

11th working group meeting on CWD monitoring

Location: European Food Safety Authority, webminutes

Attendees:

- **Working group members:** Giuseppe Ru (chair), Marion Simmons (vice-chair), Michael W. Miller, Atle Mysterud, Maria Nöremark, Michael A. Tranulis, Gabriele Vaccari, Hildegunn Viljugrein
- **EFSA:** Angel Ortiz Pelaez (BIOHAW).

I. Welcome and apologies

- The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

II. Adoption of the agenda

- The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Approval of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 17 February 2023¹

- The minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 17 February 2023 were agreed by written procedure on 23 February 2023.

IV. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

- In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.
- No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

- The points discussed during the meeting were: the review of the answers to the ToRs and the pending issues in the body of the text following the last circulation of the draft. Special attention was paid to the uncertainty analysis, to the denomination of the genetic data and to the general considerations for future surveillance in ToR3. A number of changes were made in the document and actions were agreed relating to changes to the current draft of the opinion. All members of the working group agreed with the final draft of the answers to the ToRs.

¹ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2022-04/cwdmonitoring.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>



VI. Next meetings

- This was the last meeting of the WG. EFSA thanked the members for their active participation throughout the lifespan of the mandate.

VII. AOB

- There was no other business. The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

10th working group meeting on CWD monitoring

Location: European Food Safety Authority, webminutes

Attendees:

- **Working group members:** Giuseppe Ru (chair), Marion Simmons (vice-chair), Michael W. Miller, Atle Mysterud, Maria Nöremark, Michael A. Tranulis, Gabriele Vaccari, Hildegunn Viljugrein
- **EFSA:** Cezara Ancuta Simon, Angel Ortiz Pelaez (BIOHAW).

I. Welcome and apologies

- The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

II. Adoption of the agenda

- The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Approval of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 1 February 2023¹

- The minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 1 February 2023 were agreed by written procedure on 6 February 2023.

IV. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

- In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.
- No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

- The chair provided feedback of the thorough reading that took place during the plenary of the BIOHAZ Panel on 25-26 January 2023. The points discussed during the meeting were: the review of the draft section on ToR5 and the subsection in ToR2 on genetic variability of European cervid population; ToR3 on the recommendations of surveillance; and ToR4 on the criteria to assess the probability of occurrence of CWD. A number of actions were agreed related to changes to the current draft of the opinion.

¹ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2022-04/cwdmonitoring.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>



VI. Next meetings

The next and 11th WG meeting will be the last of the working group. It will take place as a half-day web meeting on Monday 27 February 2023.

VII. AOB

- There was no other business. The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

9th working group meeting on CWD monitoring

Location: European Food Safety Authority, webminutes

Attendees:

- **Working group members:** Giuseppe Ru (chair), Marion Simmons (vice-chair), Michael W. Miller, Atle Mysterud, Maria Nöremark, Michael A. Tranulis, Gabriele Vaccari, Hildegunn Viljugrein
- **EFSA:** Angel Ortiz Pelaez (BIOHAW).

I. Welcome and apologies

- The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

II. Adoption of the agenda

- The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Approval of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 10 January 2023¹

- The minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 10 January 2023 were agreed by written procedure on 16 January 2023.

IV. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

- In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.
- No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

- The chair provided feedback of the plenary of the BIOHAZ Panel that took place on 25-26 January 2023 in which the draft opinion was presented for thorough reading. The main contentious issue raised by the Panel was the use of "negligible risk" as proposed by the WG to replace the term "non-infected area" in ToR4. The chair explained the new proposal of not using any term to define the proposed criteria and leave to risk managers how to call and apply it. The rest of the draft answers to the ToR were welcomed by the Panel and its members did not raise any issue when presented. The chair led the review of the current draft addressing the comments in the document and making changes along. The draft opinion will be submitted for possible adoption to the plenary of 15-16 March 2023.

¹ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2022-04/cwdmonitoring.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>



VI. Next meetings

- The schedule of meetings for the rest of the mandate was agreed as follows:
10th WG meeting: half-day web meeting on 27 February 2023.
Extra meeting 11th WG meeting: half-day web meeting scheduled for Friday 17 February 2023.

VII. AOB

- There was no other business. The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

8th working group meeting on CWD monitoring

Location: European Food Safety Authority, webminutes

Attendees:

- **Working group members:** Giuseppe Ru (chair), Marion Simmons (vice-chair), Michael W. Miller, Atle Mysterud, Maria Nöremark, Gabriele Vaccari, Hildegunn Viljugrein
- **EFSA:** Ruben Barcia, Joana Lourenco, Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Ancuta Cezara Simon.

I. Welcome and apologies

- The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Michael Tranulis.

II. Adoption of the agenda

- The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Approval of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 17 November 2022¹

- The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 17 November 2022 were agreed by written procedure on 25 November 2022.

IV. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

- In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.
- No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

V. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

- The chair provided feedback of the plenary of the BIOHAZ Panel in which the draft opinion was presented for first reading. Three points were questioned by the Panel: the use of the term "negligible risk", which is not recommended because of its connotations to risk management; if the uncertainty will be expressed in the conclusions in a quantitative way, to which the WG Chair replied that it will be done by using the probability scores of the EFSA uncertainty guidance; and the recommendation by one Panel member to reduce the body of the evidence for ToR1 and move some parts to Appendices. The new outputs of the sensitivity model were presented and discussed. ToR3 and ToR4 were thoroughly discussed and the surveillance recommendations and criteria for negligible risk status were

¹ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2022-04/cwdmonitoring.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>



consolidated. The draft answers to the ToRs will be redrafted after the meeting and reviewed by the working group. The draft must be submitted to the Panel for thorough reading on 18 January 2023.

VI. Next meetings

- The schedule of meetings for the rest of the mandate was agreed as follows:
 - 9th WG meeting: half-day web meeting on 1 February 2023.
 - 10th WG meeting: half-day web meeting on 27 February 2023.
- It was agreed to circulate a poll to fix a possible extra meeting in mid-February in case it is necessary. It will be decided in the next meeting.

VII. AOB

- There was no other business. The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting
-



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 7th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE MONITORING OF CWD

(EFSA-Q-2022-00114)

Physical meeting. Oslo. 17 November 2022

(Agreed on 25 November 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Giuseppe Ru (chair)
 - Marion Simmons (vice-chair)
 - Michael W. Miller
 - Atle Mysterud
 - Maria Nöremark
 - Michael A. Tranulis
 - Hildegunn Viljugrein

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Angel Ortiz Peláez

- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for the physical attendance from Gabriele Vaccari. He could not connect via weblink.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 20 October 2022²

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 20 October 2022 were agreed by written procedure on 27 October 2022.

4. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Scientific opinion on the monitoring of CWD (EFSA-Q-2022-00114)⁵

The chair provided brief feedback from the BIOHAZ plenary in which the draft opinion was presented for the first time. The chair and the working group (WG) reviewed the Terms of Reference one by one, with special emphasis to the results of the Sensitivity model and concluding remarks for ToR1, the surveillance objectives and surveillance proposals for ToR3, and the criteria to define a non-infected area for ToR4. Some comments of the draft opinion were reviewed and addressed, and a number of actions were agreed to be completed in the next 10 days so that they can be incorporated to the draft submitted to the BIOHAZ Panel for first reading on 6-7 December 2022. Dates for the meeting in 2023 were also agreed.

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting(s)

The schedule of meetings for the rest of the mandate was agreed as follows:

² <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-biohaz-wg-applications-alternative-methods-use-or-disposal-animal-products-or-derived-products.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>

8th WG meeting: half-day web meeting on 10 January 2023.

9th WG meeting: half-day web meeting on 1 February 2023.

10th WG meeting: half-day web meeting on 27 February 2023.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 6th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE MONITORING OF CWD

(EFSA-Q-2022-00114)

Web-meeting. 20 October 2022

(Agreed on 27 October 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Giuseppe Ru (chair)
 - Marion Simmons (vice-chair)
 - Michael W. Miller
 - Atle Mysterud
 - Maria Nöremark
 - Michael A. Tranulis
 - Gabriele Vaccari
 - Hildegunn Viljugrein

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Angel Ortiz Peláez, Kateryna Chuzhakina

- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 5-6 September July 2022²

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 5-6 September 2022 were agreed by written procedure on 14 September 2022.

4. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Scientific opinion on the monitoring of CWD (EFSA-Q-2022-00114)⁵

The chair and the working group (WG) reviewed the actions agreed in the previous meetings. ToR3 was discussed and a proposal for surveillance based on different objectives was presented by the chair. It will be further elaborated for the next meeting. Then, the agreement reached on ToR4 in the previous meeting was rediscussed in the light of new contributions to the draft opinion by some working group members. The answer to this ToR4 will be drafted for the next meeting. ToR5 was briefly discussed pending for more contributions. Finally, the material of ToR1 was reviewed, especially the subsections not finalised yet. A number of actions were agreed to be completed before the next meeting.

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting(s)

² <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-biohaz-wg-applications-alternative-methods-use-or-disposal-animal-products-or-derived-products.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>

The 7th WG meeting will take place as a one-day physical meeting at the University of Oslo, Oslo (Norway). There are not further dates agreed for the meetings in 2023.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 5th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE MONITORING OF CWD

(EFSA-Q-2022-00114)

Physical meeting. 5-6 September 2022

(Agreed on 14 September 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Giuseppe Ru (chair)
 - Marion Simmons (vice-chair)
 - Michael W. Miller
 - Atle Mysterud
 - Maria Nöremark
 - Michael A. Tranulis
 - Gabriele Vaccari
 - Hildegunn Viljugrein

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Angel Ortiz Peláez

- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 18 July 2022²

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 10 June 2022 were agreed by written procedure on 25 July 2022.

4. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Scientific opinion on the monitoring of CWD (EFSA-Q-2022-00114)⁵

The chair and the working group (WG) reviewed the actions agreed in the previous meetings, almost all of which had been completed. Then each Term of Reference was reviewed based on what was in the draft opinion presented for discussion. ToR1 and ToR2 are well developed and are at the stage of drafting concluding remarks. ToR3, ToR4 and ToR5 were discussed again, and final approaches agreed. The assessment and sub-assessment questions were reviewed in the light of the latest discussions and further refinements will be made. The comments in the document were also [addressed](#) and actions were agreed on agreed to solve a number of them [revised](#) them. A number of actions were agreed to be completed before the next meeting.

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting(s)

² <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-biohaz-wg-applications-alternative-methods-use-or-disposal-animal-products-or-derived-products.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>

The 6th WG meeting will take place as a half-day web-meeting on Thursday 20 October 2022 pm. The WG agreed to hold the 7th WG meeting on Thursday 17 November 2022, as a one-day physical meeting in at the University of Oslo, Oslo (Norway).



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 4th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE MONITORING OF CWD

(EFSA-Q-2022-00114)

Web-meeting. 18 July 2022

(Agreed on 25 July 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

- Giuseppe Ru (chair)
- Marion Simmons (vice-chair)
- Michael W. Miller
- Atle Mysterud
- Maria Nöremark
- Michael A. Tranulis
- Gabriele Vaccari
- Hildegunn Viljugrein

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

BIOHAW Unit: Maria Francesca Iulietto, Kateryna Chuzhakina, Angel Ortiz Peláez

iDATA: Perry Koevoets

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 10 June 2022²

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 10 June 2022 were agreed by written procedure on 17 June 2022.

4. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex I.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Scientific opinion on the monitoring of CWD (EFSA-Q-2022-00114)⁵

The chair provided feedback of the discussion of the protocol and draft opinion presented to the BIOHAZ panel during the plenary of 13-14 July 2022, in which the Panel approved the protocol. The revision of the tasks agreed in the previous meeting was conducted. The chair led the first review of the draft opinion with contributions with some of the sections according to the assessment and sub-assessment questions of the protocol. The comments in the document were also revised and decisions on the clarification of the terms of reference, terminology to be used throughout the opinion and presentation of the data were made.

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting(s)

The 5th WG meeting will take place as a 1.5 days physical meeting on Monday 5 September 2022 pm, and Tuesday 6 September 2022 full day, at the University of Oslo, Oslo (Norway).

² <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-biohaz-wg-applications-alternative-methods-use-or-disposal-animal-products-or-derived-products.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>

Annex I

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, Dr Gabriele Vaccari declared the following interest: he is the principal investigator of a research collaboration agreement between the Istituto Superiore di Sanita (ISS), Rome, and Ecole normal supérieure de Ouargla (Algeria), aimed to investigate the Camel Prion disease for diagnostic and genetic susceptibility issues. The main aims are to establish an accurate diagnosis test for transmissible spongiform encephalopathy in dromedary camels, and to conduct case-control studies to assess the genetic susceptibility of dromedary camels to the disease. It is an agreement not funded by external bodies.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁷, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁷ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE MONITORING OF CWD

(EFSA-Q-2022-00114)

Physical. Parma. 10 June 2022

(Agreed on 17 June 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Giuseppe Ru (chair)
 - Marion Simmons (vice-chair)
 - Michael W. Miller
 - Atle Mysterud
 - Maria Nöremark
 - Gabriele Vaccari
 - Hildegunn Viljugrein

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Maria Francesca Iulietto, Angel Ortiz Peláez
iDATA: Perry Koevoets (morning session)

- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes. A coffee break was added in the afternoon session: 15:00-15:15h.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 11 May 2022²

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 11 May 2022 were agreed by written procedure on 16 May 2022.

4. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Scientific opinion on the monitoring of CWD (EFSA-Q-2022-00114)⁵

Using the template applied by the BIOHAZ team, the entire meeting was devoted to the development of the protocol using the ideas that the working group members proposed in the first and second meetings. A number of assessment and sub-assessment questions were agreed. Suggestions for the approach to answer the questions and the methodologies to be used were also discussed and agreed along the assessment questions. Important assumptions and clarification of the terminology to use in the opinion were also agreed.

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting(s)

The 4th WG meeting will take place as a half-day web-meeting on Monday 18 July 2022, 14:30-18:30h.

² <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-biohaz-wg-applications-alternative-methods-use-or-disposal-animal-products-or-derived-products.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 2nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE MONITORING OF CWD

(EFSA-Q-2022-00114)

Web-conference, 11 May 2022

(Agreed on 18 May 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Giuseppe Ru (chair)
 - Marion Simmons (vice-chair)
 - Michael W. Miller
 - Atle Mysterud
 - Maria Nöremark
 - Michael A. Tranulis
 - Gabriele Vaccari
 - Hildegunn Viljugrein

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Maria Francesca Iulietto, Angel Ortiz Peláez
iDATA: Perry Koevoets, Alexandra Papanikolau

- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes. The chair proposed to start with point 5 "Protocol development" of the agenda and merge point 4 "Review ideas on approaches and methodologies", point 6 "Analyses surveillance data (ToR1): data needs, methods", and point 7 "New knowledge epidemiology (ToR2)" in a new point 5 "Assessment questions for ToR1, ToR2, ToR3 and ToR4".

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Scientific opinion on the monitoring of CWD (EFSA-Q-2022-00114)⁴

The chair suggested to start directly with the development of the protocol using the ideas the working group members have proposed since the previous meeting. Using the template applied by the BIOHAZ team, the chair started by giving an explanation of the purpose of the protocol according to the EFSA guidelines. As an example, the protocol of a previous EFSA output on a similar topic (Scientific report on the analysis of the 2-year compulsory intensified monitoring of atypical scrapie) was used. The working group developed the first four ToRs in terms of assessment and sub-assessment questions. Some evidence needs were identified in order to address the assessment questions related to ToR1.

5. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

6. Next meeting(s)

The calendar of meetings for the rest of the year was agreed, as follows: 4th WG meeting: 18 July ½ day web-conference 14:30-18:30h; 5th WG meeting: 5-6 September. 1.5 days physical. Oslo. 5 Sep pm and 6 Sep full day. 6th WG meeting: 20 October. ½ day web-conference. 14:30-18:30h; 7th WG meeting: 17-18 November. 1 day physical. Oslo. 17 pm and 18 am. 8th WG meeting: not confirmed yet.

The third meeting will take place on Friday 10 June 2022 as a full-day physical meeting 09:00-18:00h, at EFSA headquarters in Parma. If any WG member cannot attend physically, it will be a hybrid meeting with physical presence and MT connection.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS

MINUTES OF THE 1st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE MONITORING OF CWD

(EFSA-Q-2022-00114)

Web-conference, 7 April 2022

(Agreed on 13 April 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Giuseppe Ru (chair)
 - Marion Simmons (vice-chair)
 - Michael W. Miller
 - Atle Mysterud
 - Maria Nöremark
 - Michael A. Tranulis
 - Gabriele Vaccari
 - Hildegunn Viljugrein

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable

- EFSA:
BIOHAW Unit: Maria Francesca Iulietto, Angel Ortiz Peláez, Verena Oswaldi
iDATA: Roxani Aminalragia, Perry Koevoets, Alexandra Papanikolau

- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Scientific opinion on the monitoring of CWD (EFSA-Q-2022-00114)⁴

EFSA provided an introductory presentation on: a) the remit and governance of EFSA and the way the scientific advice is produced; b) administrative and logistical matters, the use of Microsoft Teams as the platform for communications and repository of data and documents during the lifespan of the mandate; c) the work plan, meetings planned and technical and scientific support provided by EFSA; d) uncertainty and protocol development guidance documents to be followed. The chair presented the mandate and commented on each of the terms of reference (ToR). He opened the discussion on the general understanding of the ToR and on the need to clarify with the requestor the scope of the mandate. During a brainstorming session on the approaches, a number of issues were brought up by the members, like the objectives of the genotyping of stored samples, the data and evidence to be used for each ToR, the consideration of the different forms of the disease present in Europe, the potential inclusion of unpublished data; the differences between the proposed surveillance and the implemented programme by the different countries, among others.

5. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

6. Next meeting(s)

The second meeting will be held on Wednesday 11 May 2022, 14:30-18:30h CET, as a half-day web-conference. The third meeting was scheduled for Friday 10 June 2022 as a full-day physical meeting 09:00-18:00h, at EFSA headquarters in Parma.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://open.efsa.europa.eu/questions/EFSA-Q-2022-00114>