of fish, molluscs and crustaceans and deal with remaining comments in Scientific Opinions

The working group members had reviewed the draft Scientific Opinions and dealt with comments, mainly dealing with some inconsistencies in the assessment section. Some papers were identified that still need to be assessed and conclusions need to be updated accordingly. It was agreed to deal with the assessment of the remaining papers in the meeting on the 6th of June 2023.

The working group agreed to:

- Add a column in the assessment tables for the species were already suggested by EURL report as vectors/reservoirs or susceptible species in stead of using the asterisk, to make the comparison more visible. As this may be confusing, it was agreed that this need to be carefully explained in a few additional accompanying paragraphs, that it is just for information and not to be confused with the outcomes of the current assessment.
- Explain the limitations of the methodology, more in particular, explain that the ELS only identifies published information. When there is no study on a specific species, it does not mean it can not be a vector/reservoir as it was just not investigated.
- The working group will deal with comments and improvements of reasoning in the assessment tables in the 3 SO's and perform the remaining individual assessments in the excel file.
- The groups assessment of the remaining papers will be carried out during the last meetng on 6th of June 2023, and the conclusions will be updated
- An additional table will be inserted in the annex of the SO, providing the reason for excusion of studies on specific species during the eligibiligy screening (e.g. not a primary study, not in EU language) and the reasoning when the study passed the eligibiligy screenign and data were extracted, but the assessment had a certainty lower than 66%, so the species was not classified.

TOR2: Discussion on the conclusions of the suitability of the conditions for moving vectors or reservoir species per listed pathogen

The working group members had reviewed the draft opinions and discussed the comments and conclusions concerning the conditions for moving vectors or reservoir species per listed pathogen.

VI. Any Other Business

a. Planning the activities, next WG meeting



The working group agreed on the tasks and responsibilities and deadlines for the next actions.

ACTION:

Mon 22/05/2023:

EFSA:

- Update the 3 Scientific Opinions with the agreed changes during the working group meeting
- Create tables with reasons for exclusion of papers during the eligibility screening and during the assessment
- Add a column in the assessment table for the species that were already suggested by EURL report as vectors/reservoirs or susceptible species in stead of using the asterisk, to make it more visible and provide explanation in methodology.
- Harmonise tables of Mollusc Opinion
- Update the the excel files with the amended reasoning during the working group meeting that were made in the SO's. The excel files will be published as supplementary material.
- Check with EC:
 - If it is reasonable to provide only the conditions for movement of vector species based on biological/scientific reasoning (regardless if their origin is outside or inside the EU). That means that the column may be repeated for input from third countries and intra community movements of vectors.
 - Confirm the latest versions of conditions are in Annex I to Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2020/990 and in Annex XXX to Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2020/692
 - Clarify if there is a need to differentiate between co-habitation and aquaculture, and water supply for the conditions

WORKING GROUP

- Deal with some remaining comments on the wording of reasoning for judgements in scientific opinions
- Review the last papers that were extracted in excel
- Read the sections on the contributions in the draft Opinions and the conclusions

VII. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held on:

- 2023.06.06: from 9-13:00h by webmeeting

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Helen Roberts (chair)
Hilde Sindre
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
Niccolo Vendramin
David Stone

- Hearing Experts¹:
Morten Schiott

- EFSA:
Sofie Dhollander

Marzia Gnocchi

- European Commission:
Fiona Geoghegan

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Dharmaveer Shetty and Isabelle Arzul.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on the 13th of March 2023, via web-conference

The 11th Working Group Meeting Minutes were agreed by written procedure on the 22th of March 2023.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

TOR 1: Group discussions on the individual judgments and uncertainty levels of potential reservoir and vector species

The working group members had reviewed the data that were extracted from the scientific papers and provided their individual judgements and uncertainty on potential vector or reservoir species based on the available data. During the breakout session, these judgments and their reasons were discussed in group and modified where needed and agreed upon by consensus with the working group.

TOR2: Discussion on the suitability of the conditions for moving vectors or reservoirs species.

The working group discussed the sections drafted by the working group members in the section dealing with ToR 2 in the Scientific Opinion.

VI. Any Other Business

a. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

The working group agreed on the tasks and responsibilities and deadlines for the next actions.

VII. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held on:

- 2023.05.15: from 9-13:00h by webmeeting

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Helen Roberts (chair)
Hilde Sindre
Isabelle Arzul
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
Niccolo Vendramin
Dharmaveer Shetty
- Hearing Experts¹:
Morten Schiott
- EFSA:
Sofie Dhollander
Anna Eleonora Karagianni
Marzia Gnocchi
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from David Stone and Fiona Geoghegan.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on the 28th of February 2023, via web-conference

The [10th Working Group Meeting Minutes](#) were agreed by written procedure on the 6th of March 2023.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

TOR 1: Discussion on preliminary data extraction and summary tables of extensive literature review

The preliminary results of the data extraction of papers on molluscs, fish and crustaceans were presented. The comments received by the working group experts on the excel table with the data extraction were discussed.

TOR2: Discussion on the suitability of the conditions for moving vectors or reservoirs species.

The working group discussed the sections drafted by the working group members in the section dealing with ToR 2 in the Scientific Opinion.

VI. Any Other Business

a. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

The working group agreed to scrutinise the data in the extraction table for the papers that were assigned to them and review the section in the Scientific Opinions on the conditions for moving vectors in the legislation, based on the available evidence in literature.

VII. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held on:

- 2023.04.12: from 9-13:00h by webmeeting

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Helen Roberts (chair)
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
David Stone,
Niccolo Vendramin
- Hearing Experts¹:
Morten Schiott
- EFSA:
Sofie Dhollander
Anna Eleonora Karagianni
Marzia Gnocchi
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Hilde Sindre and Isabelle Arzul and Fiona Geoghegan.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on the 28th of January 2023, via web-conference

The 8th Working Group Meeting Minutes were agreed by written procedure on the 3rd of February 2023.

V. Scientific topics for discussion

a. Results of title and abstract screening and full text screening of papers on molluscs, fish and crustaceans

The results of title and abstract screening and full text screening of papers on molluscs, fish and crustaceans was presented to the working group and discussed.

b. Discussion on examples of data extraction and summary tables

The working group discussed a pilot of the data extraction table and discussed the content of the summary tables.

c. TOR2: Discussion on the methodology for assessing the suitability of the conditions for moving vectors or reservoirs species

The working group discussed the methodology for assessing the suitability of the conditions for moving vectors or reservoirs species.

d. Discussion on the structure of the Scientific Opinion and supplementary materials

The working group discussed the structure of the Scientific Opinion and supplementary materials.

VI. Any Other Business

a. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

- The working group agreed to draft the contributions to Section 3.1.2. by 10 March
- EFSA and the contractors will finish the data extraction by 10 March. Intermediary data extracts will be uploaded in the MS Teams space for quality revision by the working group.

VII. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held on:

- 2023.03.13: from 9-13:00h by webmeeting
-

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

9th Working Group meeting on Aquatic Animal Diseases:
Listing and Categorisation

30th of January 2023

13:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 13rd February 2023



Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Dominique Bicout
Helen Roberts
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca
David Stone
Hilde Sindre
Niccolo Vendramin
Niels Jørgen Olesen
James Bron
Barbara Padalino
Mette Herskin
Julio Alvarez
Bruno Garin-Bastuji
Karl Stahl
Arvo Viltrop
Søren Nielsen

- Hearing Experts¹: no hearing experts
- European Commission:
EC: Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:
Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou, Anna Eleonora Karagianni, Lisa Kohnle, Alexandra Papanikolaou
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The EFSA SO coordinator welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Karl Stahl for short delay.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 13th January 2023, via web-conference

The [8th Working Group Meeting Minutes](#) were agreed by written procedure on 3rd of February 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Exert Judgement on Infectious Pancreatic Necrosis (IPN)

The results of the judgment based on the replies to the individual questions presented to the experts. The reasoning for the questions where no consensus was reached among the experts was thoroughly discussed. After the discussion, some experts reconsidered their range of certainty and amended their initial replies accordingly.

The questions considered as not applicable (NA) by one expert were discussed as well and the expert reconsidered and finally provided a range of certainty.

To make the results consistent with the diseases on aquatic animals, one question was discussed once again at the end and amended according to the reasoning provided by the experts. Written reasonings will have to be provided to the resulting Scientific Opinion.

b. Lists of species (susceptible, vectors, reservoirs)

The lists of the susceptible, vector and reservoir species as provided in the fact sheet based on the results of the literature review was provided to the experts for consideration. The experts on aquatic diseases will use this list to prepare the Opinion.

c. Results on collective judgement

The results of the collective judgement after the discussion were presented to the experts.

VI. Any Other Business

The draft Opinion with the results will be shared first with the experts that participated to the judgement before being shared with the Panel for deep discussion.

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held when the fact sheets of the next four diseases will be ready.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

8th Working Group meeting on Aquatic Animal Diseases: Vectors

27th of January 2023

14:30-17:30

MINUTES - Agreed on the 3rd of February 2023



Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Helen Roberts (chair)
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
David Stone,
Niccolo Vendramin

- Hearing Experts¹:

Morten Schiott

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE)

- EFSA:

Inma Aznar, Anna Eleonora Karagianni

- Others:

Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Dharmaveer Shetty, Hilde Sindre and Isabelle Arzul.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on the 10th of January 2023, via web-conference

The 7th Working Group Meeting Minutes were agreed by written procedure on the 23rd of January 2023.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Draft opinion on working definition of vectors and reservoirs and parameters to address ToR 2(EFSA-Q-2007-044, EFSA- Q-2007-061, EFSA-Q-2007-062)

A draft protocol for an extensive literature review to gather evidence of vectors and reservoir species of listed diseases of fish, molluscs and crustaceans was shared with the WG experts in MS Teams before the meeting. The working group experts submitted their comments ahead of the meeting, and the draft protocol was amended accordingly. The remaining comments were discussed during the meeting. The working group experts agreed on the content of the review protocol with the exception of the data extraction table, for which they were given time up to Wednesday the 1st of February 2023 to comment.

VI. Any Other Business

a. Information on the Procurements

The WG members were informed that the literature review on molluscs will be carried out by a consortium led by Stichting Wageningen Research (WBVR Wageningen Bioveterinary Research), with as partners the Marine Institute (Irleand) and the Insitut De Recerca I Tecnologia Agroalimentaries (IRTA). The contractors have agreed to follow the same review protocol and perform the review in Distiller

b. Distiller

A short demonstration was provided of the Distiller literature review platform, in which the review will be carried out.

c. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

The planning of the remaining tasks and working group meeting was discussed. The data and time of the next working group meetings has been agreed upon (see below).



VII. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held on:

- 2023.02.28: from 9-12:00h by webmeeting
- 2023.03.13: from 9-13:00h by webmeeting
- 2023.04.12: from 9-13:00h by webmeeting
- 2023.05.15: from 9-13:00h by webmeeting
- 2023.06.06: from 9-13:00h by webmeeting

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

7th Working Group meeting on Aquatic Animal Diseases: Vectors

10th of January 2023

13:00-17:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 23rd January 2023



Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Helen Roberts (chair)
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Isabelle Arzul,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
Hilde Sindre,
David Stone,
Niccolo Vendramin

- Hearing Experts¹:

Dharmaveer Shetty
Morten Schiott

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
EC: Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE)

- EFSA:
Inma Aznar, Anna Eleonora Karagianni

- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou for not joining the meeting due to health issues (sick leave).

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 12th December 2022, via web-conference

The [6th Working Group Meeting Minutes](#) were agreed by written procedure on 12th of December 2022.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

a. Draft opinion on working definition of vectors and reservoirs and parameters to address ToR 2 (EFSA-Q-2007-044, EFSA-Q-2007-061, EFSA-Q-2007-062)

A draft document, developed during the previous WG meeting on 14th of November 2022, on the definition of vectors/reservoirs and the list with the criteria/parameters, was made available to the WG experts in SharePoint before the meeting. Experts submitted their comments ahead of the meeting and the definition of vector and reservoir species was discussed thoroughly by the WG members. The experts agreed on a working definition of vectors and reservoirs, close to that used by WOA, for the purpose of this mandate.

In terms of the parameters to be gathered to address ToR 2, the WG members agreed to collect data on the environmental temperature (in combination with time) reported in experimental studies under which transmission events took place as well as on the survival time of the agents in the environment as reported in the literature. Although other parameters may influence whether transmission takes place, it was not clear whether gathering the data would be possible under the existing time constraints.

VI. Any Other Business

a. Information on the Procurements

The WG members were informed that the FWC to carry out the literature review on molluscs had been awarded, although the Framework Contract had not been signed yet. EFSA is considering using a special procurement to carry out the literature review on crustaceans while keeping the literature review for fish to be carried out in-house.

b. Dossier for the contractor(s)

The Dossier to be provided to the contractors has not been finalised.

c. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

The coming activities for the working group are:

- a) to finalise the Methodology of the assessment, based on the criteria and the parameters already defined
-



- b) to finalise the Dossier to be provided to the contractors

VII. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 27th January 2023, via web conference.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE/ BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 6th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AQUATIC ANIMAL DISEASES: VECTORS

Held on VIDEO -conference, 12 December 2022

(Agreed on 19 December 2022)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:²

Helen Roberts (chair)

Dominique Bicout

Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,

Isabelle Arzul,

Niels Jorgen Olesen,

Hilde Sindre,

David Stone,

Niccolo Vendramin

■ Hearing Experts³:

Dharmaveer Shetty

Morten Schiott

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE)

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

- EFSA: BIOHAW (Animal Health)
Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou, Inma Aznar, Anna Eleonora Karagianni

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the Working Group meeting held on 14 November 2022 in WEB.

The minutes of the previous WG meeting on Vectors on 14 November 2022 agreed through written procedures on 25 November 2022.

5. Hearing Expert (s)⁶

Dr Dharmaveer Shetty from World Organisation of Animal Health (WOAH) and Dr Morten Schiott from the EURL on Crustaceans were invited to attend this WG meeting.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁷

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁷ EFSA-Q-2022-00551 (<https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health>)



6.1. Working document on definition of vectors, reservoirs criteria and parameters

The WG had agreed in a previous meeting on the definition of the vectors. The definition on reservoirs has not been finalised. The second draft document developed during the previous WG meeting on 14th of November 2022 on the definition of vectors/reservoirs and the list with the criteria/parameters, was cleaned and was available to the WG experts in the SharePoint on the 2nd of December 2022. No comments were received in between the WG meetings by the experts. The definition of reservoir species was discussed thoroughly by the WG members and the EC representative. The addition of the term *groups of species* was agreed by the WG panel, to be added in the definition of reservoirs. The experts also agreed to omit the term *a long time* from the same definition. It was decided to finalise the definition of the Reservoirs and then the group would look at the Methodology. The discussion on this part took more time than expected and there was not enough time left to finalise the definition on reservoirs or proceed with the rest of the comments in the document and discussion on the conditions for movements.

Regarding the open call on vectors the working group informed that only one tenderer awarded for the molluscs. For fish and crustacea EFSA will search for other solutions.

6.2. Methodology on the assessment

A discussion took place on how the criteria and the parameters are going to be used to assess the aquatic species and classify them as vectors or reservoirs. The Section Methodology of the Scientific Opinion was shared with the WG Members. The discussion focussed on the section *B. Categorization criteria* of the document where agreement was not reached on a harmonised definition or set of criteria. The experts recommended not to rely on the clinical signs /pathology as a parameter for the categorization of species between Reservoir and Vectors, because the clinical signs in certain aquatic animal species are difficult if not impossible to define (i.e. Molluscs). A suggestion was made to split Criterion B: [B1: Viable pathogenic agent is isolated from the X (or) B2: infectivity is demonstrated by way of transmission to naive individuals (X1 to X2)] into B1 and B2 in the table.

Some other suggestions were made to modify the table, such as the inclusion of biological transmission through vectors; this table will be amended and proposed to the working group again in the next few days, following the panel meeting.

6.3. Dossier for the contractor(s)

The Dossier to be provided to the contractors has not been finalised.

6.4. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

The coming activities for the working group are:

- a) to finalise the definition of the term *Reservoirs* to define and describe the conditions under which the aquatic animal species resulted from ToR1 should be regarded as vectors or reservoirs for the purposes of movement
- c) to finalise the Methodology of the assessment, based on the criteria and the parameters already defined

7. Any Other Business

7.1. Item

7.2. Not Applicable

8. Next meeting(s)

The next working group meeting was arranged on:

Tuesday 10 January 2023, 13:00 to 17:00 CET



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE/ BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 5th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AQUATIC ANIMAL DISEASES: LISTING AND CATEGORISATION

Held on VIDEO -conference, 5 December 2022

(Agreed on 15 December 2022)¹

Participants

- Working Group Members:²
Dominique Bicot, (chair),
Helen Roberts
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
Hilde Sindre,
David Stone,
Niccolo Vendramin
James Bron
- Hearing Experts³:
Not applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE)
- EFSA: BIOHAW (Animal Health)
Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou, Anna KARAGIANNI

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the Working Group meeting held on 14 November 2022, via VIDEO/WEB/TELE-conference.

The minutes of the previous WG meeting agreed through written procedure on 25 November 2022.

5. Hearing Expert (s)⁶

Not applicable for this WG meeting.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Review and Discussion on the Fact sheet of Infectious Pancreatic Necrosis (IPN)⁷

The first draft of the fact sheet of Infectious Pancreatic Necrosis was delivered by the contractor on the 18th of November 2022 (as agreed in the contract) and shared with the WG members to review.

During the meeting all the comments by the experts were discussed and proposals for improvement were added to be shared with the contractor. The fact sheet includes detailed information and covers all the topics needed for the Judgement exercise. The experts were satisfied by the result.

6.2. Preparation for the Judgement exercise

The Judgement exercise for the listing and categorisation of the diseases will be conducted by both Panel and WG members. The Panel members will be added as members of the WG, and they

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁷ EFSA-Q-2022-00551 (<https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health>)

will be invited only for the meetings when the judgements will take place. Eleven Panel members will be involved to this activity. The dates of the meetings will be arranged ad hoc per disease based on the availability of the experts. The results of the judgement will be included in the document of the Scientific Opinion (SO) be shared with the Panel for deep discussion through written procedure (tollgate 2). The final version of the SO will be submitted for adoption to the Panel (tollgate 3). The coordinator of the WG meetings for the Judgement Exercise will be an EFSA officer. EFSA was under the process to engage three ISA experts for three additional diseases, but the process hadn't been finalised.

The WG members had been informed on the procedure and the methodology at the 1st WG. Nevertheless, a recorded presentation was prepared and shared to be available to the experts at any time. A draft excel sheet with the questions and the information from the fact sheet has been prepared and shared to the WG members before the meeting to give them the opportunity to get an overview of the exercise and have a look to the questions in terms of clarity and relevance.

7. Any Other Business

7.1. Item

7.2. Not Applicable

8. Next meeting(s)

The next working group meeting on Listing and Categorisation will be held on the 30th of January 2023 and will be assigned to the Judgement exercise for the listing and categorisation of the Infectious Pancreatic Necrosis (IPN). The fact sheet and the excel file will be shared with the experts at the beginning of 2023 and the deadline to provide their individual assessments to EFSA will be 20 January 2023.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE/ BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 4th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AQUATIC ANIMAL DISEASES: VECTORS

Held on VIDEO -conference, 14 November 2022

(Agreed on 25 November 2022)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:²

Helen Roberts (chair)

Dominique Bicout

Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,

Isabelle Arzul,

Niels Jorgen Olesen,

Hilde Sindre,

David Stone,

Niccolo Vendramin

■ Hearing Experts³:

Dharmaveer Shetty

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE)

■ EFSA: BIOHAW (Animal Health)

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Morten Schiott, for not being available to join the meeting and from Isabelle Arzul for leaving the meeting earlier due to another commitment.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the Working Group meeting held on 24 October 2022 in WEB.

The minutes of the previous WG meeting on Vectors on 24 October 2022 agreed through written procedures on 8 November 2022.

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Dr Dharmaveer Shetty from World Organisation of Animal Health (WOAH) and Dr Morten Schiott from the EURL on Crustaceans invited to attend this WG meeting.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁶

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ EFSA-Q-2022-00551 (<https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health>)



6.1. Working document on definition of vectors, reservoirs criteria and parameters

The first draft document developed during the previous WG meeting on 24 October 2022 with the definition of Vectors and the list with the criteria/parameters was cleaned and was available to the WG experts in SharePoint on 25 October 2022. The experts and the EC representative requested to have a more thorough look and provide suggestions for improvement. Minor comments received and addressed in between the WG meetings. The discussion on this part took more time than expected and didn't leave enough time to proceed with other topics as planned. The vectors and reservoirs species to be assessed for the purpose of this Mandate will be restricted to the Aquatic Animal species as defined in AHL. Other group of species that may play the role of vectors or reservoirs will be out of the scope of this Mandate (e.g. tunicate, echinoderms, amphibians). Experts highlighted that it is important to specify in the literature review that will be conducted by the Contractors how the species of the aquatic animals has been identified since some species are very similar and not easy to be defined based on the morphological characteristics alone (e.g. *Mytilus edulis*/*M. galloprovincialis*).

For the definition of reservoirs the same exercise was applied as for vectors. As agreed in the previous WG meeting the experts provided the definitions of the term *reservoir*. They considered that the same criteria and parameters applicable for vectors should also applied for the reservoirs. The definitions added in an excel sheet and the similarities and differences were identified and discussed. Linea also presented the definitions on reservoirs found in the literature and these reflect the variability on defining these terms within the scientific community.

There is no definition for the term reservoir in the current EU legislation or the WOH Aquatic Code. From the definitions provided on reservoirs the experts agreed on the following points: i) the reservoir can be considered any aquatic animal species in which the pathogenic agent can persist (live and multiply) for a long time and therefore can be the source of the pathogenic agent for other aquatic animal species, ii) the reservoir has the potential to transmit (may or may not) the pathogenic agent to other susceptible species and/or vector species, iii) vectors can also play the role of reservoirs, iv) reservoirs do not show any clinical and pathological (clinical signs, lesion in tissues and/or cells) manifestation of the disease caused by the pathogenic agent.

6.2. Protocol for the assessment

The first draft of the protocol is ready. The comments by the WG were implemented. The protocol will remain generic, and all the details will be provided in the Section Methodology of the Scientific Opinion. The draft protocol will be shared with the Panel members and will be discussed during the next Panel meeting.

6.3. Dossier for the contractor(s)

A dossier with all available information and documents to support the work of the contractor(s) should be also prepared and be available at the date when the contract is signed.

6.4. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

The coming activities for the working group are:

- a) to improve the protocol of this Mandate, after receiving the feedback from AHAW plenary meeting on 23-24 November
- b) to improve the definition of the term *Reservoirs* to define and describe the conditions under which the aquatic animal species resulted from ToR1 should be regarded as vectors or reservoirs for the purposes of movement
- c) to develop the Methodology of the assessment, based on the criteria and the parameters already defined

7. Next meeting(s)

The next working group meetings up until the end of the year (2022):

Monday **12 December 2022, 13:00 to 17:00** CET



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE/ BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AQUATIC ANIMAL DISEASES: VECTORS

Held on VIDEO -conference, 24 October 2022

(Agreed on 8 November 2022)¹

Participants

- Working Group Members:²
Dominique Bicot (chair)
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Isabelle Arzul,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
Hilde Sindre,
David Stone,
Niccolo Vendramin
- Hearing Experts³:
Morten Schiott,
Dharmaveer Shetty
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE)
- EFSA: BIOHAW (Animal Health)

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou,
Inmaculada Aznar Asensio,

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Helen Roberts for not being available to join the meeting and therefore Dominique Bicot chaired the meeting. Apologies for delay received from Dharmaveer Shetty and Hilde Sindre.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes except of the fact that Dominique Bicot was the chair of the WG.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the Working Group meeting held on 30 September 2022 in WEB.

The minutes of the previous WG meeting on Vectors on 30 September 2022 agreed through written procedures on 10 October 2022.

5. Hearing Expert (s)⁶

Dr Dharmaveer Shetty from World Organisation of Animal Health (WOAH) and Dr Morten Schiott from the EURL on Crustaceans invited to attend this WG meeting.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Protocol for the assessment⁷

Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou from EFSA presented the first draft of the protocol for the assessment. The comments made by the WG were discussed and proposals for improvements were made. The protocol needs further development especially the interpretation of terms of references related to the definitions of vectors and reservoirs. The data/information needed from the contractors based

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁷ : EFSA-Q-2022-00551 (<https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health>)

on the criteria/parameters could also be include in the protocol. The document of the protocol is available to the WG for further development and improvement.

6.2. Definition of Vectors, criteria and parameters

As agreed in the previous WG meeting the experts provided the definitions of the terms *vector* and define the criteria, sub-criteria and the parameters to classify the aquatic animal species as vectors or reservoirs. The definitions and the parameters were collated in an excel sheet and the similarities and differences were identified and discussed.

The definition of vectors as described in the Aquatic Animal Health Code by WOAHA was considered more generic and covers most of the definitions that have been proposed by the experts. The experts agreed on the following points: i) a vector is an aquatic species, ii) vector transmits the pathogenic agent to the susceptible species, iii) a vector for a specific disease should not be susceptible for this disease, iii) there is lack of evidence to classify a vector as susceptible, iv) vectors can be differentiated between mechanical and biological vectors, v) for the vectors there is lack of evidence of pathogen replication and/or a disease pathology following a natural challenge.

In order to avoid generating another definition of vectors and given that the definition of WOAHA is generic and doesn't deviate a lot from the definitions provided by the experts, it was agreed that the definition by WOAHA could be used for the purpose of this assessment in combination with the Terms of references of the Mandate and their interpretation. This part will be further developed in the protocol and discussed in the following WG meetings.

The criteria/parameters that will be used to classify the aquatic animal species and for which the Contractor will look for information in the literature were also discussed and the first draft list has been developed during the meeting. This list will be reviewed and updated if needed in the next WG meeting.

6.3. Dossier for the contractor(s)

A dossier with all available information and documents to support the work of the contractor(s) should be also prepared and be available at the date when the contract is signed.

6.4. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

The coming activities for the working group are:

- a) to improve the protocol of this Mandate, to be presented in the next AHAW plenary meeting on 23-24 November
- b) to come up with the definition of the term *Reservoirs*
- c) to improve the list of the criteria, the sub-criteria, and the parameters in order to classify the aquatic animal species as vectors or reservoirs of the diseases
- d) to define and describe the conditions under which the aquatic animal species resulted from ToR1 should be regarded as vectors or reservoirs for the purposes of movement.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next working group meetings up until the end of the year (2022):

Monday 14 November **2022 9:00 to 13:00 CET**

Monday 12 December **2022 13:00 to 17:00 CET**



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE/ BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 2nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AQUATIC ANIMAL DISEASES: VECTORS

Held on VIDEO -conference, 30 September 2022

(Agreed on 10 October 2022)¹

Participants

- Working Group Members:²
Helen Roberts (chair),
Dominique Bicout,
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Isabelle Arzul,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
Hilde Sindre,
David Stone,
Niccolo Vendramin

- Hearing Experts³:
Morten Schiott,
Dharmaveer Shetty

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE)

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

- EFSA: BIOHAW (Animal Health)
Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou,
Inmaculada Aznar Asensio,
Linnea Lindgren Kero

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Dominique Bicout and Isabelle Arzul for not being able to attend the whole meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Expert (s)

Dr Dharmaveer Shetty from World Organisation of Animal Health (WOAH) and Dr Morten Schiott from the EURL on Crustaceans invited to attend this WG meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Presentation of the Mandate and discussion on terms of references⁶

Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou from EFSA presented **one of the** two new mandates on aquatic diseases, **related to** vectors for aquatic **animal** diseases. The European Commission **requested** EFSA for a scientific opinion on the listing of vector species of aquatic animals in accordance with Article 8 of Regulation (EU) 2016/429. The mandate also includes an assessment of the suitability of the conditions under which the species should be regarded as vectors or reservoirs. The listing will exclude those already listed under Art.8 in the AHL **as susceptible**. The Terms of Reference were presented with details and a preliminary interpretation was conducted to better understand the request in the Mandate.

Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE) provided explanations on the Terms Of References of the mandate and clarifications on the related EU regulations.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ : EFSA-Q-2022-00551 (<https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health>)

Discussion regarding the definition of vector and reservoir. The conclusion by the working group was that it is essential for the scientific opinion to develop a definition for vector and reservoir species and provide the criteria, sub-criteria and the parameters to classify the aquatic animal species as vectors. This activity will be the first step for the work and will allow and harmonised assessment of the vectors across the diseases.

5.2. Workflow of the Mandate, Methodology and Protocol Development

Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou from EFSA presented how the work on the mandate will be conducted.

It was agreed that the WG will come up with the definitions of the terms *vector* and *reservoir* and will define the criteria, sub-criteria and the parameters to classify the aquatic animal species as vectors or reservoirs. The output of this activity will be provided to the external contractor. For this purpose, an open call for tender will be launched.

The external contractor will perform an extensive literature review, to identify data/information on the definitions for vector and reservoir the criteria, sub-criteria and parameters. For each one of the animal species that have been assessed as vector or reservoirs, the contractor will investigate the conditions under which these species can transmit the relevant diseases.

In addition, the contractor will conduct the initial assessment meaning which vectors fulfil the criteria to be classified as vectors per each one of the diseases.

The work of the contractors will be reviewed by the WG and feedback will be provided for all the deliverables of the contractors. The contractors will be invited to the WG meetings to provide clarifications. The tasks and the deliverables to be included in the Technical Specifications have been presented, discussed and agreed within the WG.

In total three scientific opinions will be delivered: one for fish, one for molluscs and one for crustaceans. The deadline is 30 June 2023.

The development of the protocol for this Mandate where the methodology will be described will be discussed during the next WG meeting.

5.3. Fish Report: Presentation of the methodology, definition of vector and the protocol of the Literature Review

Niccolo Vendramin presented the work conducted by the EURL on fish and crustaceans to list vectors and susceptible species for certain fish diseases. The groundwork came from criteria for susceptibility of WOA (OIE) and criteria and sub criteria were used.

5.4. Crustaceans Report: Presentation of the methodology, definition of vector and the protocol of the Literature Review

Morten Schiott presented on the work of updating the AHL list of vector and susceptible species for certain diseases in crustaceans. In principle he same methodology as for the update on fish was used.

5.5. Molluscs Report: Presentation of the methodology, definition of vector and the protocol of the Literature Review

Isabelle Arzul presented on the work of updating the AHL list of vector and susceptible species for certain diseases in molluscs. In principle the same methodology as for the update on fish was used.

5.6. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

The coming activities for the working group are:

- a) to develop the methodology and draft the protocol of this Mandate, to be discussed and approved by the next AHAW plenary meeting on 23-24 November. To do this the Terms of

Reference needs to be translated into questions and sub-questions, the needs should be specified and the methodology to meet the objectives of the Mandate should be developed.

- b) to come up with the definition of the terms *Vectors* and *Reservoirs* and the criteria, the sub-criteria, and the parameters in order to classify the aquatic animal species as vectors of the diseases. This activity should be finalised by the end of November and the output should be available to the contractor/s once they sign the contract with EFSA (probably in December). The experts will start to work on this topic looking for the definitions and the criteria in their field of expertise.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Not Applicable

7. Next meeting(s)

The next working group meeting is scheduled for the week of 24-28 October 2022 and another one in mid-November. A DOODLE will be distributed to check the availability of the experts.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE/ BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS & ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE UNIT (BIOHAW)

MINUTES OF THE 1st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AQUATIC ANIMAL DISEASES: LISTING AND CATEGORISATION

Held on VIDEO -conference, 29 September 2022

(Agreed on 12 October 2022)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:²

Dominique Bicout, (chair),
Helen Roberts
Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca,
Niels Jorgen Olesen,
Hilde Sindre,
David Stone,
Niccolo Vendramin
James Bron

■ Hearing Experts³:

Not applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE)

■ EFSA: BIOHAW (Animal Health)

Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou,

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

Inmaculada Aznar Asensio,
Linnea Lindgren Kero

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Expert (s)

Not applicable for this WG meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Presentation of the Mandate and discussion on terms of references⁶

Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou from EFSA presented **one of the** two new mandates on aquatic diseases, **related to listing and categorisation of five** diseases. In July 2022 EC requested for a scientific opinion related to the listing and categorisation of certain diseases of aquatic animals and the listing of relevant aquatic species, in the framework of the Animal Health Law (EU Regulation 2016/429): Spring viraemia of carp (SVC), Bacterial kidney disease (BKD), Infectious pancreatic necrosis (IPN), Infection with Gyrodactylus salaris (GS), Infection with salmonid alphavirus (SAV).

The Terms of Reference were presented, and a preliminary interpretation was conducted to better understand the request in the Mandate.

Fiona Geoghegan (DG SANTE) provided explanations on the Terms of References of the mandate and clarifications on the related EU regulations.

5.2. Methodology

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ EFSA-Q-2022-00551 (<https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00551?foodDomains=Animal%20Health>)

Dominique Bicot (chair) presented the Methodology as described in the Scientific Opinion of 2017⁷. The criteria, sub-criteria, and the parameters to be used for the assessment were presented to the WG. The structure and the content of the table with the parameters and the fact sheet were also presented and discussed. Already published Scientific Opinions were shared to show the consistency in the content and the structure of the documents across the diseases.

5.3. Planning the activities, next WG meeting

In total five Scientific Opinions will be delivered (one per disease). The deadline is 30 September 2023. The Scientific Opinions will be adopted gradually as soon they are ready.

The fact sheet of the diseases with information on the criteria, sub-criteria and the parameters will be drafted by external contractors (ISA schema or procurement). The contractors will perform extensive literature review based on detailed and structured instructions provided by EFSA. The process is standardised and has been implemented in the previous years for listing and categorisation of other diseases (30 in total).

The WG experts expressed their reluctance in case the fact sheets will be developed by contractors without expertise in aquatic animal diseases even though they have expertise in conducting literature review. EFSA explained that has recognised this risk and has established this WG of experts in aquatic animal diseases to review the factsheets and provide support to the AHAW Panel. The work of the contractors will be reviewed by the WG and feedback will be provided for all the deliverables of the contractors. Any additional information that the WG experts consider important will be provided to the contractors to ensure that important evidence will not be excluded. The contractors will be invited to the WG meetings to provide clarifications in case it is necessary.

Up until the day of the WG meeting two contractors offered to draft the fact sheets for two out of five diseases: Infectious pancreatic necrosis (IPN) and Spring viraemia of carp (SVC). The contracts had not been signed but the deadlines for the Draft Fact sheets are 18 November 2022 and 30 December 2022 accordingly. The WG experts will have approximately two weeks to review the fact sheets and provide comments.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Not Applicable

7. Next meeting(s)

The next working group meeting will be scheduled based on the dates that the contractors will deliver the fact sheets of the diseases probably late November early December. The following working group meetings will be scheduled based on the dates of the delivery of the factsheets according to the contractors.

⁷ Ad hoc method for the assessment on listing and categorisation of animal diseases within the framework of the Animal Health Law (<https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/j.efsa.2017.4783>).